Brand Behaviour Applied to Indonesian Millennial Consumers in the Leisure Economics Era
A Meta-Analysis Study

Jaisy Aghniarahim Putritamara¹,⁎, Anie Eka Kusumastuti², Asri Nurul Huda³, Poespit asari Hazanah Ndaru⁴

¹Department of Livestock Economics, Faculty of Animal Sciences, Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia
²Department of Socio-economics, Faculty of Animal Sciences, Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia
³Department of Ruminant Nutrition, Faculty of Animal Science, Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia
⁴Department of Feed and Stuff Nutrition, Faculty of Animal Science, Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia
⁎Corresponding author. Email: jaisyap@ub.ac.id

ABSTRACT
The lazy economy era can support agro-educational tourism for dairy to engage millennial consumers through dairy products. Agro tourism has become an alternative to developing a dairy business. The tourism sector has become a market trend in the leisure economy strategy as a stimulator for economic development in rural areas. Brand has become a major concern for millennial consumers, and it can influence consumer psychology regarding purchasing decisions for agricultural products. It was changed when a pandemic caused a mega shift due to the changing purchasing power of society, especially the assessment of brands. Producers have been unable to rebrand because it has been difficult to understand the characteristics of millennial consumers who are disloyal and the changes in purchasing power during the leisure economics era, so this research aims to synthesize brand equity in the millennial era through meta-analysis with 7 studies published from 2015-2020 (era business-defined IT in 2015). This analysis helped researchers build many kinds of information from several pieces of research that were in line with brand behaviour. It would be a contribution for producers to review consumer behaviour when facing uncertainty. Based on the synthesis results from 7 studies, it is clear that Indonesian millenial consumers have the same perspective on determining purchasing decisions through brand equity. Producers should adapt to adjusting consumer needs based on social experience as the main element in the mega-shifting phase to obtain market segmentation in accordance with new market trends in order to engage millenial consumers during the sudden shift in economics. Producers should make a brand strategy in this challenging time through empathy, authenticity, and credibility approaches to local products of agrotourism as a developing dairy business.

Keywords: agro-tourism, brand behaviour, dairy, millenial

1. INTRODUCTION

The tourism sector has a high contribution value to the national economy. Tourism in Indonesia is a primary sector that has increased the country's foreign exchange by 19.2 billion USD in 2018. The rapid growth of the tourism sector is predicted to occur in 2020. The amount of foreign exchange will increase by 50% compared to the previous year. However, at the beginning of 2020, the Covid-19 pandemic had a massive impact on the tourism sector's income which decreased drastically. Household income per capita has also changed so that people's purchasing power has also decreased. Due to the pandemic, the public sector has made efforts to transform tourism to generating a community economy.

The type of business tourism sector that can survive is the integration of the tourism sector with agriculture or agro-tourism. The agricultural sector which produces food products has a positive impact on increasing consumption with high nutritional value during the pandemic. During the pandemic, the survival strategy for agro-tourism which contributes to producing dairy products has adjusted to what consumers need. In the pandemic era, the agricultural sector has become the primary consumer product, so collaboration between tourism and agriculture has become a hope for small businesses in developing productivity because the two sectors have mutually supportive characteristics.
When analyzed from an economic point of view, changes in dynamic economic motives have an impact on changing consumer behavior in line with technological developments. Consumer awareness has begun to increase about consuming nutritious food products. This has been understood by producers to make novelties for consumer engagement. The industrial revolution 4.0 has supported producers to implement IoT-based systems, which are a strategy to increase product competitiveness. Some industries that have implemented cyber patterns are the food industry. Producers compete with each other to anticipate the dynamics of consumer behavior that rapidly change along with changing market trends. Changing market trends are caused by the behavior of millennial consumers in the leisure and digital economy.

The leisure economy is a pattern caused by shifting patterns of consumption. The leisure economy focuses on what consumers like, and it has become the lifestyle of consumers in the millennial era. Producers in the tourism sector are competing for consumer attention for market expansion. One of the economic leisure activities is traveling and culinary. The leisure economy cannot work alone without the support of the digital economy. The role of the digital economy has been complementary.

This era supports the existence of dairy agro tourism for millennial tourist engagements. Agro tourism is the object of developing the dairy cow business. Based on the tourism market trend, the dairy business has become a stimulator for economic development in potential areas. This concept has become a solution for dairy farmers who have not been able to improve their bargaining position during their collaboration with partners. Therefore, agrotourism should have a strategy to realize sustainable agro-tourism through understanding consumer behavior due to the impact of the megashifting crisis, especially when assessing tourism brands and products. Consumer behavior tends to change as the monistic determination to use Internet-based technologies increases. It has influenced tourists' assessment of brands. Basically, the leisure economy disrupts tourists from generations Y and Z, as it has massively changed behavior that also impacts the community, so that baby boomers and generation X are also disrupted by technological trends, perhaps only through a different adaptation process. Based on the psychological theory, basic individual psychological factors have been influenced by environmental forces and will have a domino effect along with high communication in density.

