

Global Citizenship Values in the Student's Book of Pancasila and Civic Education

Mukhamad Murdiono
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
 Yogyakarta, Indonesia
 mukhamad_murdiono@uny.ac.id

Suharno
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
 Yogyakarta, Indonesia
 suharno@uny.ac.id

Wuri Wuryandani
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
 Yogyakarta, Indonesia
 wuri_wuryandani@uny.ac.id

Abstract—This study was aimed at (1) analyzing the values of the global citizenship and (2) finding the dominant global citizenship values in the student's book of Pancasila and civic education for grade XII. This study is a content analysis. The unit of analysis in this study was the content of the student's book. The technique of data collection was note-taking based on predetermined categorization. The data were analyzed by examining the content on a page of each chapter. The results showed that (1) the global citizenship values are social justice and equity, respect for diversity, environmental care and sustainable development, globalization and interdependence, peace and conflict, critical thinking, ability to argue critically, ability to tackle injustice and inequalities, respect for others, cooperation and conflict resolution, sense of identity and self-esteem, empathy and sense of humanity, respect for diversity, inequalities and social justice, caring, personal responsibility, global interconnectedness, self-awareness, intercultural communication, and global insight; (2) the most dominant value of global citizenship is the ability to argue critically.

Keywords: *global citizenship, student's book, Pancasila and civic education*

I. INTRODUCTION

Globalization that continuously grows and occurs almost in all countries in the world is marked by progress in various fields of human life, including the technology. Advances in technology, especially information and communication, create a borderless world. Events that occur in a country can easily be known by someone in another country. Information is rapidly transferred to different parts of the world with the help of the Internet technology. The use of the Internet provides ease for people all over the earth to access information without the limit of time and areas. The Internet can play a role in the exchange of information and ideas between government and citizens [1]. A world without boundaries in the global era not only causes a rapid information spread from other countries, but also promotes a challenge that every country must face.

Information that comes and goes has an impact on the citizens' lives in the world. The ideology, lifestyles, and beliefs that develop in a country can influence the habits and patterns of life that have been

established in other countries. The basic values, in the form of the nation's ideology that has long been used as the basis for the lives of citizens, slowly begin to erode. The phenomenon of the basic values degradation is shown by the younger generation's behaviors. Behaviors that become a global trend/tendency, such as hedonic and consumptive lifestyles are very easily imitated and performed by the younger generation. If the excessive imitative behavior toward global tendencies is left unchecked, it does not rule out that the basic values can be faded.

The growing globalization of the 21st century affects every aspect of people's lives, including beliefs, norms, values, and behaviors, and economics and commerce [2]. The issue of a global trend that can erode the noble values of the nation needs to be faced and resolved. One way to be done is strengthening the noble values of the nation that serve as the basis of nation-state life through civic education. Civic education has a strategic role in strengthening the values that serve as a philosophy in the nation-state life. According to Nussbaum [2] civic education should help students develop identity and interdependence within global communities and human relationships around the world.

Civic education has an important role in establishing young generation to be smart and good citizens. Good citizens are at least reflected in the three main aspects of qualified civic education. These three aspects include: civic knowledge, civic skills, and civic dispositions [3]. Civic knowledge relates to what should be known by citizens. Civic skills of a country can be intellectual and participatory skills. Civic dispositions are the main public and private characteristics that citizens have for the maintenance and development of constitutional democracy.

The emerging cross-border issues as a result of globalization and rapid technological advances require solutions through a new approach in civic education. This new approach according to Charles Titus is said as a civic education for global understanding, which is a new perspective and dedication to civic education. This approach has been examined by Boulding [4] with the conclusion that Americans are recognized as the planetary population that becomes a global village. Such circumstances

require the attention and action of citizens on a cross-country and cross-cultural scale. Thus, it is clear that a new perspective on developing culture called "global civic culture" or now well-known as "transnational civil society" is needed [5].

Civic education has a strategic role in establishing citizens' global insight. Civic education is not limited to studying the rights and obligations of citizens, but exploring them further by preparing citizens for becoming global citizens. Civic education equips students at schools with knowledge of global issues, cultures, institutions and international systems and it is an indication of a minimalist approach that can play roles in the classroom. Osler and Starkey [6] argue that civic education reflects a maximal approach aimed at ensuring that learners are prepared to take on the role of a mature and responsible global citizen.

