Enchanted mantra of senior english teacher-mentors during mentors-mentees sessions

(the dialogical exchanges within makassar metro schools)

Andi Samsidar
English Department
Universitas Negeri Makassar
Indonesia
samsidar@unm.ac.id

Abstract—**As a limited documentation of mentoring practices, exploring the language of mentoring is a key to understanding the mentoring culture of English language teaching in regional Makassar. The language of mentoring is a crucial means of connecting mentors and mentees with reflective experience and transfer of knowledge about English language teaching. This paper highlights the importance of senior English teacher-mentors' language of interactions as a significant part of the mentoring process within Makassar metro school context. The language of mentoring in mentors' feedback, discussions, dialog teaching, and reflective experience are crucial means of facilitating student teachers with mentors' and transfer of knowledge about English language teaching.**

Keywords—teacher-mentor; English learning; mentor experience

I. INTRODUCTION

Many senior English teachers are now in charged with an increased responsibility of teaching student teachers in school-based teacher education programs associated with a university teaching practicum. Those teachers are generally known as mentors. Moreover, teacher mentoring nowadays has emerged in many countries such as the United States of America, Canada, Britain, Finland, Australia, New Zealand and Singapore as a mechanism to the needs of qualified new teachers at the school pre-service student teacher program [1]–[3].

The Indonesian government seemed to be well informed this global mechanism. The Indonesian government through the Ministry of National Education issued the Teacher Law no. 74/2008 aimed at improving the quality of national education. One of the key emphases in the law was on improving teachers' quality mentoring competencies that can meet certain standards throughout all provinces in Indonesia (The Ministry of Education & Culture Law no 74/2008 on teachers/teacher mentors, 2008). The Indonesian government allocated large budget of education does not have an effect to the quality on mentors' existing mentorship practices. Up to date, there is no evidence that the quality of teacher mentoring has improved.

II. IMPETUS OF THE STUDY

As a former mentee, a government employee, a lecturer and a university tutor for the pre-service student teacher program in the English Education Department of the State University of Makassar, this sojourner-researcher has now gained a perspective on the mentoring culture in regional Makassar. These experiences have enabled the researcher to scrutinize closely inconsistency of awareness of effective mentoring. Firstly, The Indonesian Teacher Law No. 74/2008 was issued to boost national education standards. Quality mentoring practices require teaching practice to meet certain standards through all provinces. However, the written policy made only a general reference to mentoring with no detailed procedure to guide the implementation of mentoring. There is no clear job description of particular tasks for mentors. Hence, mentors enact their responsibilities inconsistently.

Secondly, 'Teaching practicum environments are not conducive to professional development of mentees' and 'mentors lack commitment towards their mentees' teaching practicum [4]. The inconsistent mentoring practices have resulted disagreement on conceptual schema on effective mentoring culture between schools and teacher college institutions in Makassar. Thirdly, inadequate processes of mandating mentoring implementation in Indonesia also become one of the triggering factors of ineffective mentoring. As there is no auditing of mentoring practice, teachers in general do not take their mentoring responsibilities seriously as their mentoring responsibilities appear to be not valued nor are they committed to presenting quality mentoring practices.

Finally, there is an absence of written documentation of mentoring practices by senior English teachers in the context of mentoring within regional Makassar's pre-service teacher program, thus, the essence of past and current mentoring craftsmanship is difficult to trace with limited evidence of how professional mentoring has been conducted. In contrast, reflective teaching is a universally accepted mentoring principle. It is typically characterized by written documentation in reflective texts and reciprocal journaling by teachers on how they organize structures and provide learning incentives that facilitate the professional and personal development of beginning teachers in schools [5]. Moreover,

reflection and reciprocal journaling of teachers is considered to be the 'craft' and the best form of interaction of mentors with their novice teachers [6]. As a consequence, heavy reliance on spoken language is the preferred way for the mentors to transfer and exchange knowledge with their novice teachers. Thus, using discourse analysis of mentors' spoken language seems to be the most suitable method of understanding and exploring mentoring practice in Indonesia particularly in Makassar Regional mentoring practice.

III. RECRUITED MENTORS

Seven chosen English teacher- mentors were government civil servants who comprised of Junior and Senior High Schools in Makassar metro. They had passed the national teacher certification program and for that they had been given extra allowances apart from their main salary. The mentors were assigned by principals to mentor the beginning teachers during the teaching practicum. And the selection of the mentors was based on their length of teaching and mentoring experience.