Brand has become complex when tourist behavior has begun to change in purchasing power due to the pandemic. Millennial consumer characteristics have been disloyal to the brand, but consumers need products with high credibility. Marketing psychology explains through the aspect of cognition that the level of consumer credibility towards the brand is both conscious (influenced by the environment) and unconscious (because it is a necessity).

It has become a big challenge for producers and competitors to compete to increase their competitiveness to monopolize the market through brand strengthening. A brand is not only about a name, but also an attribute of the product that can influence consumers' assumptions and impressions. The big challenge with brand strengthening is competitors who have commercial brands and give a positive impression to consumers. Therefore, the branding strategy is the main choice for informing millennials and giving an impression through personal branding for dairy agro tourism. It has become a big challenge for producers and competitors to compete to increase their competitiveness to monopolize the market through brand strengthening. A brand is not only about a name but also an attribute of the product that can influence consumers' assumptions and impressions. The big challenge with brand strengthening is competitors who have commercial brands and give a positive impression to consumers. Therefore, the branding strategy is the main choice for informing millennials and giving an impression through personal branding for dairy agro tourism.

Agro tourism has high equity if it can build a strong brand for consumers through an appropriate and segmented strategy. Brand equity is the added value of brand attributes in a product that can give an impression to consumers and become an assumption for consumers after buying the product. The theory of brand equity suggests that consumers want to engage with products and services from a strong brand [1]. Brand equity is categorized into four dimensions, namely brand awareness, brand loyalty, perceived quality and brand association [2]. Branding is a challenging way to provide information to consumers and influence consumer decisions [4].

In this study, the authors focus on the impact of mega shifts on dairy agro tourism so that it can realize a sustainable dairy business through a stimulation process from the tourism sector. The main strategy for engagement of millennial tourists is through brands that are tailored to market segmentation and based on a market expansion strategy, so that micro-business products are able to compete with commercial industrialized products. In this case, the purpose of agro tourism is to increase cons
umer trust through micro-business product brands, according to market trends in the millennial era.

2. METHOD

The study used a literature review base related to brand equity and product purchase decisions. The author has screened the literature obtained to improve the accuracy of data related to the condition of brand behavior in the millennial era, so that the categories of literature used have been published from 2015 to 2020. The next category that brand equity and purchasing decisions relate to food products. Psychologically, consumer assumptions will differ between food and non-food products. Purchases of food products with the new brand will be the object of accuracy for the consumer, and the intensity of the review would be higher than the old brand that has been recognized by consumers. But in psychology, consumer attitudes will change if the condition is already a commercial brand, although consumers have never made a purchase, because the nature of the brand is very easy to influence if positive consumer impressions.

The author focuses on using literature related to brand equity and purchasing decisions with food product objects. The majority of products from agro-tourism are dairy products. This is a small business product with a negative stigma. It has low credibility among Indonesian consumers when compared with commercial products. So in this study, the author took the initiative to expand the market through brand strengthening by conducting a meta-analysis study with references from 2014 to 2020 and analyzing trends for brand behavior, especially from 2014 to 2020, where the shift in consumer purchasing power was quite significant in 2020 due to the pandemic, so it had an impact on the performance of the dairy business developed through agro tourism. The majority of journals that have been obtained from Indonesia, because the author's target object is millennial tourism in Indonesia. Indonesian consumers have different characteristics because the majority of consumer decisions are dominated by environmental factors.

The author is interested in using the meta-analysis concept in this study because consumer behavior towards brands began to show significant changes starting in 2015 when technology began to disrupt the consumer buying culture of food products through social media. "Social media is the biggest change since the Industrial Revolution on 4.0". If converted to a graphic, there will be dynamic changes in brand behavior.

Meta-analysis is a quantitative data analysis to synthesize the results of previously existing relevant research. For this reason, the availability of information is the most important thing in this analysis. Before adopting the literature used for synthesis, the researcher must check and recheck the artifact. Because the synthesis process integrates one literature with the next literature, researchers should adjust the depth and reference content used for research purposes [21]. The software used by researchers in running meta-analysis is Jamovi's open access software from the official website www.jamovi.org. The following is a summary table of reference results that will be synthesized by researchers in assessing brand behavior for dairy agro-tourism products.

