

## ***A Discourse Towards Indonesian White Revolution in the Perspective of Development***

***M. Ali Mauludin, Viani Puspita Sari***

Laboratory of Sociology and Extension

FAPET Padjadjaran University

Bandung, Indonesia

[mali.mauludin@unpad.ac.id](mailto:mali.mauludin@unpad.ac.id)

**Abstract**—Globalization, and regionalization are overtaking the standard unit of development, the nation. International institutions and market forces are over- taking the role of the state as the conventional agent of development. The development process has been prone to merely involve particular parties who possess power and knowledge. However, development of a nation is directed to all people, not a segmented one. One of development in Indonesia that interestingly needs more attention is the development of dairy farming. Even though it was not really large, but it has existed and internalized in some communities across the archipelago. Recently, the discourse of Indonesian White Revolution – redevelopment of the dairy farming sector was launched in the Province of Jakarta and harvesting many arguments, contained pros and cons. This article discusses a discourse towards Indonesian White Revolution by using the perspectives of development particularly the interdisciplinary bridging approaches. The result suggests that Indonesian White Revolution can possibly implement with the main support from the government, and endorsement of cooperative, dairy farming institution and the dairy farmer communities.

**Keywords:** *White Revolution; Development; Discourse; Globalization; Dairy Farming*

### **INTRODUCTION**

White revolution is referred to operation flood. This was a rural development program that began in the 1970s in India. This was initiated by the National Dairy Development Board of India. The key feature of the white revolution was that it enabled India to emerge as the largest producer of milk in the entire world. The very name white revolution is associated with it because the program relates to dairy products mostly on milk.<sup>1</sup>

The objective of the program was to assist rural dairy farmer to develop as it created a grid where the farmers and consumers from across the world were connected directly. This was extremely advantageous to the farmers as they were provided with a better price for their products. Notwithstanding, aside from India, Indonesia has its own version of white revolution.

As an agrarian country with fourth biggest world population, Indonesia should be able to realize its self-sufficiency and food security. Revolution of animal husbandry 2020 as predicted by Delgado, et.al. (1998) will take place in developing countries seem to turn to be

such threat as Indonesia accounted for one of the countries fall into food trap of many developed countries. This article will discuss the future of Indonesian white revolution discourse regarded through development perspective.

### **THEORETICAL OVERVIEW**

#### ***A. Perspective on development***

Development means making a better life for everyone. In the present context a highly uneven world, a better life for most people means, essentially meeting basic needs: sufficient food to maintain good health; a safe, healthy place in which to live; affordable services available to everyone; and being treated with dignity and respect.<sup>2</sup>

Development understood as a better life is a powerful emotive ideal because it appeals to the best in people. What might be called the discourse of development (the system of a statement made about development) has the power to move people, to affect and change us forever. Hence, development can be used for many different political purposes, including some

<sup>1</sup> Bruce A. Scholten, 2010, *India's white revolution: operation flood, food aid and development*, London, New York: IB Tauris Publishers

<sup>2</sup> Richard Peet and Elaine Hartwick, *Theories of development: contentions, arguments, alternatives*, second edition, 2009, New York, London: The Guilford Press p. 1

or perhaps most, that conflict with it essentially egalitarian ethic (a better life for all).<sup>3</sup>

The first two alternatives in defining the problem of development look at the less developed country primarily in terms of its own internal structures. A growing number of analysts, however particularly from developing countries, prefer a definition of the problem which is more historical in its emphasis upon the evolving relationships between developed and developing countries. They see the focus of the problem not located principally within the developing world. For this group of development analysts, at issue is not so much the quantity of economic growth (according to the first alternative), or even the quantity of social growth (according to the second alternative), but the quality of the process by which the growth is achieved.<sup>4</sup>

Economic and social development is important. But the key question to be asked according to the third alternative, is: who is controlling the development? To apply Paulo Freire's terminology of the educational process to the international economic process, are the country's objects of development – at someone else's hands, or are they subjects of development – in control of their own destiny? The answer to this basic question gives rise to the theories of dependency and of underdevelopment.

