Asian Immigrants: a Literature Review of Identity and English Learning

Yan Hai
School of Foreign Languages
Northwest University
Xi'an, China 710127

Ya Fang
School of Foreign Languages
Northwest University
Xi'an, China 710127

Abstract—The English learning experience of Asian immigrants is very much affected by their experience of identity conflict/shift, and power relations. A situated perspective would bring a clearer picture of how they learn English and why they do not reach certain level of proficiency.

Keywords—identity; English learning; Asian immigrants; power

I. INTRODUCTION

This paper reviews theories and research on ethnic, racial, national, gendered identity of immigrants and focuses on the question of how the dynamics of identity formation among Asian immigrants in English-speaking environment influence their English learning experience. A social perspective is utilized for it allows for better understanding how they experience identity conflict/shift and correlation between identity and second language learning outcome.

II. ETHNIC IDENTITY/NATIONAL IDENTITY/RACIAL IDENTITY

In this part, ethnic identity and national identity towards the host country are to be compared and discussed in terms of how they affect an immigrant’s psychological health and adaptation outcome.

Ethnic identity: Ethnic identity is about the sense of self, group membership, shared values, attitudes towards one’s ethnic group, the commitment, the ethnic language and religion, and the place of origin, common ancestor, and so on (Phinney, et al 2001). It evolves and changes, starting from childhood through adolescence by means of exploring and socializing, and adolescent individuals may or may not have an achieved ethnic identity at the end of adolescence (Phinney, et al 2001).

Phinney, et al (2001) found that ethnic identity tends to be strong when an individual immigrant has a strong desire to retain one’s ethnic culture and when the hosting society is more accepting of his or her ethnic group. They also found that the immigration policy of the host country and supportiveness of the ethnic community might affect the determination in reserving heritage culture.

John Widdup Berry’s acculturation model (Phinney, et al, 2001) proposes four possible adaptation strategies: integration is the strategy when an individual immigrant wants not only to reserve their ethnic identity, but to integrate into the host society; assimilation indicates retaining one’s cultural heritage is less important than to be included within the host society; if one regards one’s own cultural heritage as more significant than developing relationships with the receiving society, one applies the separation strategy; marginalization happens when one considers both maintaining one’s heritage and becoming a part of the host society as unworthy.

Berry’s acculturation theory posited that strong ethnic identity serves as a positive contribution to one’s self-esteem; psychological well-beings of ethnic group members are generally believed to be closely related to ethnic identity status and identification level with the larger society; among the four acculturation strategies, integration results in most positive psychological outcomes and marginalization is the least adaptive strategy.

Phinney, et al. (2001) found that “local circumstance” (p. 500) determines significantly, referring to the density of ethnic group population, family and peer relationship, and supportiveness among group members. Parental socialization with in-group ethnic members is critically important in influencing children’s identification with their own ethnic group.

Phinney and Ong (2007) found that the age at the time of immigrating is also a variable in adaptation outcomes. First generation immigrants have less positive adaptation than second/third generation does. Other measurable components include self-identification, commitment, exploration, ethnic behaviors; self-identification is the first step to find out one’s group membership; commitment, refers to a strong affection to and investment in the heritage group and strong commitments do not necessarily result in a confident ethnic identity; exploration is very important in the process of ethnic identity formation, the experience they get during exploration may decide or secure their strength of commitment; ethnic behaviors, the actions like speaking the ethnic language or eating the ethnic food, generally reflect one’s ethnic identity, but are external manifestation which may not be in accordance with one’s internal actual ethnic identity.
Phinney and Ong (2007) also noted other components of ethnic identity including attitudes towards one’s ethnic group and values. Pride and feeling comfortable about one’s ethnic group is an indicator variable of having achieved ethnic identity. An immigrant with negative attitudes towards their own group are inclined to assimilate, while with a confident ethnic identity, one may learn to reject negative stereotypical perception toward his or her ethnic group. Attitude can be an independent component because one can be very committed, but has negative attitudes towards one’s ethnic group. Value is a very important reference to understand one’s closeness to an ethnic group, but it is difficult to measure it because it varies within the ethnic group.

