The Effect of Implementation Peer Feedback of Essay Writing at Tertiary Level
Muamaroh Muamaroh*, Apreliani Dwiastuti

Department of English Education, Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Surakarta, Indonesia
*Corresponding author. Email: mua237@ums.ac.id

ABSTRACT
This study aimed to find out the effect of peer feedback towards students’ writing performance in essay writing class. The participants of this study were 26 students in the third semester of Essay Writing Class at Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta. There were 9 male and 17 female students. The study used descriptive design using mixed method analysis. The instruments to collect data using questionnaires, interview and documents of essay writing project. The data were analyzed qualitatively and quantitatively. The documents of essay writing project analyzed quantitatively using statistic descriptive. Furthermore, the data of questionnaires and interviews were analyzed qualitatively. The results of this study revealed that peer feedback improved students’ writing performance, students can also write essay writing correctly and students become more careful in using grammar in their writing.

Keywords: essay writing, peer feedback, tertiary level

1. INTRODUCTION
Writing is one of the hardest skills in English. College students essay writing performance were have poor quality in writing [1]. Writing is one of the hard skills because in writing the writer must be balanced of writing components such as the content, organization, purpose, audience, vocabulary and mechanics [2]. They also need to pay attention with the spelling of the words, punctuation, and also capitalization. Many EFL students in Indonesia still face difficulties in delivering their ideas in writing [3]. A research by Ariyanti and Fitriana [1] who found the college students’ problems are also lack of grammar, composing cohesive and coherent paragraph, and choosing the appropriate words. While, according to Muamaroh, Mukti and Haryanti [4] who conducted a research about students’ international class performance. They found that students problems in writing were consist of content, organization, vocabulary, language use and mechanics. Furthermore, another research done by Muamaroh and Ilmiani [5] investigated about grammar problems faced by students in writing. The result of the study revealed that students faced many problems in grammar such as the use of subject, predicate, pronoun, ‘to be’ (is, am, are, was, were), to infinitive, modality, passive voice, parallelism in grammar, conjunction, plural, Indonesian word, punctuation and the written correct English word. By those studies proved that writing is hard skill to master.

To enhance students writing performance, it is important to find and design appropriate method in teaching writing. According to Elboshi [6] in enhancing students’ writing performance is by implementing feedback. Using feedback students have the chance to get review by other people it could be teacher or their friends. Teacher’s feedback could increase students’ writing anxiety [7]. It is also lead students think that there is no one could give feedback except their teachers. Teacher’s feedback such a passive process where students could not develop their output skill [8]. The other types of feedback that can be used to implement in improving students writing performance is peer feedback.

Peer feedback is the feedback by other friends, students exchanged their essay writing project to get feedback by their friends. Peer feedback is also known as peer response or peer review [9]. They stated peer feedback such as a collaborative activity where students give other students’ writing some comments or suggestions. The use of peer feedback is also motivated students to be more critical and improve their confidence in writing.
The use of peer feedback gave positive effects for students. Peer feedback or peer review is kind of tool of learner-centered. Students are more opened with their friends, relax and having good communication with them [8][10]. Based on investigation by Harutyunyan and Poveda [10] who found that students got positive effects of peer feedback. Students also feel that peer review is helpful and useful to improve their writing performance.

Many researchers were conducted studies in investigating about peer-feedback towards students writing performance such as study done by Alhomaidan [11] about students’ attitude towards peer feedback. Forty students Department of General Studies in the age of 18-21 years old were participated in the study. The study was conducted at College of Technology of Arrass in Saudi Arabia. The data was collected using questionnaires. The result of this study revealed that all students are appreciated peer feedback technique, which is used. While, Anjarwati [12] conducted a research about the impact of peer feedback towards students’ writing using quasi experiment design. The instrument to get data using pre-test and post-test. The results revealed that there is significant increasing on students’ writing performance after implementing peer feedback and also all students have positive perception towards peer feedback.

Yunita and Sujito [13] did a study about the use direct peer feedback in increasing students’ writing performance. This study was participated by 48 students of class TKJ1 and TKJ 2 at vocational schools in Central Java. The data was collected using writing test and analyzed quantitatively. The study revealed that direct peer feedback is better in enhancing students writing ability compared to conventional method. Moreover, Mon and Zein [14] conducted a study to investigate the effectiveness of implementing peer feedback in academic writing skill. The participants were 20 students. The data were students’ assignment and final paper. The study showed that peer feedback is effective to use in learning. Additionally, Gheitaranieh [15] conducted the research about the influence of teacher and peer correction in using preposition correctly of their essays. This study was participated by 200 students that consist of 90 females and 110 males in the age 16-28 years old. The result of this study mentioned that peer feedback is more effective than teacher feedback.