Dependency means that the major decisions which affect socioeconomic progress within less developed areas – decisions, for example, about commodity prices, investment patterns, monetary relationships – are made by individuals and institutions outside those countries. It is a situation in which the economy of certain countries is conditioned by the development and expansion of another economy to which the former is subjected. The concept of dependence permits us to see the internal situation of this countries as part of world economy.<sup>5</sup>

Underdevelopment is seen as the flipside of the coin of development. It refers to the process whereby a country, characterized by subsistence agriculture and domestic production, progressively becomes integrated as a dependency into the world market through

patterns of trade and/or investment. The production of that country thus becomes geared primarily to the demands of the world market, in particular the demands dictated by the industrialized nations, with a consequent lack of integration within the country between the various parts of its own domestic economy.

These theories of dependency and underdevelopment have been sketched in studies by Celso Furtado, Andre Gunder Frank, Theotonio Dos Santos, Fernando Henrique Cardoso and others. All of them take seriously the colonial relationship which has historically marked the growth of the countries of Latin America, Africa and Asia. They argue that outside of an explicit recognition of the consequences of that relationship no accurate understanding of the present situation of these countries is possible. For example, Furtado suggests three historical stages in the process of underdevelopment (See in particular Stewart and Streeten op.cit), which can be summarized as follows:

1. Comparative advantages – During the period following the industrial revolution when the system of the international division of labor was being created and a world economy was being structured, the industrialized countries by and large specialized in activities marked by a high degree of widespread technical progress. In other countries, however, domestic and international investment was either in sectors with minimum technology in the productive process (e.g., agricultural plantations oriented toward cash crops) or in sectors wherein technical progress was isolated (e.g., in the enclaves controlled from outside which operated the mineral extractive industries). In both instances there was little or no technological advance throughout the nation and the income benefits went mainly to a tiny minority. What resulted was the creating of a primary commodity exporting economy.
2. Import submission – The formation of a small privilege social group within the underdeveloped nation gives rise to the necessity of importing numerous goods to meet the patterns of consumption which this group has adopted in imitation of the rich

<sup>3</sup>idem

<sup>4</sup> Frances Stewart and Paul Streeten, "Conflict between output and employment objectives in developing countries" in Oxford Economic Papers, July 1971 p.161.

<sup>5</sup> Peter J. A. Henriot, Development alternatives: problems, strategies and values in Michael P. Todaro, 1983, *the struggle for economic development, readings in problems and policies*, New York and London: Longman pp.30-31)

nations. But the poor balance of payments and restrictive trade policies then, in turn, give rise to local manufacture of the same goods previously imported for consumption. Thus the production of consumer goods becomes strongly skewed toward the needs of the rich minority, income distribution patterns are affected because of the needs for heavy capital accumulation, and there evolves a dependency on imports for the means of production (technology, parts, etc.). in this way the ability of certain rich countries to control technical progress and to impose consumption patterns becomes the decisive factor in structuring the productive apparatus of other countries – those which have become dependent.

3. Multinational corporations – The rise of the multinational corporation (MNC) has become the most important phenomenon in the international economic order, as internal transactions of MNCs have replaced ordinary market operations. Investment in the manufacturing sector of the poor countries tends to be with capital intensive, labor-saving technologies which accentuate unemployment problems and the maldistribution of income. The MNCs are dominant in the innovative sectors of durable consumer goods, machinery, and equipment, electronics, computers, chemicals, and drugs. A precondition for keeping the process of industrialization going, then, becomes dependent cooperation with their particular model of development.

Dependency theorists contend that liberal economic theory ignores the particular problems faced by poor economies. Their core principles directly challenge those of liberal economists who conceive of the international trading system as capable of benefitting all through free trade and specialization. In contrast, dependency analysts argue that free trade is in the interests of business in the industrial world and that they use their size and wealth to keep primary commodity prices low by playing suppliers in various

countries against each other. They assume that the structural inequalities between the industrial and developing worlds result from conscious policies followed by the already developed countries. Free market advocates advise developing economies to open their local markets and allow foreign investment as well as imports of manufactured goods. They also encourage the production of cash crops in which developing countries have a comparative advantage. Dependency theorists counter that such prescriptions will only increase dependency by perpetuating the unequal relationship with the industrialized world, which uses the developing world as a source of raw materials and cheap labor.