Table 1. Summary references

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Sample (n)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jurnal Organisasi dan Manajemen</td>
<td>Mentari, et.al</td>
<td>2020</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jurnal Administrasi Bisnis</td>
<td>Sari, et.al</td>
<td>2015</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jurnal Pariwisata</td>
<td>Wiastuti and Kimberley</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diponegoro Journal of Social and Politic</td>
<td>Wiraliosojati</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thesis of Indonesia Islamic Univesity</td>
<td>Yusuf</td>
<td>2018</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dinasti Publisher</td>
<td>Zarwin and Hartono</td>
<td>2020</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

In quantitative analysis with meta-analysis, statistical testing uses two parameters, namely the heterogeneity test through H0, forest plot and choosing a model. In this study, the model chosen was not fixed effect because the topics discussed were related to relationships so that t
here was no fixed relationship in a model related to consumer behavior in assessing brands. It has been possible that many factors cause data bias due to respondents' answers that cannot be used as a single parameter. Therefore, the researcher chooses a model for the moderator type that is continuous moderator. The second criteria is through publication bias assessment parameters which can be detected through a funnel plot, meta-regression, and fail-safe N. The following are the results that have been tested with a random effect model to determine the overall correlation of brand behavior that has been shown through brand testing.

Table 2. Random-effects model (k = 7)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimate</th>
<th>Z</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>CI Lower</th>
<th>CI Upper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>0.580</td>
<td>0.138</td>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>&lt; .001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| CI Lower | 0.309 |
| CI Upper | 0.851 |

Note. Tau² Estimator: Restricted Maximum-Likelihood

Table 3. Heterogeneity statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tau</th>
<th>Tau²</th>
<th>I²</th>
<th>H²</th>
<th>R²</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Q</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.351</td>
<td>0.1236</td>
<td>93.1%</td>
<td>14.486</td>
<td>6.000</td>
<td>82.939</td>
<td>&lt; .001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(SE = 0.0772)

The results of the intercept heterogeneity test show that the estimated value is 0.580 with a p-value <0.01 (highly significant). This means that the relationship between brand equity and consumer purchasing decisions is significant and positively related. The purpose of the heterogeneity test is to determine whether the 7 studies are heterogeneous. The estimated results indicate a highly heterogeneous sample with a value of I2 of 93.1%. If the value of I2 is greater than 75%, it means that the studies have high heterogeneity. In order to find the cause of the high heterogeneity value, it is necessary to examine the results of the meta-regression.

The forest plot is an advanced test that aims to determine the most accurate estimation of the type of research from the 7 studies used by researchers in meta-analyses as shown in the following figure.

The results of the forest plot analysis show that pooled ES is 1.30. This value is not significant due to high heterogeneity, but the forest plot value from the figure shows that the research with the most accurate estimation was reference in Prajapati and Makwana [13].

The results of the publication bias test are presented in Figure 2. The point shape showed a level of symmetry due to its inside triangle shape. However, the point has colonised the bottom, suggesting that the estimates are less accurate. According to Table 4, file-safe N analysis showed that there are 624,000 studies related to brand equity and purchasing decisions which are unpublished due to their insignificant values. While the characteristics of this study were positivist, the two variables had a strong relationship, as shown in the intercept value when performing random effects model analysis.
The moderator heterogeneity test, as shown in Table 5, of 0.006 with a p-value < 0.01 (highly significant), suggests that the relationship between brand equity and consumer purchasing decisions is significantly positive. The objective of the heterogeneity test is to determine the heterogeneity of the seven studies on brand equity and purchasing decisions. The I² value is 83.6%, indicating that the studies have high heterogeneity. The value of R² (coefficient of determination) is 63.1%, suggesting that brand equity is a significant variable in determining heterogeneity.

Table 5. Mixed-effects model (k = 7)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimate se</th>
<th>Z</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>CI Lo</th>
<th>BCI Upper</th>
<th>BCI Lower</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>0.580</td>
<td>0.138</td>
<td>4.20 &lt; .001</td>
<td>0.309</td>
<td>0.851</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderator</td>
<td>0.00629</td>
<td>0.00206</td>
<td>3.052</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6. Heterogeneity statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tau</th>
<th>Tau²</th>
<th>F²</th>
<th>H²</th>
<th>R²</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Q</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.213</td>
<td>0.0456</td>
<td>83.59%</td>
<td>6.094</td>
<td>63.09%</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>27.516 &lt; .001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(SE = 0.0 349 )</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the results of the analysis, the 7 studies used for meta-analysis have high heterogeneity, because 7 studies are a type of positivism research, so if researchers get insignificant results in their studies, researchers should not publish the results in journals, because it causes highly contradictions in research positivism with great probability that the data is biased. Basically, the 7 studies analyzed by meta-analysis had almost the same characteristics, because the researchers screened them in detail to classify the data according to the research objectives. From the 7 studies, it is found that brand equity has a positive influence on purchasing decisions. Here is a review study of brand equity based on four elements that can influence purchasing decisions.