Alraddadi [16] investigated about the effect of focused peer feedback. This study was participated by 30 EFL learners who are all females and in the age of 18-24 years old. The participants were divided into two groups and each of them consists of 15 participants. The data was collected using pre-test and post-test. The result of this study revealed that peer feedback gave positive effects and could improve students’ writing performance.

Alnasser [17] did a study to find out students’ view related to the replacement teacher feedback to peer and computer based feedback. This study was participated by 15 male students of Saudi University. The data was collected using pre and posttest and open-ended questionnaires and analyzed quantitatively. The study revealed that the combination of peer feedback and computer-based feedback is more enjoyable and students are having an interesting experience with that. Furthermore, Fatma and Putri [18] explored about the impact in using peer feedback to teach English. The study is quasi-experimental study that is participated by 44 and divided into two groups that is experimental and control group. The data was collected using pre-test, treatment and post-test and result of this study stated that the use of peer feedback is effective and gave positive effects for students.

A study by Suryani et al [8] investigated the influence of peer feedback of students’ writing skill. The--participants were 70 eleventh grades students in High School in West Sumatra, Indonesia. The data was taken from students’ writing project score and all data were analyzed quantitatively. The result mentioned that students’ writing performance was increasing when the teacher implemented peer feedback rather than teacher feedback. While, Saiful et al [19] explored combination teacher and peer feedback using Schoology. In this study 200 students of English Department were participated. The data collected using writing test and questionnaires and analyzed quantitatively. The result of the study revealed that online peer and teacher feedback could not enhance college students’ writing performance compared to conventional method.

Uymaz [20] conducted a research about the effects of peer feedback towards writing performance and participated by 8 students of University of Ankara, Turkey. The data collected using pre-test and post-test in order to find out whether or not there is a difference between the result in the pre-test and post-test. The data was analyzed using SPSS application using paired sample t-test to know the difference between pre-test and post-test. The result of this study was that peer feedback can increase students’ writing performance. Furthermore, Motallebzadeh, Kondori, and Kazemi [21] did a study to find out the effect of peer feedback towards students’ anxiety. The participants in this study were 50 Iranian upper-intermediate learners at Gooyesh Language Institute in Mashhad, Iran. The instruments to collect data were questionnaires and test. All data were analyzed qualitatively. The result of this study was that
students felt less-anxiety when peer feedback implemented in the class.

Sivaci [22] conducted a research to find out the effect of peer feedback in reducing students writing anxiety. The data was collected by pre-test and post-test and analyzed using mixed-method research. The result showed that peer feedback could reduce college students' writing anxiety.

Elfiyanto and Fukazawa [23] did a study to investigate the effectiveness between peer and teacher Corrective Written Feedback (WCF). The participants were 71 students and divided into two groups where each group contained 36 students given peer WCF and 35 students given teacher WCF. The data was collected using pre and post-test and then all data were analyzed qualitatively. The study showed that peer WCF was significantly improved students writing ability compared to teacher WCF. In detailed peer WCF improved students writing organization and vocabulary and teacher WCF improve all aspects of writing except mechanics.

Susanto and Hidayati [24] conducted a research about how peer review enhanced students’ motivation and their writing ability participated by 62 students and divided into two groups. The data was collected using questionnaires and post-test and then analyzed using quantitative analysis. The study showed that peer review gave impact on writing ability and students’ motivation. Moreover, Kulprasit [25] investigated how peer feedback influenced students’ writing final product. This study was participated by English Department Students. The data were from their writing assignments and the final product and all data were analyzed using quantitative analysis. The study revealed that peer feedback gave impact on students’ writing final product.

Based on the research done by Al Abri [26] in exploring students’ comments on Web-Based Peer Feedback and participated by 50 students advanced English at University of Technology and Applied Sciences. This study was quasi-experimental and the data was collected using pre-test and post-test. The result of this study revealed that students were active and motivated synchronously and improved their writing. However, most of them did not pay attention of writing components such as content, organization, cohesion and coherence. While, according to Chen [27] who explored the effect of peer feedback training of teaching English in China. This study was participated by 90 students Business Major in the university in Southern China and divided into three groups in which each of them consist of 30 students. The data was collected using observations, questionnaires and pre-test and post-test and analyzed using quantitative research. The result of this study was it was an important to pay attention to the peer feedback training in teaching essay writing.