IV. ELICITED DATA FINDINGS

The mini captured chunks of feedback, discussions, and dialogical exchanges during mentoring process were categorized as evidence of current English teachers' mentoring work and tasks.

TABLE I.

ACTIONS & MINI SAMPLE ENGLISH TEACHERS' MENTORING WORK AND TASKS

Actions	Samples of mentors' captured utterances
Do it my way	"*Ko harus lihat saya caraku mengajar toh dikelas tidak apa jadi orang sekke sedikit*" (**translation**: You need to see the way I teach the students and you sometimes need to be a firm teacher)
Calling for mentors' dependency	"*Kenapa ndak melapor ke saya supaya saya panggil*" (**translation**: Why don't you call me so I can solve it)
Loco parentis	"*Anda harus bisa menempatkan diri sebagai orang tua mereka disekolah*" (**translation**: you need to act like their parents in the school)
Authoritarian teacher	"*Kasi tahu siswa saya guru saya orang tua berarti hormatnya juga sama saya lebih tinggi*" (**translation**: Tell your students I am your teacher and parent in the school and I have the power and higher status over you)

TABLE I. (*CONT.*)

ACTIONS & MINI SAMPLE ENGLISH TEACHERS' MENTORING WORK AND TASKS

Scaremongering	"*Eh kalo kau macam macam nilaiku pasti dikasi merah nanti*" (**translation:** if your students behave badly in the class, warn them that they will have low score)
Punisher	"*Beri hukuman dengan menyuruh mereka mengerjakan didepan dengan dengan menyuruh mereka duduk didepan*" (**translation**: Just punish the problematic students by putting them in the hot seat)

V. DISCUSSION

The mentors generally perceive themselves as 'approachable' and 'helpful' in working with their novice teachers to 'reach' their goals. However, this is quite contradicting with the captured language during the mentoring processes. The mentors' dominance in violating Maxim of Manner indicates anomalies in the way they chant to their beginning teachers. For example, the mixed-blessing of vernacular 'ko' use (means: you in Makassaresse) initially indicates the mentors' acquaintance with their beginning teachers but with harsh intonation and pronunciation at the same time despise mentees' teaching capacity. From the atmosphere, it indicates that the mentors' existing responsibilities are not emotionally and reciprocal to nurture their beginning teachers. The most frequently mentioned characteristic of effective mentors is a willingness to nurture another person [7]. Therefore, individuals recruited as mentors should be people-oriented, open-minded, flexible, empathetic, and collaborative.

Referring back to the one of the mentors' language samples as a counselor "Kenapa ndak melapor supaya saya panggil" this mentor's utterance is initially supplied to solve the mentees' student behaviour management predicament but at the same time it call up for the mentees' dependency of the mentors. Thus, the mentors' assistances do not promote mentees' independent learning which is needed for their future teaching career. The captured frequent words like "Kamu harus begitu" in the mentors' feedback indicate that the mentors are authoritarian. Authoritarian teachers tend to control the behaviours, feelings or attitudes, and model behaviours for mentees to copy [8]. The mentors demand their mentees to follow their "do it my way" to solve and cope with all their teaching predicaments. Thus, there are no knowledge bargaining processes between the experienced and the less knowledge in solving the problem. So, in this case the mentors are there to clone their mentees to be like them and prove how marvellous they are and establish a power base. A mentoring is supposed to be a 'sources of advice, and sounding boards for concerns about teaching' who challenge beginning teachers 'to think more broadly about their practice'[9].

The mentors should give any room for the development of flexibility, creativity and initiative for mentees to develop their sense of self. Mentees' sense of self is evidence that the

mentees have achieved positive progress in their professional development training [10]. In the traditional style of mentoring; the primary goal is a one-way transfer of a broad range of knowledge or information [11]. Thus, the mentors are the authoritarian source of this information, and directed all other aspects of the mentoring relationship. The mentees are passive recipients and often have little to say or control in the relationship. This is what actually happened in the current mentoring practice of the mentors as they act as the authoritarian experts who know all of the answers. This forces the mentees become silent and passive. The mentees are apparently supplied with all the information from the mentors. It can be said that the mentoring process played by the senior English teachers are teacher-mentor centered approach.

Mentors are prepared to advise a protégé, acting as a 'parent' and a 'critical friend' [12] through the provision of honest criticism. But during this mentoring program, the mentors seem have difficulties in managing the elements of support and honest criticism in their relationship with their beginning teachers. In such condition, the mentors convert their utterances become heavily criticisms to their novices. This signifies that the mentors have negative attitude on providing assistance to the less experienced teachers.