National Identity: National identity refers to the feeling of belonging and attitude to the receiving country. The national identity of immigrants is an indispensable subject in understanding their ethnic identity. The two identities are not always negatively correlated (Phinney and Ong, 2007). National identity together with ethnic identity influences an immigrant’s psychological well-beings and adaptation outcomes.

The national identity has a stronger impact on immigrants’ school adjustment and performance than their ethnic identity does. Phinney et al. (2001) hypothesized that it may because schools are the institutional places where assimilation pressure weights in. The relationship between ethnic identity and national identity can be independently positively or negatively related (Phinney and Ong, 2007). The correlation between the two identities defers among different ethnic groups.

Racial Identity: Ethnic and racial identity both refers to sense of belongings and learning process about a group; research on both identities considers about cultural behavior, values, attitudes towards one’s own group, and attitudes towards discrimination. Racial identity is studied more about the response to racism and internalized racism, while ethnic identity is researched more on one’s sense of belongings, heritage cultures, values, and language.

Hampton and Duncan’s (2011) study found that race is the sorting principle that people follow in a society in order to be included in or excluded from certain groups. They asserted that racial identity affects the formation of social network, thus determines how much and what kind of social capital (Bourdieu, 1986) one may access and possess, which consequently affects the extent of personal growth and social mobility. Thus, “racial homophily” (p. 478) is one of greatest force affecting people’s choice of network.

Racial identity and racial stratification produce and reproduce each other. Racial relations may decide trust relations of people from different race, and hence certain social distance may be created and reinforced, and thus the access to social capital can be very much limited for racially different individuals. Trust “binds” (Hampton & Duncan, 2011, p.478) members within a social network and is of significance for social capital to be shared among group members. Therefore, racial identity does impact “network formation patterns” through the power of trust (p. 478). Compared with class, gender, religion, and educational attainment status, race is the number one force in shaping network pattern, which affects who gets access to social resources and opportunities.

Gendered Identity: Gender is relatively central for it is closely related to ideas and values. Gender inequality serves as a major topic in talking about gendered identity. Gendered identity is socially and culturally acquired. It can be affected by one's national identity and occupational identity. Gendered identity can be multi-faceted rather than dichotomized.

Eckert and McConell-Ginet (2003) asserted that people are encircled by “gender lore” (p. 9) found in people’s conversations and actions, in homes and institutions; gender is imbedded in our performance, a state rather dynamic than stable, the source of common senses; gender is not an innate trait, but learned from role models, and gender identification is done by an individual, but in social interaction within certain community. Gender is “the social elaboration of biological sex” (p. 10) and biological difference are so amplified that gender identity is likely to be dichotomized.

Moffatt and Norton (2008) believed that, to understand gender as one of the many facets of identity, one has to research and understand how gender inequality is reproduced and maintained: gendered identity is formed and reproduced in social interaction -what people do and what people say deliver messages and cause consequences.

Norton and Pavlenko (2004) considered gender as “a complex system of social relations and discursive practices” (p. 3) constructed and reconstructed in certain contexts and gendered relations alter along with social, political, and economic changes; different cultures might have different beliefs and ideas about gender relations, masculinities, and femininities.

Moffatt and Norton (2008) reported that gendered identity practice is produced and limited by the social-cultural and historical context, where sexism is internalized and anti-sexist view forms; gendered discourse is greatly applied among preteens and adolescents: the preteen is constantly constructing their gendered identity, which, thus, is not always stable and they have complicated ideas about gender relations and sexuality.

Panopio’s (2010) study on Philippine male nurses in UK found that identity traits as masculinity and femininity are not automatically associated with males and females in workplaces. Philippine male nurses in UK work in female dominated occupation shows that gendered identity is greatly affected by global labor market and local economies. Thus, the construction of gendered identity is multiple-faceted.

III. IDENTITY DYNAMICS AND ENGLISH LEARNING: ASIAN IMMIGRANTS

This part of the paper reviews the identity issues and English learning experiences of Asian immigrant youth, males and females from the perspectives of power relations, social community, gender, linguistic distance, language shift, identity conflict and shift, population density, and age.
IV. SITUATED SECOND LANGUAGE ACQUISITION

Asian learners in ESL classrooms are in a less powered position compared to the teacher and other learners from former British colonies because their English proficiency is relatively low, which makes it hard for them to participate and express themselves on class (Duff, 2002). Being Asian immigrants may require extra efforts for them to meet the expectations of native speakers in terms of knowing the norm, being understood, and understanding others (Jones, 1999; Cheng, 2000). So the process of identity negotiation involves conflict and shift, and to be accepted and recognized by the target community is essential for them to practice English. Situated perspective towards English language acquisition is a truer way to understand Asian immigrants and their English learning experience in the U.S. (Norton and McKinney, 2010).