Civic education to promote global insight is indispensable for students as young citizens. Agbaria [7] emphasizes the prominence of global education to build worldwide citizens' insight in the global era. The young generation will face a new world order. Their daily contacts include individuals of different ethnic, gender, language, race, and socioeconomic backgrounds. They will experience some serious problems such as health, injustice, environmental damage, population explosion, transnational migration, ethnic nationalism, and nation degradation. All citizens, regardless of the place of birth, have the right to education. However, young citizens who successfully finish their educational stages in the 21st century must be equipped with the attitudes, knowledge, and skills they need to become competent, responsible and humane citizens.

Research conducted by Bourke et al. [6] shows that high-conscious learners tend to be reliable, more careful, meticulous, responsible, well organized, achievement-oriented and aware citizens. Those with high friendliness are generally considered kind, flexible, cooperative, caring, polite, confident and tolerant. The experiences gained by learners can be a provision to improve the personality as a world citizen. Similar research by Gainous and Martens [8] also proves that civic education has proved effective in building the political competence and democratic as well as responsible young citizens.

To build global insight of young citizens, civic education emphasizes the development of learners in order to have the attitude and willingness to interact with others based on the principles of maintaining the dignity of human beings as the noblest creature. There are two principles that underlie moral values that must be instilled in every citizen, namely sympathy and respect. Sympathy is a value and attitude of a person to always care of others, especially in conditions that are worse than ours. Respect is interpreted as a person's ability to keep him/herself from acts that can harm or disrupt the others' rights [9]. Thus, the

development of civic education should emphasize the aspects of knowledge, values, and attitudes and generate global respect and empathy, beyond the boundaries of the nation and state.

The description has been revealed as the reason why the importance of global citizenship values needs to be introduced to students through civic education. Curriculum changes in Indonesia for secondary education alter the substance or scope of the study of civic education in schools. The success of civic education in developing the citizenship ability is influenced by several important factors such as the quality of the learning process, the professionalism of the teacher, and the learning facilities. One of the learning facilities used to achieve educational goals is a student's book.

The enactment of 2013 Curriculum for several ready-to-implement schools is accompanied by the use of student's book prepared by the Government of the Republic of Indonesia through the Ministry of Education and Culture. The textbooks that have been prepared by the government include student's book and teacher's resource book. 2013 Curriculum completely emphasizes on generating character and culture values to early age education. The learning focus is not only on the subject matter but also on the introduction of character values. The values introduced to learners are those of both national citizenship and global citizenship. Therefore, it is necessary to analyze the student's book of Pancasila and Civic Education. Has the development of global citizenship values been contained in the student's book for grade XII using 2013 Curriculum?

II. RESEARCH METHOD

This study is content analysis research. The unit of the analysis in this study was the content of the student's book used in the subject of Civic Education for grade XII using 2013 Curriculum. The data collection was done by taking notes (note-taking) through reading and observing the content of the student's book of civic education for grade XII based on predetermined categorization. The main data in this study were words, sentences, discourses, questions, figures, tables, and learning tasks in the student's book of civic education for grade XII which have been used in schools which have implemented 2013 Curriculum. The content analysis was qualitatively done using a coding technique on global citizenship values contained in the student's book for grade XII in Civic Education both verbal (words, phrases, discourse) and visual displays (figures) that convey the meaning of global citizenship values.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The student's book of Pancasila and Civic Education analyzed in this research is used by learners for grade XII using 2013 Curriculum published by the Ministry of Education and Culture of

the Republic of Indonesia in 2015. This book consists of 7 (seven) chapters; each chapter contains cases of human rights violations in the perspective of Pancasila, management of state finances and judicial authority, development of central and regional authority management in actualizing the goals of the Republic of Indonesia, denial of the citizens' obligations, Indonesia's roles in international relations, Indonesia's strategies in solving the threat to the state, and dynamics of state administration in the context of NKRI (Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia) and federal states.

Each chapter is analyzed in terms of what global citizenship values are contained and what the most dominant citizenship value in the student's book is. Regarding the analysis, there are 19 global citizenship values in the student's book of civic education for grade XII using 2013 Curriculum. The global citizenship values are social justice and equity, respect for diversity, environmental care and sustainable development, globalization and interdependence, peace and conflict, critical thinking, ability to argue critically, ability to tackle injustice and inequalities, respect for others, cooperation and conflict resolution, sense of identity and self-esteem, empathy and sense of humanity, respect for diversity, inequalities and social justice, care, personal responsibility and global interconnectedness, self-awareness, intercultural communication, and global knowledge.