In demonstrating behavior of professional teachers, the mentors were captured using loco parentis approach, menacing and scaremongering technique to disciple the students. Becomes a substitute parent, or acquiring disciples are not considered as mentoring [13]. The mentors push their mentees to copy exactly their experience particularly the way they tackle pupils' behaviour management. So what is actually the mentor trying to do is to produce a duplicate copy of herself. The proverb 'give a man a fish and you feed him for a day; teach a man how to fish and you feed him a lifetime' should be applied for the mentors' attitude. The mentors should supply space for their apprentices to develop their own sense to tackle their predicaments during the practicum. Thus, the practicum becomes banks of teaching, classroom, or behaviour management technique for the mentees.

VI. CONCLUSION

The exemplars of mentors-mentees' feedbacks, discussions, and dialogical languages portray the existing mentoring craftsmanship of the senior English trainers in regional Makassar are still disconnected from effective mentoring practice regardless their certified status, the length of their mentoring and teaching experience. It implies that without a guide, the mentors enact arbitrarily in assisting their new teachers. The study highlights the needs of producing mentoring manual which later guides how to mentor. The emergence of mentoring manual is also a response to the general reference of the Indonesian teacher law. The Mentoring for Effective Teaching (MET) program confirms that effective mentoring for teaching encompasses articulation about pedagogy which requires planning, timetabling, preparation, teaching strategies, content knowledge, classroom management towards implementing practice and, other aspects such as, developing questioning skills, assisting in problem solving and providing information and guidance for assessment. Such mentoring necessitates clear expectations

about teaching practices as well as providing viewpoint about teaching. The detailed mentoring pedagogical features can also be functioned as a measurement kit for LPMP (Indonesia Bureau of Education Quality Assurance) to audit work and responsibilities of teacher-mentors nationwide.

REFERENCES

[1] D. McIntyre, H. Hagger, D. McIntyre, H. Hagger, and M. Wilkin, "Teachers' expertise and models of mentoring," *Mentor. Perspect. Sch. Teach. Educ.*, pp. 86–102, 1993.

[2] J. Furlong and T. Maynard, *Mentoring student teachers: The growth of professional knowledge*. Psychology Press, 1995.

[3] J. Wang and S. J. Odell, "Mentored learning to teach according to standards-based reform: A critical review," *Rev. Educ. Res.*, vol. 72, no. 3, pp. 481–546, 2002.

[4] T. Suratno and K. J. Cock, "A school-university partnership in Indonesia. Lessons learnt from Lesson Study," *Innov. Pract. pre-service Teach. Educ. An Asia-Pacific Perspect. Rotterdam Sense Publ.*, 2009.

[5] L. C. Tillman, "Mentoring, reflection, and reciprocal journaling," *Theory Pract.*, vol. 42, no. 3, pp. 226–233, 2003.

[6] S. L. Graves, "Using Dialogue Journals in Mentoring Relationships: Teacher Candidates' and Mentors' Experiences," *Mt. Rise*, vol. 8, no. 2, 2014.

[7] M. Freedman and N. Jaffe, "Elder mentors: Giving schools a hand," *NASSP Bull.*, vol. 77, no. 549, pp. 22–28, 1993.

[8] M. A. K. Halliday, "Explorations in the functions of language.," 1973.

[9] C. M. Fairbanks, D. Freedman, and C. Kahn, "The role of effective mentors in learning to teach," *J. Teach. Educ.*, vol. 51, no. 2, pp. 102–112, 2000.

[10] A. M. Young and P. L. Perrewé, "The role of expectations in the mentoring exchange: An analysis of mentor and protégé expectations in relation to perceived support," *J. Manag. Issues*, pp. 103–126, 2004.

[11] J. D. N. Smith*, "Understanding the beliefs, concerns and priorities of trainee teachers: a multi- disciplinary approach," *Mentor. Tutoring Partnersh. Learn.*, vol. 13, no. 2, pp. 205–219, 2005.

[12] D. W. Kyle, G. H. Moore, and J. L. Sanders, "The role of the mentor teacher: Insights, challenges, and implications," *Peabody J. Educ.*, vol. 74, no. 3–4, pp. 109–122, 1999.

[13] S. H. Fletcher* and A. Barrett, "Developing effective beginning teachers through mentor- based induction," *Mentor. Tutoring Partnersh. Learn.*, vol. 12, no. 3, pp. 321–333, 2004.