The Comparison of Professional Identity of Prospective Teachers between UPI Indonesia and UPSI Malaysia

Ilfiandra Ilfiandra, Riswanda Setiadi, Sumarto Sumarto
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia
Bandung, Indonesia
ilfiandra@upi.edu

Abstract—This study examined how prospective teachers develop their professional identity before living their professional life. Because the teacher professional identity is dynamics and change over the course of career, this study aims to describe the profile of the professional identity of prospective teachers in Indonesia (UPI) and Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris (UPSI) Malaysia. Multivariate test using Roy's Largest Root resulted in $F = 1.763$ and $p = 0.105$ so that the difference of professional identity and its aspects between the 1st, 3rd and 5th grade students in UPI, does not differ significantly on $\alpha = 0.100$. There is a significant difference between UPI and UPSI in all aspects as well as professional identity as a whole ($F = 78.047$ and $p = 1.447E-82$). The semester level distinguishes all aspects and total professional identity was $p < 0.100$. The difference occurred in the first semester students with the 5th and 3rd semesters with the 5th. Meanwhile, among students of the 1st semester with the third semester, they were not significantly different. Hence, there should be a serious effort made by both institutions to boost the upper level students to be more familiar with the teaching profession.

Keywords—professional identity; teacher education; prospective teachers

I. INTRODUCTION

The teacher personality with all its attributes has a small portion in the discourse on the quality of education and there is an impression that the discourse of the teachers is represented in the issues of competence and curriculum [1]. Professional identity is an interesting research topic which attracted the attention of many people [2]. Contemporary research of teacher education and teaching focuses on the interaction of the teacher as a person and a professional. This interaction is related to integration and interplay between the personal and social factors derived from the complex meaning of learning, the role of personal knowledge of teaching and the professional landscape [3].

Study in the area of teacher professional identity aims to develop a comprehensive understanding of how teachers perceive their profession [4]. Their perception begins with an initial conceptualization of “self” as a single, fixed and stable entity regardless of the external environment. However, this initial view has led to a number of challenges because it cannot explain the diversity and changes in behaviors in context. Consequently, researchers began to think about identity as something dynamic, changing gradually, active process that evolves over time through interaction with others [5].

Professional identity is defined in various ways in teaching and teacher education [6]. Professional identity in general refers to how teachers view themselves as a teacher based on the interpretation of interaction with the context. Kelchtermans mention that the formation of a professional identity through individual interaction and teacher social, structural and cultural conditions in the employment context [7]. Day et al. found a balance in three personal dimension (life outside school), professional dimension (social-legal expectations) and situational dimensions (stimulating work environment) in the formation of professional identity [8]. Most study on this topic is beyond the field of teaching and teacher education [9]. Studies of teacher professional identity, focused on the factors that influenced and developed professional identity of teachers [10], factors that correlate with professional identity in the form of working conditions [11]. A study by Hong, involving 84 teachers found that the teacher’s professional identity included commitment, values, knowledge and beliefs and micro politics [12].

The result of Fuller and Brown’s research showed that professional identity on “pre service teacher” tends to be vague whereas among “in-service teacher”, it is more concrete and practical [13]. Pre-service teacher began to establish their professional identity during the educational program that is supported by psychological factors such as values, commitment, efficacy, emotion, knowledge, belief and micro-politics. This professional identity will continue to establish through concrete experience and school experience.

In the context of teacher development, some authors such as Danielewicz in Leijen and Kullasepp criticized the practices at university level which are less concerned about the identity development [14,15]. To emphasize, Alsup suggests “overall, the role of the university teacher education program seems to be to provide knowledge about learning theories and pedagogical approach, not help the new teacher develop identity” [16]. Meanwhile, Alsup has indicated that the aspects of identity development tend to reduce the meaning restricted...
to professional individuality [16]. The price paid for this mistake is quite expensive in form of failure prospective teachers to enter the teaching profession [14]. The result of Fuller and Brown’s research showed that professional identity on “pre service teacher” tends to be vague whereas among “in service teacher”, it is more concrete and practical [13].

II. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The concept of identity has been studied by many disciplines such as philosophy, sociology, developmental psychology, social psychology, economics [17-21]. Due to construct identity involves a multidisciplinary, it is difficult to get a clear definition. The teachers’ professional identity is shaped through engagement and participation in communities of practice. Tanggaard termed it as boundary crossing which means participation of individuals in cross context to gain access for the expansion of professional and affirmation of personal position all the time [22]. Therefore, the constructed identity is the result of an individual’s participation in a community of practice and social interactions that shape and renegotiate identity. Hence, the identity is not static but affected by the intensity of involvement and specific participation in the community of practice.

The idea of identity is associated with the perspective of symbolic interaction. In this case, professional identities constructed and maintained through interaction and negotiate role in specific context [4]. Therefore, teachers who shared their experience in teaching profession and education of pre-position that are trained and introduce to the teaching practice will establish a professional identity as a teacher in relation to interaction. In addition to the relationship aspect of identity, also need to consider aspects of development of the professional identity that develops over time. Beijaard’s research, by reviewing 22 studies of professional identity finds not enough evidence to formulate a definition and a core component of professional identity of teachers are generally acceptable [6]. However, Kelchtermans have tried to identify the core components of professional identity of teachers which include self-image [7], self-esteem, motivation, perception tasks and future perspectives, while Lasky, identify factors that shape identity such as commitment, knowledge, beliefs, values, emotional health and sensitivity [23].

Trans-national studies show that the professional identity of teachers is the key factor to motivation, effectiveness and retention of teachers [12]. The reason is that the “self” is a crucial factor in constructing a way to interact with the environment and professional decision making in the context. Watson states that “professional action is doing professional identity” [12]. Therefore, to understand the professional identity of teachers, it needs to search the essentials aspect of professional life such as decision making, motivation, satisfaction, emotions and commitment.

According to Kelchtermans professional identity is shaped through individual interaction and context [7]. Internal and external influences will effect teachers’ perception on themselves as a teacher [24]. Professional identity of teachers is a result satisfaction in work interaction, commitment occupation, self-efficacy, and motivation that can be seen as constructed professional identity [8], in several of literatures constitute antecedent toward teachers’ behavior [25]. These four indicators can be evaluated as an important element in personal life and teacher career. The study of professional identity of teachers should focus on study combine indicator and avoid study indicator individually.

III. RESEARCH METHOD

A. Approach

The research method in use will be a survey that aims to describe the attitudes, opinions, behaviors or characteristics of the subjects with a cross-sectional design of comparative group type [26]. Cross-sectional design is selected for the sake of data collection at the same time (at one point in time) from all subjects and then compared with countries (group comparison). Quantitative research approach is used because it is based on the philosophy of positivism that sees a single observable and measurable phenomenon.

B. Participants

The research data were taken from the students of semesters 1 (322), 3 (449), and 5 (69) in UPSI as many as 849 people and 1st (102), 3rd (107), and 5th (112) semester in UPI as many as 385 people. Research participant selected by a non-probability sampling technique on a voluntary basis.

C. Data Collection

The instrument is an adaptation of Professional Identity Scale developed by Tan Chin Pei in form of semantic differential scale (1-10) [27]. Instruments measure five dimensions of professional identity that includes: knowledge about professional practice, experience with the profession, having the professional as role model, professional self-efficacy, and preference for a particular profession with 30 items.

D. Data Analysis

The measurement of professional identity of prospective students will be carried out on data interval scale. The data analysis begins with the assumption of a specific test is required to identify differences in the professional identity of teacher prospective students in total and per dimension, through normality test, frequency distribution and homogeneity of variance. The normality test result used the technique of 1-sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov. Testing homogeneity of variance between the UPI and UPSI uses statistical Levene test. Since the test results in the form of parametric statistical assumptions of normality and homogeneity of variance will be measured, the data analyzed by statistical parametric form as one way technique ANOVA and MANOVA.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Result

1) Trend of prospective students’ professional development: Development of the professional identity of the
students as a whole (Code 6) as well as the aspects (Code 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5 respectively are knowledge, role-model, experience, efficacy, and preference) in UPI shows the following pattern.

![Fig. 1](image1)

Note: Series 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 6 are knowledge, role model, experience, efficacy, professional preference, and professional identity respectively.

In general it appears that the development of professional identity of prospective teachers in UPI in total and its aspects, tend to decrease. That is, the longer the study period is, the lower the professional identity will be. Meanwhile, the development of professional identity of prospective teachers at UPSI shows a slightly different pattern from Indonesian trend, as presented below.