The global citizenship values in the students' book of civic education for grade XII are in the form of both material descriptions and assignment descriptions. Each value which is learnt is based on the topic in each chapter, so that it may appear as the dominant value in the chapter. However in another chapter it may not appear at all. Overall, citizenship values have appeared in every chapter or topic. Regarding the analysis of each chapter in the student's book of civic education for grade XII, it shows that global citizenship values are complete enough. Among the 19 global citizenship values in the student's book, the most dominant one is the ability to argue critically.

The values of global citizenship which rarely appear in the students' book of civic education for grade XII are care, personal responsibility and global interconnectedness, and a sense of identity and self-esteem. Although they rarely appear in the descriptions of the student's book, such citizenship values remain an important part that citizens need to develop and possess. The global citizenship values that exists in the students' book of civic education for grade XII is also influenced by the basic competencies that will be developed into teaching materials. If the basic competencies to be developed have relevance to global citizenship, such as

Indonesia's roles in international relations, the values of global citizenship will frequently appear.

The global citizenship values in the students' book of civic education for grade XII are essential to be developed in the global era. The civic education developed in the global era should be able to improve good citizens and global insight. This is in line with the Banks's statement [2] which states that a redefinition of civic education in the global era of the 21st century is needed to be able to effectively educate students to be citizens who can contribute their best roles. Furthermore, to succeed the reformation of civic education, there must be a worldwide shift from academic knowledge to transformative academic knowledge.

Citizens need to possess global insight and to be able to interact as well as to communicate with other citizens in the world. The global citizenship values need to be developed and taught by teachers through civic education learning in the classroom. Teachers should be able to improve and apply learning methods that enable the values of global citizenship to be internalized to the learners. Learning methods to be applied in civic learning are dialogical-critical learning methods, direct experiences, collaborative, and problem based learning. Problem-based learning methods are aptly applied in civic learning to enhance the understanding of citizenship concepts. It is supported by the results of the research conducted by Muhson [10] showing that the implementation of problem-based learning methods can improve the students' understanding of the concepts which are studied.

The global citizenship values in the students' book of civic education for grade XII become an important part that needs to be developed in civic learning in order to build good citizens with knowledge and global insight. The dimension of global citizenship can be developed through civic learning in schools to build the worldwide insight of young citizens. To develop the global dimensions of citizenship, students practice and study with teachers and friends. Through the practices, the students are expected to be smart citizens and to possess good characters.

The global citizenship values found in the student's book are in line with those developed by Oxfam [11] who describes three key elements in the development of global citizenship education. The key aspects developed to build responsible global citizens are knowledge and understanding, skills, and values and attitudes. These three key elements serve as a foundation in the development of a global citizenship education curriculum.

Global knowledge and understanding are essential for a responsible global citizen. The knowledge and understanding developed in global citizenship education include several important issues such as

social justice and honesty, diversity, globalization and interdependence, sustainable development, peace and conflict, and skills. Global citizens also need to have skills to play roles effectively in a global life. The skills developed in the global citizenship education curriculum include critical thinking, abilities to argue effectively, abilities to fight injustice and inequality, respect for others, cooperation, and conflict resolution.

Values and attitudes are developed to promote good global citizens. Global citizens to be established through global citizenship education are not only smart and skilled citizens but also well-behaved citizens. The values and attitudes developed in the curriculum of global citizenship education include sense of identity and self-esteem, empathy, commitment to social justice and honesty, respect for diversity, environmental care, commitment to sustainable development, and beliefs that people can create an innovation.

Some of the global citizenship values in the student's book are similar to those in Morais and Ogden's research [12] which states that there are at least three dimensions of global citizenship that are often referred to in various literatures. Each dimension of global citizenship can be described into more detailed global citizenship values. The dimensions of global citizenship include social responsibility, global competence, and engagement in global citizenship. Social responsibility is understood as a level of awareness of interdependence and social awareness to others, society and environment. Moreover, global competence can be interpreted as the ability to be open-minded and to actively understand others' cultural norms. Also it is expected to be able to apply the knowledge they possess to interact, communicate and work effectively. Engagement in global citizenship can be interpreted as an act and/ or tendency to recognize social problems at local, regional, national, and global levels and to respond through actions such as volunteerism, political activity and community participation.

