The Effect of Silent Short Movie on EFL Writing Achievement of Vocational High School Students

Rahmani Ayu Rinda Kartika¹, Susilo², Muhammad Natsir³
¹,²,³ Department of English Education, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Mulawarman University, Indonesia
rahmani@gmail.com, ollysus@gmail.com, m.natsir@gmail.com

Abstract—The purpose of the study was to investigate whether or not there is a significant effect of silent short movie on EFL writing achievement of the vocational high school students. This study was quasi-experimental using a nonrandomized control group, pretest-posttest design. There were 61 students who were selected randomly from the 10 classes of tenth-graders of the 6th State Vocational School in Samarinda. The instruments used in the study was writing test. The result revealed that the vocational high school tenth grade students who were taught by silent short movie (M = 8.01, SD = .32) got significantly different achievement in EFL writing than did the vocational high school tenth grade students who were not taught by silent short, t(58) = -2.22, p = .030. This result suggests that the writing aspects, which the students significantly outperformed, were text organization, sentence formation, grammar, vocabulary, mechanics, and tidiness.

Keywords—silent movie; EFL writing; vocational high school; writing achievement

I. INTRODUCTION

One of the teaching media which can be dependent on the rapid development of technology is movie. Therefore, movie is always interesting to be used as media in teaching. Movies have been scientifically proved effective to be used in the process of EFL teaching. In the context of EFL teaching in Indonesia high schools, some research findings confirmed that better achievement had been gained by teaching with using movies, e.g. better writing assignment of the students after having silent animated movie [1]; animation movies giving contribution to the increase of teaching writing narrative text for the tenth grade students of Senior High School [2], and effective writing skills of the students after they were given animation film in teaching [3].

In the context of EFL settings, for instance in Asia, feature films have also been used effectively in teaching. Research conducted by [4] confirmed that films can function both as stimulator of learners’ cognitive learning and as effective instructional tool. The power of using film has also been scientifically proved by [5] who found that feature films are playing important role in allowing English teachers to make teaching points clear and directly to a specific scene; and thus further can lead learners to transfer life from movies to their owns so that it gives them opportunities optimize their linguistic skills. In addition, many researchers and learners believed that films can not only serve as a type of teaching tool which helps language learning, but also provides learners’ authentic language input or materials so that they can learn and absorb real-life language through it [6-11].

Silent short movie is now becoming popular to use in EFL teaching since it can triggers the learners to be more independent in learning; this happens because the silent short movie can transmit a meaning through visual imagery, consequently it is not immediate for the learners to get the meaning of the story. Further, the learners need times to dig and seek the messages, which in turns helps them promote the development of their linguistic skills [12]. Not only those great aspects of writing that can be acquired in silent movie, in the next research, [13] study found this strategy grabbed the attention of the students that made the students improved their writing score. In short, silent movie relies on the power of vivid, interactive visual imagery to depict personal struggles, interpersonal interactions, and societal problems. This is a report of research aimed at investigating whether or not there is a significant effect of silent short movie on EFL writing achievement of the vocational high school students. The research question is “is there any significant effect of silent short movie on EFL writing achievement of the tenth grade students of State Vocational High School 6 Samarinda, Indonesia?”.

II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

A. EFL Writing and How to Effectively Teach It

As it is stated by [14] “Writing as a form of problem solving in which the writer is faced with two main tasks. First is generating ideas and the second is composing the ideas into a written text that can deliver the messages from author to reader”, EFL Writing is one of skills in English that is popular to express the idea, feeling or to connect the people into the creation culture, time, and space. English teacher has many works to make their students become a freedom writer who still can deliver their ideas or their imagination into a master piece that is called writing. To produce a good writing, then the teacher needs a writing rubric to restrain the students’ writing [15].

Thinking writing as an opportunity for communication seems to be the better assumption that a learner writer should firstly have when she/he starts learning writing in EFL. By having such an assumption, the learner writer can develop her/his writing skill independently. In this case, students need adequate examples of good manuscripts as the models to stimulate them to write. By having such models, they can
observe and analyze the idea organization, content, or diction made in the manuscripts of the models. Observing and recognizing many different successful manuscripts written by experienced writers seems promising as one of the solutions to overcome the students’ difficulties to start writing and eventually get used to write. [16] believed that this way as the important strategies to be independent writers. Therefore, by doing such a way, learner writers might be led to, firstly, emulate and adopt the models’ patterns and processes; secondly, have self-monitoring strategy which is very important for them for the sake of their learning new strategies; and finally, self-regulate in adapting to changed tasks and audiences are needed. In a nutshell, good examples of successful writing manuscripts are needed to be exposed to the students in order that they can start their writing action in their initial effort. On the basis of the self-directive process suggested by [16, 17], it is now important to know how learners become independent writers. There are four steps for learners to self-regulate writing: 1) They have to observe and recognize success in other writers’ performance; 2) They have to emulate and adopt the models’ patterns; 3) They have to self-monitor while learning new strategies until they are automatic; 4) Finally, they have to self-regulate in adapting to changed tasks and audiences.