3.1. Brand Awareness

Brand awareness has helped consumers consider purchasing decisions, impulsively. If consumers already have credibility with the brand, then they will realize that the product purchased is based on brand engagement. Especially if the producer engages consumers with high intensity, so that the brand is easily remembered by consumers. There are many food products in Indonesia are commercialized and get the full attention of their consumers, because producers are active in reminding their consumers of products, even though the product is in a mature cycle (the highest cycle in the product life cycle and company profits are also high). Producers use recall strategies to keep their products available to consumers in the face of ever-increasing competition. Even some food producers in Indonesia have also conducted frontal partnerships with competitors through co-branding segmentation. It aims to attract the attention of consumers because the characteristics of millennial consumers in Indonesia prefer an emotional approach, such as companies A and B competing with the red ocean strategy because of the same market segmentation, but at certain moments the two companies work together to attract attention and generate empathy audiences. This effort has become a recall for producers to consumers during the pandemic to meet needs due to mega shifting. As a result, many consumers reduce their purchasing intensity, so that the recall is quite effective and has become a marketing strategy concept in crisis. Changes in consumption during crisis periods are based on the demographics of the customer [12].

Companies must adapt their products to emotionally connect with their customers; otherwise, the product can become a product and become a brand image in the customer's mind. [16].

3.2. Brand Loyalty

The results of the first study from research by [11] showed that brand equity could have an effect on purchasing decisions as much as 59.1%. In this study, brand equity has the highest effect on purchasing decisions compared to brand loyalty.

The results of the third study with researchers [17] showed the effect of brand equity on purchasing decisions was 63.8%. The most influential element of brand equity is brand loyalty.

The results of the sixth study from [14] showed that brand equity had an effect on purchasing decisions by 67.7%, with the element with the highest influence being brand loyalty. Basically, millennial consumers in Indonesia are not loyal to brands. Any producer can replace the
product position with high loyalty. Brand loyalty tends to be owned by consumers in generations X and Y. Although generations X and Y are digital immigrants, there is a possibility that the two generations have also begun to adapt to a new era in knowing other products at affordable prices compared to the initial product. Psychologically, the consumer's assessment of a brand will tend to change if the environment supports it. Consumer purchase factors are influenced by four main psychological factors, namely motivation, perception, learning, and beliefs and attitudes. Motivation can be influenced by intrinsic (self) or extrinsic (environment), while native digital consumers bring about changes that are large enough to adapt the product and can affect other consumers. The main focus of producers when increasing product loyalty is through Fast Moving Consumer Goods (FMCG) conditions such as shifting food needs that shift to pleasure-based needs such as traveling, the tourism sector has a good chance of upgrading according to what consumers need during a pandemic, when tourism services are less considered in crisis periods.

Millennials spend more than generations X and Y, but they have less brand loyalty than previous generations. Low loyalty is due to greater exposure to price promotions. They are also looking for products and brands that match their personalities, lifestyle, social and community values. They use brands to create images, represent their personalities, and communicate their values.

3.3. Brand Association

The fourth study was conducted with the coffee shop object. The research results showed that brand equity had an effect on purchasing decisions by 56.7%. The element that has a high influence on purchasing decisions is the brand association. These elements are identical to the brand-impact power consumers have to maintain the existence in the market. During the crisis period, building a local brand should have been a big effort if producers did not understand what the target market's consumers needed. The characteristics of millennial consumers who are disloyal are great opportunities for producers to approach them through brand associations. This aims to maintain the existence of the product so that it is easily introduced to consumers. Producers should also understand consumer needs through authentic products.

Another aspect to consider is the crisis context affecting buying behavior in general, and particularly panic buying (also known as panic build-up). Panic buying is consumer behavior when affected by disasters and shortages of supply. During the economic crisis, consumers are less interested in organic products because they are expensive and prefer locally produced goods. These products do not always have to do with premium quality but are related to price.

The sixth study is the result of research by that found brand equity has an effect on purchase decisions by 74.4%.