Duff’s (2002) and Cheng (2000) found that ESL learners use silence to protect themselves from being laughed at for their lower English proficiency, not because they are less motivated but because they are in a less powered position compared to their teachers and their English-as-mother-tongue peers. Jones also reported (1999) that Asians international student’s silence on class is two-fold: lack of English proficiency and lack of host culture knowledge; specifically, they are not used to the teaching style in western classroom as having much interactive discussions. Thus, Asian students’ lack of communicative contribution to class is because of their limited English proficiency and knowledge of western academic cultural norm.

Identity, power, and English language learning is interrelated (Norton and Mckinney, 2010). Learners’ racial, social, gender, national identity all affect their English learning experiences and power relations socially and historically affect these identities. Power relation in a society determines whether a second language learner can enter the “target language community” (p. 73) and their opportunity of practicing English is rather limited. Thus, to Norton and McKinney (2010), second language learning involves identity negotiation and renegotiation the binary idea of learners as motivated and non-motivated is flawed.

The concept of investment (Norton Pierce, 1995) and Bourdieu’s (1986) idea of cultural capital both indicate that learning a target language involves the desire of gaining more social or material resource or accessibility to the target community. Thus learner’s motivation of learning a second language is somewhat determined by whether they can get a resourceful return. Norton and McKinney asserted that ESL learners’ investing in English means they invest in a new identity.

The concept of imagined community by Norton and McKinney (2010) refers to a compatriot community, which may have a stronger impact on one’s commitment in learning the target language. Learners’ national identity may matter significantly in terms of learner’s motivation and commitment in learning a second language.

To Norton and McKinney, identity is constructed and negotiated in the process of language practice when social relationships are being established, carried out and opposed. Identity needs to be understood from a relational perspective and language needs to be researched as “situated utterance” (p. 78), because second language learning is a sociocultural process rather than a “predominantly mental and individual process” (p. 80). Immigrants as “new-comers” learn to participate in “old-timers” (Norton and Mckinney, p. 79) community and their extent of participation and achievement is usually limited or promoted by the “old timers” community members directly or indirectly. And marginalized individual may display a “non-participation” (p. 80) demeanor. Thus, quiet students in a classroom may not want to participate, or are unable to.

ESL learners may experience linguistic struggle in the process of adjusting the “customary discourse” of a target community, fitting into others’ “voice”, and being able to participate in a set of “speech communication” (Norton & McKinney, 2010, p. 78), thus these learners are usually in an unequal relationship with native speakers because native speakers reveal their values through language, and as any speakers, they want to be agreed, appreciated, honored, and dignified by expressing themselves. Compared to native speakers, ESL learners, are in a disadvantageous position when an ESL learner converses with a native speaker, and thus second language learners’ “right to speech” (p. 78) may be limited and their “power to impose reception” (p. 78) is unequally different. Therefore, Norton and McKinney (2010) suggested that the definition of competence needs to be broadened counting various circumstances.

V. CHINESE IMMIGRANT YOUTH: IDENTITY CONFLICT AND LANGUAGE SWITCH

Jia and Aaroson found (2003) Chinese immigrant youth, their ethnic identification and racial categorization are significant factors affecting their motivation, commitment, and effectiveness in English learning, and also influence their language preference; their association with English-speaking peers may determine that they would like to speak English rather than their mother tongue, so that they may acquire more proficiency, while those who associate primarily with same-group peers are less likely to acquire the same English proficiency.