Civic learning in schools encourages students to participate responsibly in evaluating social issues and identifying cases or examples of global injustices and inequalities. The problems that arise in the global era are complex. Therefore, students practice to possess the ability or skills in identifying and resolving emerging global issues. Students practice to respect differences and to build social service ethics to address global and local issues. They understand the correlation between local behaviors and global consequences. In addition, students should be aware that in the global era they will meet and communicate with others who have different backgrounds. The difference is not merely in terms of culture that exists in one country, but it has crossed the boundaries of the country (transnational).

As a global citizen, students practice to have an indispensable social responsibility in the globalization. The aspects of social responsibility provide three sub-dimensions, each of which can be developed in civic learning at school [12]. The three sub-dimensions include global inequalities and justice, empathy and care, personal responsibility and global interconnectedness. The dimension of global inequality and equity can be developed by evaluating students on social issues and identifying cases and examples of global injustices and inequalities. A rapid economic development in developed countries is able to improve people's welfare. The economies of leading countries continue to grow and flourish leaving the economies of developing countries behind. On the one hand, economic progress is able to improve people's prosperity. However, there is an imbalance between the leading and developing countries. This inequality becomes a part of the global issues that needs to be solved.

Empathy and caring can be learned by respecting diverse perspectives and enhancing social service ethics to address global and local issues. The decline of empathy and social concern is a fundamental issue that needs to be resolved. Empathy is the ability to feel what others experience. Students with high empathy will usually care about the suffering or sadness of a friend. Encouraging students to have empathy requires a long learning process through habituation. Therefore, civic education has a strategic role in fostering a sense of empathy among students.

In addition to empathy, students also need to develop altruism towards others. Life in the increasingly individualistic and materialistic global era often causes students to be out of touch with their peers. Students are more concerned with their own business and often ignore their peers' interests. In Indonesia, indifference is unacceptable as it defies the deeply rooted virtues and characteristics of the nation that relies on the spirit of cooperation among its people. Therefore, civic education has an important role in maintaining and developing the spirit of altruism and its values through classroom learning for the next Indonesian generation in local, national, and global contexts.

Personal responsibility and global interconnectedness can be learned by understanding the relationship between local behaviors and global consequences. Students must understand that their behaviors no longer only have impacts on changes occurring on the local scale, as they also play a broader role on the global scale. In order to be ready and engage in such challenges, it is imperative that they have a strong sense of personal responsibility that is based on carefully thought rational considerations.

The developed civic education learning should be able to develop students' personal responsibilities. For

instance, students are given various problems or cases to solve. Teachers are able to implement a dialogical-critical learning. In this learning, students' responsibilities are encouraged and developed. In addition, all behaviors performed, both on local and global scales, must be highly considered. It is necessary because any behavior performed will provide consequences. In short, students must be prepared to take the risks that arise as a result of the behavior that has been done.

Another dimension of the citizenship values is global competence. Global competence can be interpreted as the ability to have an open mind and active efforts in understanding other people of different cultural norms, and to use their knowledge to interact, communicate, and work effectively with others. To face a rapidly changing global world, students need to have global competencies which can be developed through civic education learning in schools. This is crucial because students, as young citizens, have great opportunities to learn and to practice developing a global understanding.

Students with global competence recognize limitations they possess and try to engage in intercultural meetings. They are able to show their interest and knowledge related to the issues and events that occur in the world. In addition, they can demonstrate a variety of intercultural communication skills and perform the ability to engage in diverse intercultural meetings. The dimension of global competence can be developed in civic education learning using critical thinking approach. Besides, it has three sub-dimensions, namely self-awareness, intercultural communication, and global knowledge. These values also appear in the students' book of civic education for grade XII.

The value of self-awareness can be developed by providing explanations to students to realize their own limitations and the ability to engage in intercultural meetings. It is necessary for them because students as part of the world citizens will meet or come into contact with other cultures. Furthermore, the countries in the world have very diverse cultures. Regarding this, the students need to develop their self-awareness that they have limitations. One of the limitations is the students' ability to directly engage in intercultural meetings. It is because she/he cannot possibly involve in all intercultural meetings. To overcome this problem, cultures of the countries in the world can be learned through classroom learning.