Good examples of successful manuscripts can not only be displayed by the traditional way such as being explained by the teachers or being visually expressed in the class board, but however, can also be displayed animatedly by using films. According to [18], film is evidently proved advantageous for teaching foreign language in four reasons: 1) using movie as a medium of learning English is they will not be taught only by hearing the language they also will be taught by the visualization. It allows the students to observe how intonation can match facial expression; 2) from a movie, students can learn anything beyond their classroom, i.e. cross-cultural awareness; 3) after the students are appealed to the movie in teaching and learning process, they will feel enjoy and will create a good memory that will be submitted into their brain forever. This can make them not only remember the movie but they will have a curiosity of making the movie; and 4) movie can trigger the increase of students’ motivation [18].

B. Maintaining the Integrity of the Specifications

The template is used to format your paper and style the text. All margins, column widths, line spaces, and text fonts are prescribed; please do not alter them. You may note peculiarities. For example, the head margin in this template measures proportionately more than is customary. This measurement and others are deliberate, using specifications that anticipate your paper as one part of the entire proceedings, and not as an independent document. Please do not revise any of the current designations.

C. Feature Film and Teaching EFL writing

Following the rapid development of technology, the teachers are also demanded to teach their students by using computer or any other sophisticated media. In using the technology, teachers need to be creative. Therefore, technology can be taken as an advantage to the creative teacher who wants to explore more about teaching strategy that can take the students into the new world of learning process that can make them feel more enjoy and achieve a good improvement in learning. It in line with what [19] idea stating that to make the lesson more fun is needed as a teaching English technique to the beginner.

Movie is one of million ways that can create the enjoy feeling in students’ mind and can achieve the desire of the teacher to make the students achieve a good improvement in learning. And as [20] said that writing also needs to be conceptual and judgment then movie is really matched to become a medium that makes the students go directly see and feel what is going on because movie represents a real world and it makes them easier to spill out all their ideas to the paper. Furthermore, one of the advantages of using video in EFL teaching is that real-life circumstances can be addressed to help students easily digest the teaching content. In addition to both being functioned as stimulating the cognitive learning and being used effectively as an instructional tool, feature films also allow teachers make teaching points clear and directly to a specific scene, increase students’ learning interest, motivation, and engagement, and even help the students gain knowledge of how English is used for different functions [4-7, 10, 21].

However, because contemporary movie is too general and out-of-date to be taken as a medium of English learning, then a silent short movie is the answer. According to [12], the silent short movie transmits a meaning through visual imagery and it makes the students can’t get the meaning of the story immediately and clearly. The students have to seek and dig deeper. This visual image technique is supported by an interdisciplinary body of research as a useful textual mode for developing verbal language skill. By providing students with raw material for the creative use of language, as well as for the analysis and interpretation of interdisciplinary issues, silent movie can be a useful tool for promoting the development of verbal language skills. Because if there is no spoken dialogue in the movie, it requires the students to be more careful and to be more aware of metalinguistic cues. At this moment, the critical thinking in students’ mind is tested [12].

Not only the great aspect of writing that can be acquired in silent movie, in the next research by [22], it was found this strategy grabbed the attention of the students that made the students improved their writing score. Silent movie relies on the power of vivid, interactive visual imagery to depict personal struggles, interpersonal interactions, and societal problems. The images of the movie present are filled with meaningful content to activate students’ imagination and engage their interest. In addition, music, used to highlight key points in the film and evoke emotional response from the audience, reinforces the sensory experience, while short titles, interspersed throughout the visual narrative, describe the upcoming action.

III. PREVIOUS STUDIES

A struggle in writing, makes a teacher has to twist his/her brain to find a brand new way that creates an enjoy environment in learning so the students can absorb the lesson of writing very well and can produce a powerful writing that is
sharper than a knife. Therefore, a teacher needs a medium that can motivate the students to learn. Based on this reasons, many researchers have conducted a scientific writing research. [23] claimed that to deliver a message of the story is greater by the visual and audio effects of movies than printed or spoken words. He stated that movies offered both cognitive and affective experiences because movies could provoke good discussions, assessments of one's values, and assessments of a self if the scenes had strong emotional content.

