Abstract—This study aims at determining and to examining the factors of student selection decision on Nurul Fikri (hereinafter abbreviated NF) tutoring institutions in Paandg City. The sampling was done by accidental sampling totaling 94 people who have chosen NF in Paandg City. Data collection was done by a survey using questionnaire method. Statistical methods chosen were descriptive analysis and explanatory factor analysis (explanatory factor analysis = EFA) by using SPSS version 21. The results showed that the factors affecting the decision of students choose NF were product, price, location, promotions, process, and physical evidence. The test results showed that the model of the factors formed a significant effect of the decision of students in choosing the NF institution.

Keywords—consumer purchasing decision, marketing mix

I. INTRODUCTION

Product purchasing decision is a unique form of consumer behavior influenced by cultural factors and social factors, namely reference groups, families, roles and status, and personal factors including age and life cycle stage, occupation and economic conditions, personality, and self-concept [1]. The source of the consumer purchase decision comes from internal or external factors. The external factors include the socio-cultural environment namely family, informal sources, other non-commercial sources, social class, culture and sub-culture, demographic, social status, and corporate environment especially in the marketing mix activities. The internal factors include motivation, perception, learning, personality, attitude, memory, and emotions [2,3].

Something interesting from a number of studies on consumer purchasing decision is the diversity of results and new findings that increasingly enrich predictor variables that affect consumer purchasing decisions for both goods and services. This indicates that the predictor variables constructed by the researchers experienced rapid development, so that they became more attractive and opened up opportunities for further researchers to conduct research in a different scope. Some researchers have previously found that the factors that influenced consumer purchasing decisions were assessed as reliable predictor variables, namely personality, marketing mix, perceived value, social product attributes, tangible attributes, knowledge, perceptions, attitudes, habits, experiences, information, and virtual communication [4–11].

A study done by [12] found that the value perceived by consumers for purchasing green products and intangible attributes could increase consumers’ willingness to pay in the purchasing decisions. The study also observed that demographic variables, such as gender, age, and income had positive impact on perceived quality that influenced the intention to make a purchase. In addition, another previous study showed that intangible attributes, such as social attributes, brand, and national attributes had an impact on purchase intentions [13–16].

Another study conducted by [5] found that in consumer decision and choice making behavior for shaping food safety, there were a number of predictors that shaped consumer decisions, namely information provision that was knowledge, perception, attitude, preventive behavior, and purchasing habits.

Individual experience and consumer knowledge about products are individual characteristics that have been shown to have an influence on the purchasing process and are predictor variables that are considered strong in determining consumer purchasing decisions in certain product categories [17,18]. Moreover, consumer purchasing decisions are also largely driven by instrumental cognitive processes namely excitement, fun, fantasy, and joy [19]. Individual characteristics also influence their decision-making style, which has proven to be a predictor of behavioral decision making [20,21]. Therefore, the decision-making style is considered as a characteristic of individuals in the decision-making process. Individual characteristics do not necessarily influence consumer decisions if they are not influenced by the reference group as the external factor. Reference groups have been the focus in decades of research on influences of consumer decision processes [22–24].

Internal stimuli and processes are also considered to have a strong influence on consumers in making complex food process choices [25]. Consumers often give choices for factors that have little or no relevance to purchasing decision choices, but ignore things that in fact pose a major threat to their safety [26–28]. Another interesting thing is the element of anxiety or risk perception involved in every consumer decision [29–32].

However, not all researchers find the aforementioned predictor variables had significant effect on consumer purchasing decision. There has been a long debate and differences in findings that lead to a gap between researchers. As stated explicitly by[33], there was no significant relationship between product knowledge and consumer behavior. However, several years later, [18] found that knowledge of online products influenced behavior. This difference was addressed wisely by other researchers who revealed that the difference in results was due to individual
characteristics differences that would lead to differences in making decisions in their purchases. Individuals who were rational and who would not be different in making decisions.

Several other studies including the one conducted by [6], which examined food security in Lebanon stated that consumers actually lacked knowledge of the proper procedures to avoid food borne illnesses [4],[34]–[38]. However, on the other hand, consumer behavior showed the opposite where they were very concerned with food security issues. The difference in the level of the country's economy and access to public information seemed to be the differentiator between the two consumer characters. According to [39], consumer perceptions are also related to human subjectivity, which often deviates from the view of scientific facts and reality. In the end, human subjective perception determines the development of attitudes and preferences for purchasing and willingness to pay [25], [39].