Civic education has an important role to introduce the world's cultural diversity. Through civic education, students develop their self-awareness that the diversity existing in the world is not to be contradicted. The cultural differences that exist in the world must be respected and tolerated. However students have limitations to directly study all the cultures that exist in the world. In civic learning,

students are able to enhance their awareness related to their limitations.

The value of intercultural communication can be indicated by students who are able to demonstrate intercultural communication skills and perform the ability to engage in intercultural meetings. Through intercultural meetings, art and culture can easily cross the boundaries. Moreover, culture of a country can easily enter and spread in other countries. In order to be accepted by other countries, an intercultural communication is necessary. An intercultural communication needs to be done so that what is coming does not conflict on culture that exists in a country. Besides, understanding different cultures from the other countries can foster a spirit of mutual respect for differences.

Through civic education, students' skills are explored to be able to communicate another countries' culture. Also, intercultural communication skills of students can be developed through the development of a contextual civic learning. Through the communication, students can learn directly Indonesia's culture. It is considered that Indonesia as a country with abundant cultural wealth becomes the main attraction for other countries' citizens to come and to learn Indonesia's culture.

The students can improve the value of global knowledge through showing interest and knowledge related to the issues and events that occur in the world. Events that occur in a country, very easily and quickly, become a major issue in other countries. The advancement of the Internet makes it easier for students to browse and discover the latest actual issues that happen in other countries. In fact, the tendency that occurs in a country influences the lives of people in other countries. For instance, a trend like life style can easily affect young citizens' life.

Students can take advantage from advances in the Internet technology that can be exploited to develop global knowledge. They can learn economics, politics, history, technology, and other sciences with the help of the Internet. Civic education can take advantage of technological advances, such as the Internet, to develop students' global understanding. The civic learning that presents global issues can attract the students' attention to learn citizenship. The world issues such as supremacy of human rights and eradication of corruption can provide interesting themes for civic learning.

The other value contained in students' book of civic education for grade XII is engagement in global citizenship. Engagement in global citizenship can be interpreted as an act and / or tendency to recognize social problems at the local, regional, national, and global levels as well as to respond through actions such as volunteerism, political activity and community participation. Students as young citizens need to develop their ability to engage and to actively

participate in identifying and resolving emerging global issues.

Civic engagement is an important element of social capital. Social capital in schools has not contributed significantly to improve the quality of education. Yet every school has a strong social capital to improve the quality of education. The social capital that can be developed in schools includes mutual trust, networking, and norms/ rules [13]. Moreover, civic engagement has a very close relationship with citizens' political participation [14,15]. Participation skills in life locally, nationally, or globally can be improved through civic education in schools.

The global citizenship engagement can be described in three main values, namely participation in social organization, political aspirations, and global citizen activities. Students are able to develop the engagement in a civic organization by contributing voluntarily to work or to assist global civil society. The global civil society is growing and evolving along with the global problems emerging in various countries around the world. The organization helps the government solve global issues experienced in almost every country. The global civil society is various, such as those engaging in the environment, human rights, eradication of corruption, education, poverty alleviation, health, and others. Regarding this, students may select certain fields according to the ability to engage or to contribute voluntarily in a global civil society.

The value of political aspirations of students can be developed by synthesizing global knowledge and experience in the public domain. Students can practice and learn to convey their political aspirations through civic learning. The aspirations can be in the form of criticism of public policies issued by the government. Besides, the student's global experience can be used as a medium to develop political aspirations.

The value of the global citizens' activities can be developed by performing beneficial behaviors that can advance the global agenda. It is known that there are several global issues that need to get serious attention from global citizens. The global issues include poverty and global inequality, environment and global warming, food crisis, terrorism, human rights and corruption eradication. These issues are the urgent global agenda for immediate realization. As a result, students are expected to take advantage of opportunities to participate in the success of the global agenda. Through global citizens' activities, students can play a role both locally and globally.

The values of global citizenship that have been described, if it is carefully examined, are an important part that cannot be separated in civic learning. Through civic learning, students are equipped with various abilities and skills as young citizens. The skills such as social responsibility, competence as a

global citizen, and involvement in political activity are important parts to develop. In order to accomplish citizens' life skills as mentioned above, civic learning needs to be conducted and developed using appropriate approaches and learning strategies.