### B. Method

The research was conducted by using the qualitative method. Data and information were gathered through direct observation, in-depth interview with the informers, and complemented by library research on documentation. Validity test was conducted through triangulation technique.

## DISCUSSION

### C. Existing condition of dairy farming supply of milk abbreviations and Acronyms

One of important thing in the national dairy development is the development of dairy cow both in quantity and quality. In the year 1980 – 2016, dairy cow population in Indonesia was prone to increase by 5.26 percent. During the last five years, the population of dairy cows decreased in the average by 1.14 percent. In the year 2011, there has been a sharp increase in dairy cow population by 22.27 percent or amounted 108.76 thousand milking cows bigger than the previous year. For the following period, the population growth of milking cows still continued to decrease, except in 2013 there was a decrease in milking cow population.

The milking cows growth in Java during 2012-2016 experienced such decrease by 1.14 percent per year, while in outside Java island it increased by 5.01 percent per year. Having regarded the milking cow population in Indonesia during 1980 – 2016, those outside Java island grew higher than on Java island amounted 14.17 percent. It can be seen from data of 1983, where the population outside Java island increased by 26.65 thousand milking cows, booking the highest growth increase amounted 649.63 percent. Dairy farming in Indonesia is still predominated by business on Java island. It was denoted by the

number of milking cow population reached 99 percent of the total milking cow population in Indonesia, 518.65 thousand in 2015, and 533,86 thousand in 2016. From those numbers, 513.51 thousand milking cows and 528.32 thousand milking cows were available in Java island. The population of milking cows outside Java island in 2015 only reached 5.13 thousand, and in 2016 reached 5.54 thousand, means 0.99percent and 1.04 percent of total Indonesian milking cows population. As a matter of fact, milk production is concentrated in Java island.

#### *D. Center of National Population and Milk Production*

From the distribution of milking cows, the center of biggest milking cow population was found in East Java approximately 259.57 thousand heads of milking cow or 49.70 percent from total Indonesian milking cow population, followed by Central Java and West Java by 130.57 thousand or 25 percent and 119.74 thousand or 22.93 percent respectively. In some provinces such as Central Kalimantan, North Maluku and West Papua, there has been no population of milking cows.

#### *E. National Consumption of Milk*

The national consumption of milk in Indonesia is still low if compared to other countries amounted 11.8 liters/capita/year, including manufactured product containing milk. Compared to other countries, the dairy condition still needs more intensive care. Neighboring countries such as Malaysia, the milk consumption amounted by 36.2 liters/capita/year; Myanmar reached 26.7 liters/capita/year, Thailand reached 22.2 liters/capita/year; and the Philipines reached 17.8 liters/capita/year

#### *F. National Milk Price*

The national milk price in consumer level is found from data of pure dairy price provided by Badan Pusat Statistik (Statistic Central Body) which were gathered every month through Survey on Rural Consumer Price in 33 provinces across Indonesia.

The price of pure dairy during 2008 – 2015 continuously increased in average 9.53 percent per year. In the last 4 year period (2012-2015), the price of milk experienced considerable increase by 6.45 percent per year with the highest increased achieved in 2014 by 17.32 percent from the previous year or from Rp. 6,962/litres to Rp. 8,168/litres. This indicates such improvements for the sustainability of

Indonesian dairy farming. When it was regarded from the producer side or the dairy farmer, the producer's price was still lower than those on the consumer side. If this continuously happens, it can cause shrinking in milking cow population. And this in turn results in milk amount produced by the population.

#### *G. The Indonesian white revolution, a movement, not merely a discourse*

Indonesian livestock revolution has actually begun since 1970s. Livestock revolution is a movement focusing the promotion of protein consumption emanating from chicken and beef meat. Tremendous investment in livestock industries from feeding, breeding, native chicken meat and native chicken egg production has also taken place in the livestock sector.

Meanwhile, white revolution refers to a massive milk drinking movement to support the poor people, giving them protein sources from milk, particularly targeting the expecting women and toddlers or under-five-year-old children.