![Fig. 2](image2)

B. Discussion

Data analysis shows that there are differences of professional identity of prospective teachers from UPI and UPSI, either totally or per aspect based on semester. Discussion of research findings focused on three things: the complexity of professional identity constructs, professional identity correlates or predictors, and the dynamics of professional identity dimensions. The discussion begins with the interpretation of research findings related to the complexity of the meaning of professional identity. Research on the education of prospective teachers is still limited [28]. The professional identity has been a separate research area in the last few decades [9]. The professional identity is at the core of the teaching profession [29]. The majority of research on professional identity focuses on middle and high school teachers [30]. Due to the limitations of literature and professional identity research on prospective teachers, more references use the teacher’s professional identity.

Learning to be a teacher is a long journey that requires knowledge and skills. The diffusion of educational theories studied cannot ensure that students are able to internalize their knowledge and learning experiences [31]. Students entering the educational program must have had a belief system, disposition, attitude formed when they were in high school positions. This process of enculturation does not go smoothly even can give birth to conflict [28]. Teacher identity plays an important war in management and education systems. Even more impact than technology, curriculum, and school design. Identity is the core of prospective teacher learning [32].
Identity plays a special role in the teaching profession compared to other professions [33].

The prospective student perspectives of teaching profession have an important role in teacher education [34]. The establishment of professional identity is a long and complex process that is full of challenges and problems [35]. This process takes place in a cultural context involving personal, social, cultural, political, professional, and global factors. Pre-service teacher education programs need a comprehensive review in the context of professional plans [36]. In Vygotskian's view, the general purpose of teacher education is the development of professional identity. University education should help transition the formation of professional identity [37]. Identity deconstructed and reconstructed biographical context, pre-service programs and school culture [38].

Bullough emphasizes the importance of educational programs in shaping the professional identity of pre-service teachers through the expression “teacher identity” - what beginning teachers believe about teaching and learning and self-as-a teacher is vital concern to teacher education; it is the basis for meaning and making decision. Teacher education must begin, then, by exploring the teaching self [39]. Therefore, teacher education programs play an important role in the formation of professional identity and improve teaching practices, awareness building on the importance of emotions and encourage pre-service teachers to reflect on the formation of their professional identity. A thorough understanding of identity will contribute to the development of educational programs for prospective teachers [40]. The curriculum materials in the learning method can support the process of learning and development of identity within the framework of effective teaching [41].

The differences of identity of prospective teachers in UPSI and UPSI is a necessity and not in the context of superiority because many variables can explain. The lesson that can be taken is why professional identity of UPSI prospective teacher students is more fluid than UPSI. There is no single answer to its findings. The most logical explanation is the interpretation of identity is a reflection of the personal domain as well as professional. Professional identity is a social construct of the interaction of a number of factors, such as subjective experience and self-assessment, and professional identity is not something that is stable [42-44]. The construction of professional identity of prospective teachers negotiates with the identity of friends, students and teaching experience.

By definition, Beijaard, Meijer, and Verloop suggests that professional identity involves four characteristics [9]. First, unstable. People are constantly able to interpret and re-interpret the self-experience, especially those associated with the inspiring factor of becoming a teacher. Second, the application of professional experience should be corrected in the interaction between the individual and the task context through negotiation and compromise. Third, the construction process of professional identity must be in line with self-examination and professional experience justification. Finally, the part of the professional identity is formed through an interpretation of past experiences and beliefs. The idea of identity refers to how individuals negotiate and reflect emotionally on the expectations of professionals who are full of social and cultural content. Thus, medium, context and identity will affect professional identity.

A study by Fuller & Brown show that professional identity in 'pre service teacher' tends to be vague (vague) on the contrary in in-service teacher more concrete and practical [13]. Pre-service teachers begin to establish their professional identity during educational programs supported by psychological factors in the form of values, commitment, efficacy, emotion, knowledge and beliefs and micropolitics. This professional identity will continue to form through concrete experience and school experience. Negotiation of professional identity is influenced by self-contextual factors and pre-service education [45]. Research on pre-service students shows that half of them choose the teaching profession because of the noble work and fit the personality and as the ideal profession [46]. Being a teacher is highly valued personality in society and teaching is the noblest and most unique profession [47].