Teachers play an important role in selecting and determining an appropriate learning strategy so that global citizenship values are able to be understood and well internalized by the students. Furthermore, teachers have an influence on the moral actions of the students, especially in a civic learning in the classroom. Supporting this, the results of research conducted by Marzuki and Feriandi (2016, pp. 193-206) indicate that there is a positive and significant correlation between teacher's roles in civic learning and moral actions of the students. In other words, if the role of the teacher is excellent, the moral actions of students will also be better. The teachers' roles in teaching that can affect students' moral actions include motivating, directing, initiating, informing, evaluating, and facilitating.

IV. CONCLUSIONS

Regarding the discussion of the research, the citizenship values in the student's book of Pancasila and civic education of grade XII are social justice and equity, respect for diversity, environmental care and sustainable development, globalization and interdependence, peace and conflict, critical thinking, ability to argue critically, ability to tackle injustice and inequalities, respect for others, cooperation and conflict resolution, sense of identity and self-esteem, empathy and sense of humanity, respect for diversity, inequalities and social justice, care, personal responsibility and global interconnectedness, self-awareness, intercultural communication, and global knowledge. The most dominant global citizenship value in each chapter is the ability to argue critically. This is the most dominant value of global citizenship in each chapter, especially in the unit discussing Indonesia's roles in international relations.

REFERENCES

- [1] Kim, B. J., Kavanaugh, A. L., & Hult, K. M. (2011). Civic engagement and internet use in local governance: hierarchical linear models for understanding the role of local community groups. *Administration & Society*, 43 (7), 807-835.
- [2] Banks, J. A. (2008). Diversity, group identity, and citizenship education in a global age. *Educational Researcher*, 37 (3), 129-139.
- [3] Branson, M.S. (Ed.). (1999). *Belajar civic education dari Amerika*. (Translated by Syafruddin, et al.) Yogyakarta: Lembaga Kajian Islam dan Sosial (LKIS) dan The Asia Foundation (TAF).
- [4] Titus, C. (1999). Civic education untuk pemahaman global. Dalam M.S. Branson, et al. (Penyunting), *Belajar civic education dari Amerika* (hlm. 131-140), alih bahasa Syafruddin, M.Y. Alimi, & M. N. Khoiron. Yogyakarta: LKIS and The Asia Foundation (TAF).
- [5] Parker, W.C., Ninomiya, A., & Cogan, J. (1999). Educating world citizens: toward multinational curriculum development. *American Educational Research Journal*, 36 (2), 117-145.

- [6] Bourke, L., Bamber, P., & Lyons, M. (2012). Global citizens: who are they?. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice*, 7 (2), 161-174.
- [7] Agbaria, A. K. (2011). The social studies education discourse community on globalization: exploring the agenda of preparing for the global age. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 15 (1), 57-74.
- [8] Gainous, J. & Martens, M. (2012). The effectiveness of civic education: are “good” teachers actually good for “all” students?. *American Politics Research*, 40 (2), 232-266.
- [9] Zamroni. (2007). *Pendidikan dan demokrasi dalam transisi: prakondisi menuju era globalisasi*. Jakarta: PSAP Muhammadiyah.
- [10] Muhson, A. (2009). Peningkatan minat belajar dan pemahaman mahasiswa melalui penerapan *problem based learning*. *Jurnal Kependidikan*. 39 (2), 171-182.
- [11] Oxfam (2006). *Education for global citizenship: a guide for schools*. Oxford: Oxfam Development Education.
- [12] Morais, D.B. & Ogden, A.C. (2011). Initial development and validation of the global citizenship scale. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 15 (5), 445-446.
- [13] Hanum, F., Rahmadonna, S. & Ayriza, Y. (2016). Modal sosial yang dikembangkan guru di sekolah berkualitas di Yogyakarta. *Jurnal Kependidikan*, 46 (2), 233.245.
- [14] Milner, H. (2002). *Civic literacy: how informed citizens make democracy work*. Hanover: University Press of New England.
- [15] Mujani, S. (2007). *Muslim demokrat: Islam, budaya demokrasi, dan partisipasi politik di Indonesia pasca orde baru*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- [16] Marzuki & Feriandi, A.Y., (2016). Pengaruh peran guru PPKn dan pola asuh orang tua terhadap tindakan moral siswa. *Jurnal Kependidikan*, 46 (2), 193-206.