Since the beginning of 2006, some of livestock farmer community tried to revive white revolution movement to contribute to the fulfillment of animal protein for low income or poor society. Those efforts deserved the positive responses in that the very low consumption level of milk still occurred in Indonesia amounted only 11.8 liters per capita per year. National milk production was also low with only 26 percent of total national demands. During the last three decades the demands of milk have increased approximately 4.3 percent annually, while the increasing supply of milk amounted 5 percent annually. However, if 79 percent of national milk supply emanating from import, thus it could not increase the added value of milk industry and dairy farmer's wealth. According to Balance of Food released by Food Agricultural Organization (FAO), milk portion belong to import product was steadily increased as in 2016 national dairy farmer could only produce 21 percent.<sup>6</sup>

With such low consumption level, actually there is still a possibility to increase the number. Having regarded that nowadays milk is widely used as main ingredient for various food product targeting the middle-upper class. Increasing national demand for milk gives more potential for a dairy farmer to increase their production. The things that need to take into account in realizing the movement of white revolution is a systematic effort to make it as common

<sup>6</sup> Outlook susu, komoditas pertanian subsektor peternakan, pusat data dan system informasi pertanian 2016



commitment, particularly among the political elites both in central and local level. A movement will merely end up in such discourse if it can not change the culture and thinking pattern of all stakeholders involved. White revolution should be treated as a real effort to achieve food security, addressing malnutrition problem, and nutrition quality that finally can support the national interest.

#### H. What is the next step to bring White Revolution into Being?

Some considerable action should be done to improve the performance of dairy farming community in succeeding the white revolution. Here is the sector entail to contribute:

1. Government institution
2. Financing institution
3. Research center
4. Association of Agro Industry
5. Association and United Milk Cooperative

For government institution, they need to make a policy that can support conducive business climate, create business environment in the cluster of milk processing industry by founding milk processing centers based on location unit and availability of raw material. They should also support the dairy farmer community by providing machinery/equipment such as a cooling unit in order to improve the fresh milk quality. Moreover, they need to give training and capacity building to the dairy farming community to be able to use the equipment given to them. Finally, the government should encourage the founding of partnership between cooperatives and the private sector.

In the financial sector, the bank should provide some credit/loans to support the development of increasing milking cows population where half of interest was bear by the government. For state-owned enterprise and private sector, they can contribute by giving the revolving fund through Corporate Social Responsibility scheme to help in developing small and middle-scaled milk processing industries.

Research center consisting of universities and private sectors can contribute to development through some researches focusing on deep research of milk quality, production

process, product diversification and development of machinery and equipment.

Meanwhile, association of Agro-Industry can contribute to some development of product and process, overcome technological impediments, feasibility studies and forecasting of product life storage. For association and United Milk Cooperative, they can create synergy among milk processing industries, united Indonesian Milk Cooperatives, United Food and Beverage Entrepreneurs of Indonesia, Association of Indonesian Soft drink industry and also an association of baby food producers.

### CONCLUSION

The result suggests that Indonesian White Revolution can possibly implement with the main support from the government, and endorsement of cooperative, dairy farming institution and the dairy farmer communities. The investment coming from foreign countries should be regarded as an opportunity instead of a threat. By creating synergy among all significant actors relating to dairy farming sectors, the realization of white revolution will be surely possible at the very moment.

### REFERENCES

- [1] Bruce A. Scholten, 2010, *India's white revolution: operation flood, food aid and development*, London, New York: IB Tauris Publishers.
- [2] Richard Peet and Elaine Hartwick, *Theories of development: contentions, arguments, alternatives*, second edition, 2009, New York, London: The Guilford Press p. 1
- [3] Frances Stewart and Paul Street, "Conflict between output and employment objectives in developing countries" in *Oxford Economic Papers*, July 1971 p.161.
- [4] Peter J. A Henriot, *Development alternatives: problems, strategies and values* in Michael P. Todaro, 1983, *the struggle for economic development, readings in problems and policies*, New York and London: Longman pp.30-31)
- [5] Outlook susu, komoditas pertanian subsektor peternakan, pusat data dan sistem informasi pertanian 2016