Masoumpnah and Zarei argue that teaching experience during education is one of the primary factors affecting the professional identity of the teacher and the belief in his/her competence [48]. Part of professional identity associated with self-concept. Professional identity involves individual self-concept and reinterpretation of professional experience. Professional identity is a social construction of the interaction of a number of factors, such as subjective experience and self-assessment, and professional identity is not something that is stable [42-44]. The construction of professional identity of prospective teachers negotiates with the identity of friends, students and teaching experience. Although within the framework of supervision of collaboration between individual elements, the majority of conflicts are resolved constructively for the benefit of the development of professional identities.

Although a teacher belongs to a similar profession, it will still differ on personal attributes that may affect professional identity. The personal attributes in question are the reasons for being a teacher, educational experience, educational beliefs, and educational vision. The reasons for choosing an educator profession are generally divided into intrinsic, extrinsic, and altruistic [49], or professional or material reasons [50]. Research Sinclair et al., posited a positive relationship between the reasons for choosing a teacher profession with student occupational commitment and efficacy level [51]. Beijaard's research shows that the duration of field experience during education affects professional identity [6]. The professional identity may change during education along with the student's learning experience.

Professional identity is a dynamic process that involves interpretation, reinterpretation, and self-evaluation of life experiences [52]. Personal beliefs about education may also affect professional identity as it will affect perceptions and actions as a teacher even though there has been little research supporting them. For beginner teachers, educational beliefs will be the driving force for teachers to work as they should or whether the teacher is a suitable profession for themselves. Other attributes that also need to be explored in conjunction with professional identity are teacher appointments as the
The professional identity of teachers is influenced by a number of factors and historically, contextually and socially constructed [54,55]. Friesen and Besley suggest that teachers who have had a good personal identity cycle seem more ready to construct a professional identity that is a developmental and socio-psychological process [56]. Job factors will affect the content of professional identity if consistent with teacher knowledge and belief [57]. And the atmosphere of democracy and the opportunity for dialogue allows teachers to test different types of ideology [58]. However, the professional identity of most teachers becomes implicit and random after entering the workforce. Little teachers connect professional identity with defined professional norms. Teacher tendency to help professional identity in a unique way and is local [59]. Therefore, school or regional effects are often considered substantial for professional identities. If the school can guide the teacher in the process of change, the professional identity of the teacher will be transformed in a positive direction.

The research results show that teachers' perceptions of the profession and how teachers want others to accept their work have an effect on the firmness of the identity and how the teachers interpret the work experience, such as motivation, efficacy, commitment and job satisfaction [8,60]. Furthermore, the professional identity of teachers affects cognitive and affective involvement in experience, and the cognitive and affective responses to experience and influence the construction of professional identity [61]. When the professional identity of the teacher involves pedagogy, the management of negative emotions caused by external pressure becomes easier for the teacher [62]. Teacher effectiveness, professional development, acceptance of reforms may also affect the professional identity of teachers [4,48]. The focus of internal control, the level of job satisfaction, the motivation of perceptions affect the professional identity [63]. Other influencing factors are teachers' perceptions of social status, gender, professional background, position, and school location [64].

V. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Data show that the professional identity of prospective teachers in UPSI is higher than the prospective teachers in UPI. The learning path of professional identity of prospective teachers at UPSI shows a linear trend, while in UPI tends to be transitory. Sources of difference in learning trajectory and professional identity of prospective teachers UPI and UPSI comes from the configuration of personal and professional factors. However, in the context of cross-learning experience, the comparison of professional identity of prospective teachers with UPSI can be an entrance for UPI teacher education improvement which is still rarely benchmarked against teacher education dimension that reaches intra-psychological dimension. The professional identity of prospective teachers is a complex and dynamic phenomenon. Due to the strong influence of the context, the process of interpretation and reinterpretation of the personal and professional experiences of teacher students should be continued in order to form the professional identity of students who are fluid teachers. The influence of pre-service education in the establishment of professional identity of prospective teachers still needs further testing. Because professional identity is instable, the effort to strengthen the identity of the professional identity of the prospective teacher needs to be done simultaneously through the teacher's educational design that accommodates the intra-psychological dynamics of prospective teachers with the context of professional duties.

REFERENCES