In addition, [2] found that animation movies gave contribution in teaching writing narrative text to the tenth grade students of Senior High School. It could be seen from the score from pre-test to post-test. Although the score in pre-test, both of experimental group and control group was slightly same but their scores in post-test was really different. The very slight difference between the two groups indicated that the two groups were homogeneous. But after receiving different treatment, the score of experimental group showed an amazing ascension. The post-test mean score of the experimental group was higher than the mean score of the control group. The significant difference between two groups showed that the use of animation movies in teaching narrative text was effective.

The same research also conducted by [3]. She used t-test in order to check whether the use of silent animation film in writing narrative text is effective. The result of her research showed that using silent animation film medium was effective to improve students’ writing skill. It could be proved by the pre-test to post-test mean of the students’ writing skill of the class which was not taught with silent animation film (50.36 to 57.95). The students’ writing skill of the class which was taught by silent animation film showed significant improvement (50.45 to 67.95). From the t-test result, it could be seen that the class which was taught by animation film medium got higher score (11.2) than the class which was not taught by animation film medium (5.88). It indicated that by using silent animation film medium, the students could improve their writing skill effectively.

Moreover [1] found in her experimental research, students that experienced silent animated movie like Bernard bear had better score in their writing assignment so it could be concluded that silent movie had better effect for students’ writing achievement. The experimental group score was 80,65 and it was higher than control group that was only 70,94. And from these score, she counted the t-observed was 4,75 and had a result that t-observed was bigger than t-table that was only 1,678.

There were various previous researches that are proved by using silent movie giving better effect in teaching, i.e. [2] research focusing on writing type such as descriptive text, [3] research investigating the effectiveness of using animation film as the medium in writing narrative text, and [1] findings which found Bernard Bear cartoon movies as media in writing narrative text.

IV. METHOD

A. Design

This study was quasi-experimental using a nonrandomized control group, pretest-posttest design. The researcher chosen this design because this study did not permit random assignment of subjects to the experimental and control groups due to a typical school situation, schedules which cannot be disrupted nor classes reorganized to accommodate a research study. The design was as it is in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GROUP</th>
<th>PRETEST</th>
<th>INDEPENDENT VARIABLE</th>
<th>POSTTEST</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Y1</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Y2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Y1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sampling technique of this study was cluster random purposive sampling because a school principal did not permit the researchers to draw a random sample of students for a study but only permit use of certain classes. The population of the study was all the tenth-graders of the 6th State Vocational School in Samarinda (SMK Negeri 6 Samarinda). There were 61 students used as samples, which were taken from two classes. The determination of control group and experimental group are based on the criteria that have been made by the researchers according to the teacher’s suggestion and the students’ average scores to see the effect more significantly. The two classes are chosen because their average scores are the two of the bottom from 10 classes in SMK Negeri 6 Samarinda. Control group is the group that contains students that have higher average score while Experimental group is the group that contains students that have lower average score.

The data were collected from the scores from pre-test and post-test. In the pre-test, the students were only given written text explanation about the story. It was aimed to know their primary proficiency in writing. In the meantime, th post-test was given after the students have experienced the pre-test (for control group) and the experimental group has experienced the treatment (silent movie teaching style). The post-test is implemented in the last meeting of the research.
B. Instrument

The instrument used in the study was achievement writing test. The achievement writing test was used to measure what the students have learned in the subject individually. Furthermore, there were pre-test and post-test. Those tests were the researcher-made test that were already validated using content-validity and to ensure the reliability, the researcher used inter-rater reliability. In the process of assessing the results of the test, writing rubric helped the researchers find out whether the silent short movie has effect or not through the students’ writing score in pre-test and post-test. There were six components of scoring writing standard used in the study: 1) text organization, 2) sentence formation, 3) Grammar, 4) vocabulary, 5) mechanics, and 5) tidiness (taken from MGMP – see appendix).