Hoa and Lap [28] investigated students’ perception towards the effect of peer feedback. This study was participated by 22 students of Mekong Delta of Vietnam and divided into two groups. The data was collected using six drafts on two tasks and interview, the data was analyzed using mixed-method research. The result of the study indicated that the students’ writing performance increased using peer feedback and showed students’ positive attitude both of peer feedback and teacher feedback.

2. METHOD

The participants were 26 students of Essay Class Writing at Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta. They were in the third semester and they have passed for writing 1 about short functional writing and writing 2 about building paragraph at the previous semesters. The class consisted of 17 females and 9 males in the age around 17-19 years old. The class was conducted online due to pandemic Covid-19. The instruments to collect data used opened-online questionnaire, interviews, and documentation of students’ essay writing projects. The open-ended questionnaire has been tried out to students who were not included in this study to know whether the statements can be understood easily. The questionnaire and interview used Indonesian to get more detail data. The questionnaire was not anonym; student has to write his/her name in order to trace his/her improvement in writing essay. The open-ended questionnaire as student feedback was distributed using Google Form after the class was ended to find out students’ problems in essay writing and implementation of peer feedback. The online interview was held outside the online classroom which held randomly only 13 students from 26 respondents. The documents were taken from two students’ essay writings. At the beginning all students wrote argumentative essay in the first and the second texts. However, only twenty students returned back the revision based on their friends’ feedback. Therefore, only who revised their text based on peer feedback which had been analyzed. The data were analyzed qualitatively and quantitatively. All data from questionnaire and interviews were analyzed qualitatively. The document of students’ essay writing project was assessed using Jacobs, et al’s [29] ESL Testing Composition. There are five components to assess students’ writing, they are Content, Organizations, Vocabulary, Language Use and Mechanics. All data from documents were analyzed quantitatively using descriptive statistical analysis.
3. FINDING AND DISCUSSION

3.1 The students improved their writing performance

Based on closed questionnaires which is distributed in the first meeting of essay writing class where only twenty students out of twenty-six filled the form showed that 2 students (10%) answered good level, 11 students (55%) answered average level, 4 students (20%) answered less, 3 students (15%) answered very bad in their writing performance. The problems of students are lack of grammar, vocabulary, developing topic. These statements based on the following data taken from open-ended questionnaires:

I actually easy in finding a topic for my essay but I have difficulties in using grammar (SF3)

My grammar is still messy (SF12)

When I write an essay in Indonesian and then I translated it into English, the tenses are changing sometimes (SF13)

Students perceived that they also have a problem in their English vocabulary, which is limited. The data is below taken from open-ended questionnaire.

I still have difficulties in English. It is because my English is bad, many vocabularies, which I still, do not know and I am still confused in producing sentences (SM9)

My vocabularies are still limited (SF9)

I have difficulties in choosing appropriate vocabularies and producing the correct sentences (SF10)

Another problem that makes students write essay is they are lack of developing the topic. The data is below.

I have lack of ideas in producing an essay writing (SF14)

I have difficulties in developing the topic of my essay writing (SF12)

The results from interview and questionnaire were supported by the results from the documents that show the improvement of students’ argumentative essay writing. The following tables show students’ argumentative writing score.

Table 1. Essay Text 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student</th>
<th>Text 1</th>
<th>Revision based on peer feedback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female 1</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 2</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 4</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 5</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 1</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 2</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 7</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 8</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 9</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 4</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 12</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 6</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 13</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 7</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 14</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 8</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 9</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 15</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 16</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 17</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Essay Text 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student</th>
<th>Text 2</th>
<th>Revision based on peer feedback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female 1</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 2</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 3</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 4</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 5</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 6</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 2</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 9</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 10</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 3</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 11</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male 5</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female 12</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
All those data scores were analyzed using descriptive statistic. It was found that students’ text argumentative essay 1, before getting peer feedback, their mean = 75.10. However, after getting peer feedback their mean score improved sharply (mean = 79.30). For the text 2 before getting peer feedback, their mean = 74.32. Nevertheless, after getting peer feedback their mean score improved slightly (mean = 75.32). The following data is below

| Male 6   | 71 | 71 |
| Female 13| 74 | 76 |
| Female 14| 77 | 78 |
| Male 8   | 69 | 73 |
| Female 16| 76 | 76 |
| Female 17| 76 | 76 |

Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Text</th>
<th>Before peer feedback (N)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>After peer feedback (N)</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Text 1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>75.10</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>79.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Text 2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>74.32</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>75.32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2 Students can write essay writing correctly

Based on students’ argumentative essay writings, it was found that some students did not write the argumentative essay writing correctly based on its generic structure. Some of them did not write introduction paragraph, while others did not write conclusion paragraph. Even there was one student only wrote one long paragraph for an argumentative essay. However, after getting feedback from their friends, students started to understand well about the generic structure of argumentative essay.

They could write argumentative essay consisting introduction, body paragraph and conclusion. They were able to write good thesis statement in the introduction paragraph. They also developed the thesis statement in the body paragraph well as for the conclusion paragraph.

Below an example is taken from students’ project in writing introduction paragraph. SF1 wrote the introduction paragraph without writing thesis statement. She might be getting difficulties in writing thesis statement.

Through this essay I will give some of my arguments about why we should study in university (SF1)

After getting feedback from her/his peer, the SF1 revised and wrote a clear thesis statement by mentioned three points which will be discussed in the body paragraph.

Through this essay, I will give some of my arguments why we study in university: getting useful knowledge, providing practical training, and preparing to get a job. (SF1).

In the second project, SF1 could write thesis statement correctly. She already created the good thesis statement by mentioning points that will be discussed in the body paragraph.

Online learning and offline learning both have similarities within the materials being taught. However, they are different in the matter of preparation, communication and learning procedures (SF1).

This also supported the results from interview, students admitted that they understood well to write argumentative essay correctly after getting feedback from their friends.

I can write an essay based in its generic structure (SF5)

Mom, now I know to write a good essay there must be introduction, body and conclusion paragraph (SM2)

Now, I understand thesis statement should be clear and explicit, therefore I can develop it in the body paragraph (SF10)

3.3 Students become more careful in writing essay

By the implementing peer feedback, it gave impact on students to become more careful in producing an essay especially in using grammar. It means that before the peer feedback is implemented students did not really pay attention in using grammar and write an essay correctly. These following statements were the results of the questionnaires student feedback 2.

The advantages of peer feedback are made me more careful in writing sentence, learn and apply the grammar, which has been taught (SM3)

Peer feedback trained me to be more careful in correcting essay (SF3)
Peer feedback become an evaluation for me to become more careful in writing an essay (SF13)

The statement supported by the result of interview. Below are the following statements

Peer feedback made me become aware in writing an essay (SF10)

Peer feedback became my evaluation in writing an essay and made become more careful (SF13)

Students feel more careful in writing sentences after receiving peer feedback. The data is below

The advantage of peer feedback that I feel is that I am aware in writing sentences correctly in my essay and makes me more careful (SF12)

I become aware about my essay writing and peer feedback makes me more careful (SF16)

The findings of the study showed that students’ writing performance improved by implementing of peer feedback. Students also became more careful in using grammar. The grammar is the major problem which students faced during they wrote an essay.

The findings of this study are in line with the research done by Yunita and Sujito [13], Alraddadi [16], Uymaz [20], and Suryani et al [8] who found that peer feedback can improve students’ writing ability. Moreover, the study done by Anjarwati [12], Elfiyanto and Fukazawa [23], found that peer feedback improved students’ writing performance. According to Kuyyosguy [30] who did a research about promoting the implementation of peer feedback based on the research which peer feedback could enhance students’ writing ability. The finding of this research agree with the finding of the research done by Meletiadou [31] who explored the impact of peer assessment and found that peer assessment improved the students’ writing performance.

On the other hand, the finding of this current study is different from the finding of the study done by Saiful et al [19] who found that students prefer teacher feedback rather than peer feedback. It is also different from the study done by Emrah and Fatih [32] who found that students preferred teacher feedback.

4. CONCLUSION

In conclusion, based on the finding above, the implementation of peer feedback is improving students’ writing score, students can write essay writing correctly, students become more careful with the use of grammar while writing an essay writing.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

In this paper the first author was supervising,concepting and designing this paper. Second author was assembling literature review, analysing and interpreting the data of this paper.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to show my gratitude and my warmest thanks to all participants who are already participated in producing this paper.

REFERENCES