Based on the above-mentioned research findings that indicated a very high diversity of predictor variables that formed consumer purchasing decision and the existence of a gap to carry out further research, the authors were interested in conducting research to further confirm which predictor variables are considered more valid and reliable in making consumer decisions about the products offered. In order to avoid bias and specificity, the authors set consumer purchasing decision of high school students in Paandg City in choosing NF tutoring institution in Paandg City. The observation unit is High School students in Paandg City who attended tutoring program at NF. The selected observation unit was Paandg as a city of Education in West Sumatra. Furthermore, the competition of non-formal education institutions, such as tutoring institutions was quite strict, where NF is one of the tutoring institutions that has special characteristics with attributes of a “plus” mentoring institution with Islamic values.

A. Consumer Purchasing Decision

Consumer behavior theory is very important in understanding consumer purchasing behavior. It is in concordance with [1] who clearly identified the factors that influence consumer behavior, which consists of three main factors, namely culture, social, and personal factors. Cultural and sub-cultural factors include race, ethnicity, nationality, religion, and geography. Social factors consist of reference groups, families, roles, and status. Personal factors consist of age and life cycle stage, work and economic conditions, personality and self-concept, and lifestyle and values. Moreover, [2] and [3] identify two sources that influence consumer decisions in purchasing, namely internal and external sources. The external sources are the socio-cultural environment of the family, informal sources, other non-commercial sources, social class, culture and sub-culture, demographics, social status, and corporate environment especially in the marketing mix activity aspect. The internal sources come from motivation, perception, learning, personality, attitude, memory, and emotions [2],[3].

Many studies on purchasing decisions always tested predictor variables that are almost the same, thus there were identical similarities between one research with another but in a different analysis unit and observation unit. The interesting thing about these studies is the consumer decision predictor variable for the purchase of goods and services that are patterned on the marketing mix elements. As [41] and [42] explained that the marketing mix is a device/tool for marketers of a marketing program that needs to be considered, so that the implementation of the marketing strategy and the determining of the established position can run successfully and it is a factor that can influence a person’s purchasing decisions in terms of company’s marketers.

In this study, a number of factors that influenced the decision of students who have chosen NF in Paandg City as a place for tutoring has been described, so that there were several formed factors, were considered valid as influences in making the decision to choose NF tutoring institution.

The results of previous studies revealed that consumer purchasing decisions were influenced by many factors in different scopes. Research conducted by [42], [43] found that customer personality factors were related to their assessment of marketing mix factors and influenced their purchasing decisions. Furthermore, by knowing people's personality, their lifestyle patterns can be explained; behavior and consumption choices can be predicted, thus personality factor becomes an important factor in determining purchasing decisions.

Research conducted by [5], [14]–[16], [44], found that attributes especially tangible attributes were factors that determine consumer purchasing decisions. The intangible attributes found in the research were social, brand, and country of origin that turned out to be intangible attributes that influence consumer purchasing decisions and developed countries with high economic levels were very concerned about tangible attributes in their decision making. Another factor that was also important, as the findings of [6], [45], was a positive correlation between product information search and purchasing decisions.

Other research by [8], [18], [20], [21] found two other factors that influenced consumer decision making, namely decision-making style and knowledge. Knowledge gained by consumers that comes from existing information and consumer style in making decisions will influence consumer decisions. Consumer perception of perceived risks and values was also an important factor in determining consumer decisions [7], [29]–[32], [46].

The aforesaid studies showed that predictor variables namely personality, tangible attributes, decision making style, knowledge product, information search, perception, and perceived value were predictor variables appropriate to predict consumer purchasing decisions. However, on knowledge variable, the study by [33] explicitly stated that there was no significant relationship of knowledge about products with consumer behavior. Besides, [6] examined food safety in Lebanon and found that consumers actually lacked knowledge of the right procedures to avoid foodborne illness. Moreover, [39] stated that consumer perceptions were also related to human subjectivity, which often deviated from the views of scientific facts and reality; hence consumers were sometimes mistaken in making decisions.

B. Hypotheses

Based on the theoretical and research reviews, the hypotheses proposed in this study are:
• H1: service marketing mix factors (product, price, place, promotion, people, process and physical evidence) are factors that shape and influence student decisions towards NF tutoring institution
• H2: there is a significant difference in the decision-making characteristics of respondents based on gender
• H3: there is a significant difference in the decision-making characteristics of respondents based on majors

Based on the review of theories, research, and hypotheses, the following research model was designed.