Jia and Aaroson (2003) found that social factors as peer preferences, social abilities, and cultural preferences contribute to the switching from L1 to L2 and maintenance of L2 among Chinese immigrant children and adolescents. They reported that younger Chinese children spoke English with their friends of different ethnic groups, but older Chinese immigrants’ adolescents made friends primarily with those who share their Chinese cultural background and used L1 to communicate with each other. Associating with different ethnic groups, younger Chinese immigrant children and adolescents received “peer pressure and motivation” (p. 154) to learn English.

and some Chinese American school students experience psychological cost, such as anxiety and insecurity at a young age, despite the fact that some Chinese Americans do attend elite schools. Particularly, enclave Chinese American students (for example, in Flushing area) seldom communicate with their parents and are extremely frustrated when their parents compare them to other high-achieving Chinese American peers; although Chinese American youth attending elite-university were confident in finding good jobs in US job market, they admitted that race would make an impact in their chances of being hired or promoted, and race and class might matter in many aspects of life and it could matter vigorously - an optimism contradictory.

Louie also found that parents of many Chinese American elite school attenders came to the U.S. with graduate degrees of elite universities of their homelands and advanced their degrees in the U.S. and then worked as engineers, doctors, and lawyers, residing in gated American suburban communities; on the other hand, the Chinese American youth growing up at the enclave communities go to public schools, struggle academically, and witness friends or siblings drop out of school or die, and their parents merely finished grade school at their homeland before they came to the U.S.

The two sets of Chinese American young participants in Louie’s study both experienced strict surveillance from their parents about schooling and their parents emphasized higher education because it was a secured investment that would pay off in the future and allow them to excel in the US society. The family culture of valuing-education helped the Chinese suburb-reside youth go to elite universities, and thus model-minority media message is true and good for them; their enclave-reside counterparts complained about their family as not typical Chinese families with parents being strict with them, being poor financially, and lack of US cultural capital to help them in their schooling, and model-minority standard became a great distress for they have to live up to it.

Chinese immigrants’ family culture emphasizing education forges their offspring’s identity in two ways (Louie, 2005): suburban Chinese American second generations feel obliged to obey their parents’ wishes to go into professions like medicine and law, sometimes against their own interest will because they saw their parents sacrifice a lot as first immigrant generation working hard so that they could have a better house, a better school district or a better neighborhood environment; whereas their enclave counterparts seemed to rebel more and strike to explore their own identity.

Both Chinese immigrant youth and young American-born Chinese experienced identity conflict in terms of whom to associate with and which language to speak, with the result that they either speak their mother tongue more and acquire less English or switch to English and lost their own language (Jia and Aaroson, 2003). They also experienced the pressure of living up to the expectation of being the model minority in the US society, with the result that some went to elite schools and some struggled with schooling, yet, they questioned, struggled, and explored for they wanted to find out who they are and should be, and in a constant identity-seeking journey (Louie, 2005).

VI. MALE ASIAN IMMIGRANTS: CONFLICT, LINGUISTIC DISTANCE, AND DENSITY

Chiswick and Miller (2000) found that male Asian immigrants experienced collision between their gendered identity of Asian norm and that of American and Canadian society; lack of previous speaking-English (or French) experience and a relatively big linguistic distance between their mother tongue and English (or French) are the two factors that impede their pace with English-learning (or French-learning); level of free will in immigrating to Canada and the United States affected their willingness to speak English (or French) and higher density of a certain Asian ethnic group within a certain community reduces their chances of speaking English or French as well.

Wong, Tsai, Liu, Zhu, and Wei (2014) reported that Asian male international students’ gendered identity is obstructed by their racial discrimination experiences; racial stereotype about Asian male portray them as lack of masculinity and male Asian international students experience masculinity-related stress because masculine norms in Asian countries focusing on “humility and conformity” contradict or clash with American masculine norms as “assertive and independent-minded” (p. 561).

Chiswick and Miller (2000) conducted a study on male immigrants’ (age 25-64) language practice in Canada and their language practice and found that Asian refugee males were less apt to speak the official language at home than the male immigrants coming into Canada from former British, French, and American colonies; older immigrant males were likely to have lower proficiency of an official language and their probability of shifting to speak an official language increased when they stayed longer and obtained some education in Canada.

David Takeuchi, et al’s (2007) quantitative study on the mental health of Asian immigrants in the US, and the correlations between variables of “nativity status”, “English language proficiency”, “age at time of immigration”, “generational status”, “years in the United States”, and “ethnic origins”, found that above-mentioned factors are either strongly or weakly associated with Asian immigrants’ mental health status: Asian men with lower English proficiency are likely to have higher mental disorder rate than those with higher English proficiency, for level of English language proficiency determines whether an immigrant individual could or not “move outside of their immediate circles” (p. 84), which may increase their chances of finding employment and utilizing other economic resources. Their research verifies other empirical study findings that “immigration is associated with depression” and “Asian immigrants have higher levels of depressive symptoms than do US-born Asians” (p. 84).