Authors assume that brands can impress consumers through adding value, so that they can influence consumers to increase the credibility of the product. When consumers trust the brand, the purchase decision will increase. When consumers give high trust in a product, consumers will give positive feedback to the brand. Respondents from the 7th study have criteria as millennial consumers to consider product purchasing decisions, especially food products, the most important thing is information about consumer experience with the brand. In the era of the strategic leisure economy, for consumers, experience is a very important assessment of a brand. Brand attributes are a major concern for potential consumers and those who have become loyal customers. Producers are supposed to provide emotional experiences for millennial consumers. Such as understands the moments that consumers like through the consumer's lifestyle and prioritizes authentic as a personal branding strategy. Brand behavior focuses on consumer psychology towards a brand and how the brand is bound to consumers so that it has high credibility.

Generation Y is attracted to strong brands. They realize how the brand connects with people and how the company respects and directs its staff, so a brand can be supported or rejected very quickly.

3.4. Perceive Quality

The results of the 7th study showed brand equity influence on purchasing decisions by 80.8%, with the highest element being quality.

For millennial consumers, quality products have a social impact such as purchasing products that form an image of the consumer's lifestyle, products that are in accordance with consumer social activities and these products are highly prestige. Based on the Global Corporate Sustainability report in 2015, digital native consumers and immigrant consumers have the same behavior towards purchasing decisions for products with popular brands, durable and able to increase consumer prestige through the label "made in overseas". This attribute has become the main focus of producers in consumer engagement through perceived quality. The features that support consumers in providing feedback related to perceived quality are...
e through e-commerce and social media reviews. Millennial consumers like features such as love, star symbols, and reviews that are part of the millennial consumer culture. The more consumers provide positive feedback, the more credibility the product has [9].

Through branding, consumers more easily obtain information on the hedonistic and utilitarian aspects of a product [10][19].

This concept is a big challenge for small businesses that lack prestige due to local products. There is a possibility that a small business has high authentic value in local products. Authenticity is the main strategy in the market trend approach for millennial consumer segmentation.

The concept of meta-analysis, through literature review and synthesis, will then be used as a parameter to be implemented for agro-tourism strategies in producing dairy products in accordance with market segmentation, because in the leisure era the business trend of the developing market is entertainment such as tourist attractions and culinary, so that the agro-tourism approach has a great opportunity to attract consumers. Based on research through a meta-analysis study of the 7th study that had been screened, there was a new behavior of millennial consumers towards brands called brand behavior in the crisis period. Producers should create market trends through an empathy approach because the characteristics of millennial consumers prefer soft selling through an emotional approach. The branding concept should be in accordance with the conditions of millennial consumers in crisis, in addition to a social empathy approach. Producers must increase their product credibility through informative and traceable dairy brands. The important thing about personal branding for dairy products is the authentic side. Authenticity is the main element of personal branding for agro tourism products in terms of quality that can reach the social needs of millennial consumers and adjust the purchasing power of consumers in a crisis. The orientation of the producer in the crisis period must adapt to the consumer's needs, not only to the producer's profit.

They want brands that allow them to interact with them on social networks and to be part of their product development team [7]. Producers who understand consumer needs through brands will play a high role in adapting to consumer needs both online and offline. Producers must strive to strengthen brand equity and increase the number of customers through credibility [3]. Brand equity can also affect the level of customer confidence in the decision-making process [2]. The weakness of this study is the researchers have limited references. Moreover, during the analysis of this study, the researchers found eight references that should be eliminated because the data has no high credibility and will reduce the credibility of other data. So this is the reason why the researcher only used seven references [2].

4. CONCLUSION

Producers should understand the millennial consumer needs, which are based on social needs, as the main element in the mega-shifting phase due to the decreasing economic impact, so that they can survive in market segmentation and in accordance with new market trends. Brands have become a major factor influencing millennial consumer behavior in the mega-shifting phase of the leisure economy strategy. An aspect that needs to be considered is to create a brand strategy in the crisis period by emphasizing the empathy, authenticity and credibility approach of a local product produced by agro tourism in developing the non-corporate dairy business. The next researcher can use more than 20 studies with a high variation of respondents to help the producer, especially in small businesses, build a resilience business.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Special thanks to the lecturer of the Philosophy and Scientific Work in Animal Science Doctoral Program, Faculty of Animal Science, Universitas Brawijaya, Prof. Dr. Ir. Hendrawan Soetanto, M.Rur.Sc, who has supported the author as a doctoral student to study research synthesis through meta-analysis of aspects of brand behavior studies to help farmers improve the performance of the dairy business through the concept of agro-tourism.

REFERENCES