Based on the figure of the research model above, there were 34 factors influencing the decision of the students in choosing a tutoring institution. These identified factors were explored to form several determinants of the students’ purchasing decision in choosing NF tutoring institutions in Padang City.

II. METHOD

This study is non-experimental research (survey) with descriptive research design. The sample was chosen using accidental sampling technique, which was performed spontaneously by giving questionnaires to respondents encountered during data collection in the research location. Based on the Slovin formula, the sample size is 94 respondents. The data analysis technique used was descriptive analysis and explanatory factor analysis (EFA) using SPSS version 21. Descriptive analysis was used to describe the profile of respondents, while explanatory factor analysis was used to determine factors that shape consumer decisions in choosing NF tutoring institution in Padang City. The validity test was done using Karl Pearson’s product moment formula with the criteria if $r_{count}$ is larger than $r_{table}$ at alpha 5%. Additionally, the reliability test used was Cronbach alpha with criteria if $r_{count}$ is larger than $r_{table}$ at alpha 5%.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Respondent Profile

Respondents in this study were 94 students who attended tutoring program at NF tutoring institutions Padang City. The results are presented in Table 1.

Based on gender, the respondents were dominated by females totaling 76 people (81%). Based on the origin of the school and the grade level, the majority were grade XII students of high school Padang City. Based on major, there were more Science major students (69%) than Social Science students (31%).

B. Validity and Reliability Tests

The results of the validity test were two items removed from the model, so that were only extracted question items that were truly capable of being used to measure the constructs used. While the reliability test results showed that if $r_{count}$ is larger than $r_{table}$ at alpha 5%, it can be said that the instrument used was quite reliable to measure the variables studied. The results of the validity and reliability tests that were performed to 30 respondents are presented in Table 2.

C. Factor Analysis

It is suggested that there are four important steps in factor analysis, namely appropriateness, factoring and rotation, validation and factor scores. Factor analysis was carried out in four stages, namely: (1) feasible variable assessment stage that was carried out by observing the values of KMO and Barlet’s test where it can be seen that the value was above 0.5 at the significance of 0.001 thus the existing factor was feasible to be forwarded to the factor analysis stage; (2) the factoring and rotation stages that was carried out with the value in communalities and total variance explained where there were 10 feasible components included in the factor analysis; (3) the validation phase that was done by observing the component matrix, where all the factors of the loading factor passed the cut-off value of 0.05, which means that the formed factor was a reduction of the existing sub factor; and (4) the stage of making the score factor by observing the value of the formed loading factor. Table 3 presents the results of factor analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Respondent Character</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Major</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>18 (19%)</td>
<td>76 (81%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed Data (2016)
According to the marketing mix concept for services, namely the marketing mix factor was a factor that was considered good enough as a predictor factor to estimate student decisions to choose NF tutoring institution in Padang City. The results of the test were reinforced by Rsquare value of 27.6%, which means that these factors were considered good enough as a predictor factor to estimate student decisions to choose NF tutoring institution in Padang City, thus the proposed hypothesis 1 namely service marketing mix factors (product, price, place, promotion, people, process and physical evidence) were factors that shaped and influenced student decisions towards NF tutoring institution. In other words, the higher students’ perceptions of these marketing mix factors, mean the more the students’ confidence in their decision to choose NF tutoring institution in Padang City.

This study found that the marketing mix factor formed was not too strong in influencing student decisions in choosing NF tutoring institution in Padang City. It was due to that the respondents were not the sole decision maker in choosing a tutoring institution. Other important factors that influenced student choices were reference groups, information obtained from peers, also motivation and guidance from their parents so as to form a separate image in the students to determine their choices. So, it is expected that future researchers can comprehensively identify more on decision factors of students in choosing tutoring institutions with other models that can explain the phenomena, in order to be tested more accurately.

Table 2 shows that 10 components of the factors that influenced student decisions in choosing NF tutoring institutions in Padang City were formed. Seven factors formed according to the results of subfactor integration were based on the factor loading value are given the following names: component 1 product factor, component 2 price factor, component 3 location factor, component 4 promotion factor, component 7 person factor, component 8 process factor, and component 10 physical factor. Two other components, components 5 and 9 were given the names adjusting to component 10 and component 4 since the sub-factors were almost the same as the sub-factors forming factors 10 and 4, namely promotion factors and physical evidence. While component 6 emphasized on teacher or people competency factors, so that it can be called the person factor. Thus the factors formed were actually seven factors according to the marketing mix concept for services, namely 7P (product, price, place, promotion, people, process, physical evidence).