C. Research Procedure

After the text edit has been completed, the paper is ready for the template. Duplicate the template file by using the Save As command, and use the naming convention prescribed by your conference for the name of your paper. In this newly created file, highlight all of the contents and import your prepared text file. You are now ready to style your paper; use the scroll down window on the left of the MS Word Formatting toolbar.

a. Preparation

The researchers prepared all the needs of this study which were lesson plan, the permission to conduct the study and determine the schedule of the study.

b. Doing Pre-test

The researchers did a conventional teaching writing style, which asked the students to read a written text about a story entitled Cinderella. After that the students were asked to do the essay that was given by the researchers about the story that has been already read.

c. Treatment

On the second week until sixth week, the students who only received conventional teaching writing style (control group) did the same thing as they did in the pre-test. They were given just the written text about the story in the silent short movie to read. However, for experimental group, the researchers showed them the silent short movie.

d. Post-test

After they have experienced the treatment, the researchers asked the students to write essay. The students were asked to write an essay about “The Present” story that has been given in the treatment. All these procedures are summed up into the Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Week 1</th>
<th>Week 2 – Week 7</th>
<th>Week 8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>-Doing pre-test</td>
<td>No Treatment (The present written text only)</td>
<td>Post-test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>-Doing pre-test</td>
<td>Treatment (The Present in silent movie) teaching</td>
<td>Post-test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researchers</td>
<td>Giving explanation about narrative text generally then give pre-test</td>
<td>Giving post-test to students and scoring the post-test.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

D. Data Analysis Technique

To test the hypotheses, the researchers used inferential statistics, i.e. t-test. It was used as the test of significance between students’ scores before they experienced the treatment and after they received the treatment. Prior to the t-test, normality test and homogeneity test were conducted. SPSS program was used to provide descriptive, inferential statistics and graphical presentations.

V. FINDINGS

A. Pre-test

An essay writing assignment was given to the students as a pre-test. After the pre-test had been conducted, the researcher asked inter-rater 1 and inter-rater 2 to score writing assignment separately but still using the same rubric in order to have the same criteria in scoring. From the pre-test it was found the picture of comparison between scores of experimental and control groups (see Figure 2).

![Fig. 2. The Pre-test Scores of the experimental and control groups](image-url)

Table 3 shows descriptive statistics for experimental and control groups’ pre-test scores. The result shows that the scores of the pre-test in control group ($M = 7.57$, $SD = 0.238$) was...
slightly higher than experimental group \((M = 7.52, SD = 0.288)\).

### Table III. Descriptive Statistics for Experimental and Control Groups After Pre-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GROUP</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Std. Error Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 = Control Group</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>7.5720</td>
<td>.23759</td>
<td>.04338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 = Experimental Group</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>7.5223</td>
<td>.28826</td>
<td>.05263</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * \( p > 0.05 \)

In order to analyze whether those two groups were normally distributed, those data were analyzed by using statistical formula, Shapiro Wilk, to prove the normality. As showed in table 4 and figure 3, the data from both groups were normally distributed since the scores were not bias and none of the score was out of the box.

### Table IV. Data Normality in Pre-test Scores

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>( P )</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>0.628</td>
<td>( p &gt; 0.05 = ) Normally distributed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>0.156</td>
<td>( p &gt; 0.05 = ) Normally Distributed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table V. Descriptive Statistics for Experimental and Control Groups After Post-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GROUP</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Std. Error Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 = Control Group</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>7.85</td>
<td>.266</td>
<td>.04338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 = Experimental Group</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>8.01</td>
<td>.320</td>
<td>.05263</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * \( p > 0.05 \)

Table 6 and Figure 7 show the result of Shapiro Wilk, telling that the normality of the post-test scores are normally distributed \((p > 0.05)\).

### B. Post-test

After the treatment was given to the experimental group; while the control group only got the conventional teaching, then the researcher conducted the post-test. Figure 6 shows the results of post-test which describes the comparison of both groups.

![Fig. 5. Post-test Scores of the experimental and control groups](image)

Furthermore, table 5 shows the descriptive statistics for both groups (control groups: \( M = 7.85, SD = 0.43 \); while experimental group: \( M = 8.01, SD = 0.52 \)).

### Table VI. Data Normality in Post-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>( P )</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>0.331</td>
<td>( p &gt; 0.05 = ) Normally distributed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental Group</td>
<td>0.549</td>
<td>( p &gt; 0.05 = ) Normally distributed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Fig. 6. Normal Q-Q Plots in Post-test](image)


C. Hypothesis testing

The t-test was conducted to see whether the experimental group was significantly different from the control group in achieving EFL writing. The result showed that the vocational high school tenth grade students who were taught by silent short movie (M = 8.01, SD = .32) got significantly different achievement in EFL writing than the vocational high school tenth grade students who were not taught by silent short, t (58) = -2.22, p = .030 (see Figure 8).