### TABLE 2. FACTOR ANALYSIS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Loading factor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Product</td>
<td>intellectual learning</td>
<td>.699</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>spiritual learning</td>
<td>.725</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NF is better</td>
<td>.735</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>improved academic performance</td>
<td>.688</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>help in preparing for college</td>
<td>.658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Price</td>
<td>affordable price</td>
<td>.652</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>cheaper price</td>
<td>.637</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the price suits the facilities</td>
<td>.697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the price suits the quality</td>
<td>.686</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>location is easy to reach</td>
<td>.762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>transportation is easy near the town center</td>
<td>.842</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.766</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Promotion</td>
<td>brochure</td>
<td>.852</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>interesting brochure</td>
<td>.649</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>discount available</td>
<td>.686</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>refund guarantee</td>
<td>.415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>School promotion</td>
<td>school promotion the teachers are competent in teaching</td>
<td>.809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the staff gives good service</td>
<td>.113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>People</td>
<td>the staff gives good service</td>
<td>.809</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>the teachers teach using good method</td>
<td>.227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Process</td>
<td>quick administrative process</td>
<td>.405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>easy administrative process</td>
<td>.606</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>understandable teaching and learning process</td>
<td>.725</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>interesting teaching and learning process</td>
<td>.677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Clear advertisement board</td>
<td>Clear advertisement board</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Physical evidence</td>
<td>good building</td>
<td>.658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>comfortable classroom</td>
<td>.647</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>complete facilities</td>
<td>.704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>clean musppa (praying room)</td>
<td>.642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Wi-Fi available</td>
<td>.658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>vast parking area</td>
<td>.740</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed Data (2016)

D. Test results of hypothesis 1: Service marketing mix factors (product, price, place, promotion, people, process and physical evidence) are factors that shape and influence student decisions towards NF tutoring institution

Based on the results of hypothesis testing in the ANOVA Model Summary in Table 4 and 5, the obtained F table value was 3.166 with a significance of 0.002, which indicated that the factors formed from the results of factor analysis namely product, price, place, promotion, people, process, and physical evidence had a significant effect on student decisions in choosing NF tutoring institution in Padang City. The results of the test were reinforced by Rsquare value of 27.6%, which means that these factors were considered good enough as a predictor factor to estimate student decisions to choose NF tutoring institution in Padang City, thus the proposed hypothesis 1 namely service marketing mix factors (product, price, place, promotion, people, process and physical evidence) were factors that shaped and influenced student decisions towards NF tutoring institution. In other words, the higher students’ perceptions of these marketing mix factors, mean the more the students’ confidence in their decision to choose NF tutoring institution Padang City.

The results of this study indicated consistency with theories and studies that examined consumer purchasing decisions by previous researchers [5]–[11], [46]. A firmer statement was given by [1], [40], [41], stating that the marketing mix factor was a factor that was considered to be good enough to accurately predict consumer purchasing decisions.

This study found that the marketing mix factor formed was not too strong in influencing student decisions in choosing NF tutoring institution in Padang City. It was due to that the respondents were not the sole decision maker in choosing a tutoring institution. Other important factors that influenced student choices were reference groups, information obtained from peers, also motivation and guidance from their parents so as to form a separate image in the students to determine their choices. So, it is expected that future researchers can comprehensively identify more on decision factors of students in choosing tutoring institutions with other models that can explain the phenomena, in order to be tested more accurately.

### TABLE 3. MODEL SUMMARY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>R</th>
<th>R Square</th>
<th>Adjusted R Square</th>
<th>Std. Error of the Estimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.525*</td>
<td>.276</td>
<td>.189</td>
<td>.66796</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), REGR factor score 10 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 9 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 8 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 7 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 6 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 5 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 4 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 3 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 2 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 1 for analysis 1

### TABLE 4. ANOVA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Mean Square</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>14.128</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1.413</td>
<td>3.166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>57.032</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>.446</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>51.160</td>
<td>93</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Dependent Variable: 1
b. Predictors: (Constant), REGR factor score 10 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 9 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 8 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 7 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 6 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 5 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 4 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 3 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 2 for analysis 1, REGR factor score 1 for analysis 1
Another finding of this study was the existence of a special factor that was considered by the students in choosing NF institution in Padang City. This particular factor was the competence of the teacher, and the students had their own considerations with their choices, namely the qualifications of teachers who had to be S-1 and the quality of the teachers. These two sub-factors were essentially closer to the factor of people, with the specificity of teacher competence. Therefore, the special factor that was considered by the students in teacher competence was mainly the quality of teaching and their educational qualifications.

E. Test results of hypothesis 2: There is a significant difference in the decision-making characteristics of respondents based on gender.

Based on the results independent sample test, the value of Levene's Test for Equality of Variances was 0.492 with sig. 0.485, meaning that it was above 0.05. In other words, gender differences had a significant effect on students' decision to choose NF tutoring institution in Padang City. The group statistics table shows that there were more female students than the male students who chose NF tutoring institution. The result explains that NF tutoring institution was preferred more by female students than by male students. This finding indicated that NF tutoring institution in Padang City was more in demand by female students than by male students, and this was because the institution offered attributes that display more Islamic nuances that are full of rules that limit the movement of male students in expressing themselves such as rules about smoking, rules that encourage polite outfit, and other rules. In responding to the rules, female students were considered to be more compliant and able to adapt easily to the rules than the male students were.

F. Test results of hypothesis 3: There is a significant difference in the decision making characteristics of respondents based on major.

Based on the independent sample test, the obtained value of Levene's Test for Equality of Variances was 1.980 with sig. 0.163, meaning that it was above 0.05. In other words, the difference in major had a significant effect on students' decision to choose NF tutoring institution in Padang City. The table of group statistics shows that there were more students of science major than those who are majoring in social studies. This indicated that NF tutoring institutions were more in demand by science major students in high school. The larger number of science major students choosing NF tutoring institution in Padang City was interesting, since in practice the tutoring institution provided a balanced portion of science and social studies classes. The NF institute Padang City, which was famous for its competent instructors especially in the fields of Mathematics and Physics, had become a special attraction for students who were choosing a tutoring institution.

IV. CONCLUSIONS

A. Conclusions

Based on the construct of the model tested in this study, the behavior of students in making the decision to choose NF tutoring institution in Padang City was formed by factors of product, price, location, promotion, process, people, and physical evidence. Additional factors, specifically, were teacher competency with consideration of the quality and educational qualifications. The results of the model testing showed that the formed factors had a significant effect on the decision of the student to choose the NF institution, yet with a not-too-strong contribution. This indicated that the marketing mix factor in student decision in choosing NF had its own uniqueness since the students who were respondents in this study were not the main determinants in decision making and they were very dependent on the brand image of each institution, the information they received from peers, and their parents' support. This study also found that differences in gender and major in high school had significant effects on student decisions in choosing NF tutoring institution. Female students who were easily manageable and easily adapt to the environment were more receptive to change than male students. Moreover, students of science major had a special preference for a tutoring institution of higher quality especially in terms of the teacher.

B. Implications

Theoretically, the implication of this study is to contribute to studies on the decisions of consumers to choose service products, specifically for school students or university students. There is an inherent specialty when students decide on limited choices, because they are tied to their status as students, which means they have not had their own income yet and are considered not yet capable in deciding on certain choices so that they are highly dependent on those who directly interact intensively with them such as peers, parents, and information received. Therefore, it is recommended that future researchers consider factors of parental support, and product information as other factors considered in the model.

Tutoring institutions, especially, should pay attention to and strive to build the excellence of their institutions so that they become a brand image for the consumers in making a choice such as quality of the teacher, the learning process, the services, and other supporting facilities. In addition, the approach with parents is important to convince students to choose a tutoring institution because it is acknowledged that parents are the closest to the students and have a significant role in the decision of students in choosing a tutoring institution.

C. Limitations of the Research

Firstly, the sample chosen were students, thus it is not possible for them to make decisions independently. Therefore, the formed marketing mix factor that was not strong as a predictor variable in the students’ decision in choosing a tutoring institution. More in-depth study of student decisions is needed in determining their choice of study.

Secondly, this study was carried out only in one tutoring institution, while in Padang City there were several tutoring institutions with different products compared to NF.
Therefore, it is important to expand the location of the study by involving more observation units of all students, like high school, vocational high school and MA in Padang city.

REFERENCES