![Figure 7.](image)

**Fig. 7.** Independent sample t-test for homogeneity on Post-test.

VI. DISCUSSION

The present study investigated whether or not using silent short movie as media in teaching gives significant effect on the tenth grade vocational school students’ achievement on writing narrative. The findings showed the students who experienced learning using silent short movie significantly outperformed the writing narrative achievement. This result suggests that the writing aspects which the students significantly outperformed were text organization, sentence formation, grammar, vocabulary, mechanics, and tidiness. In terms of text organization, for instance, the learners feel enjoy put all their ideas when they are writing narrative text. This confirms what Heaton (1975) stated that movie represents a real world, which makes the learners easier to spill out all their ideas on paper. Furthermore, that another outperformed aspect was sentence formation suggest how learners can struggle the strategy to write in narrative text. This is confirmed previously by [22] study.

There were various researches that were previously conducted proved the tenet that using silent movie gives better effect in teaching, i.e. [23] study (2003) claiming that to deliver a message of the story is greater by the visual and audio effects of movies than printed or spoken words, [2] (2011) research focusing on writing type such as descriptive text, [3] (2014) research investigating the effectiveness of using animation film as the medium in writing narrative text, and [1] (2012) findings which found Bernard Bear cartoon movies as media in writing narrative text.

VII. CONCLUSION

It was found out that mean score between pre-test until post-test had a significant difference because it could be seen from the increased of students’ mean score. Furthermore, the students that were in experimental group had higher increased than control group. The researcher used t-test formula to examine the data. The result of the calculation indicated that p value was lower than the level of significant (α = 0.05). From this calculation, it could be concluded that the alternative hypothesis was accepted. It meant that using silent short movie gave effect towards the students’ achievement in writing narrative text.

Based on the findings of the study that has proven that silent short movie gave significant effect towards the students’ achievement in writing narrative, three pedagogical implications are emphasized. First, it is advisable to the teacher to use silent short movie in teaching writing. Second, students’ interested can be improved by giving silent short movie to make them create their imagination before they start to write and the last is silent short movie can build the interaction between students to students in a good discussion or students to the teacher.

**APPENDIX 1. WRITING RUBRIC ASSESSMENT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Criteria to be assessed</th>
<th>Low Performance</th>
<th>Good Performance</th>
<th>Very Good Performance</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Text Organization</td>
<td>Doesn’t use the correct text organization of describing text</td>
<td>Use the correct text organization but has not elaborated the idea</td>
<td>Use the correct text organization and with elaborated idea</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Sentence formation</td>
<td>Use simple sentences</td>
<td>Begins to vary simple sentences and compound sentences</td>
<td>Use simple sentences, compound sentences and complex sentences correctly</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Grammar</td>
<td>Too many mistakes</td>
<td>6 until 10 mistakes</td>
<td>Under 5 mistakes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Vocabulary</td>
<td>Basic Vocabulary, less precise</td>
<td>Developed vocabulary</td>
<td>Purposefully chosen vocabulary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Mechanic</td>
<td>Some errors with spelling and punctuation</td>
<td>Mostly effective use of mechanics; errors do not detract from meaning</td>
<td>Effective use of capitalization, punctuation, and spelling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Tidiness and deadline</td>
<td>Write awkwardly, Unreadable, contain less than 50 words</td>
<td>Write quite neatly, quite clear font, contain 50 – 100 words</td>
<td>Write neatly, clear font, contain more than 100 words</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Final score = total score : 6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Adopted from MGMP Seminar (MGMP - Musyawarah Guru Mata Pelajaran is the academic formal meeting for high school teachers of certain subject matter in Indonesia) held on SMA 2 Samarinda, Saturday October, 19th 2013

**REFERENCES**


[2] R. Candra, "The Effectiveness of Using Animation Movies as a Medium to Improve The Students’ Writing Skill of Narrative Text (A Case of Tenth Grade Students of SMA Negeri 1 Wanadadi in the Academic Year of 2010/2011)," English Department Faculty of Languages and Arts Semarang State University, 2011.

[3] D. Yatimah, "The Effectiveness of Using Animation Film As The Medium in Writing Narrative Text. An Experimental Study In The Second Grade Students of SMP Negeri 3 Salatiga in the Academic Year..."


J. E. Katchen, "Teaching a receptive skill and speaking course with DVD films: Can it be done?," in Lingua Tsing Hua, ed, 2003, pp. 221-236.


E. Yeh, "Teaching Culture and Language through the Multiple Intelligences Film Teaching Model in the ESL/EFL Classroom," The Journal of Effective Teaching, vol. 63., 2014.