According to Chiswich and Miller (2000), the geographic distance between male immigrants’ country of origin (or birthplace) and Canada could be a positive variable in terms of their willingness to speak an official language; thus the
correlation between the geographic distance and the target language capability is that the greater the distance, the more capable they can become in speaking an official language; linguistic distance between a male immigrant’s mother tongue and English/French, was another variable that affected their English/French proficiency: the greater the linguistic distance, the more effort they may put in learning English/French; the higher the percentage of immigrant population in an area where an immigrant lives, the less likely he or she speaks an official language, for their chances of speaking the target language decrease; male refugees were found to be less likely to speak an official language at home because their level of voluntariness of opting to immigrate to Canada was lower than their non-refugee counterparts and their desire of moving upward in Canada and commitment to English/French was relatively low.

VII. IMMIGRANT WOMEN: IDENTITY, AGE, AND ENGLISH LEARNING

Identity conflict, identity shift, and gendered identity (as mothers and wives, young and old) are fundamental factors in immigrant women’s English learning outcomes (Wang, 1999; Skilton-Sylvester, 2002). Positively investing in English would promote a favorable effect and negatively abstaining from learning English would surely hinder the learners, and supportiveness from teachers and educational policies would definitely help them to better adjust and adapt (Norton & McKinney’s, 2010).

Wendy Wang (1999)’s research on two groups of mandarin-speaking women immigrants in Canada, among whom fifteen of them are between 25 to 35 years old of AOA (age of arrival) and the rest fifteen are between 40 to 55 years old of AOA, found that a majority of them experience difficulties in learning and using English, for the reason of “lack of situation” (p. 11) to speak English and “social marginalization” (p. 22) due to being unable to find jobs and living in a Chinese-immigrant-populated environment; the 15 earlier arrivals of Chinese women immigrants displayed more confidence in English learning, while those arrived later expressed that it would be “forever” for them to reach a “reasonable level of oral proficiency”, which would sap their “effort and commitment” to learn English (p. 13).

Norton and McKinney proposed that second language learning is closely related to learners’ multiple identities and when conflicts occur in the shift of old identity into new identity, one may decrease the amount of investment in the target language. Therefore, they proposed that ESL learning is not only to learn English grammar and vocabulary but also to learn to adopt the value and belief system of the English-native speakers and to learn to “command the attention of their listeners” (p. 81) to let themselves heard.

Multiple identities of Cambodian women in the US may more or less influence how much interest they develop for English and how capable they can be in learning English (Skilton-Sylvester, 2002); Cambodian woman’s working identity served as a motivator for English-learning, an investment for better future workplace-communication ability, but their working schedule contradicted the time of attending the ESL class and thus prevented them from attending class regularly, while their identity as wives may prevent them from attending ESL class, reflecting the assumption that Cambodian husbands restrict their wives in attending ESL classes for fear of their status to be threatened; Cambodian woman’s identity as mothers did motivate them a lot to learn English for they wanted to set good example for their children and communicate in English with their children in English when they helped their children doing their homework. Thus, they invest in English for their children’s sake.

Cuban and Stromquist (2009) reported that immigrant women as a whole, their “stakeholders” (p. 157) are neglected in US Adult Basic Education (ABE) system and English to Speakers of Other Languages programs: as “Cinderellas” (p. 157) in the US educational system, immigrant women are not properly provided with support service and the goal of educating them is set for the vocational skills in the job market, but not for the “full and active citizenship in communities and in daily life”(p. 168); the US literacy and language programs regard Standard English as the language of curriculum and do not consider the native languages of immigrant women learners and their cultures; curriculum focus is “on short-term” and “work-related goals” in the ABE system and educational policy overlooking immigrant woman’s desire of pursuing a better job for a better life and right to literacy is mostly neglected.

VIII. DISCUSSION

The attitude of Asian immigrant and the accepting level in the host country both decisively lead to the ethnic identity formation and adaptation outcome. Pride, confidence, and positive attitude are indispensable qualities that one ought to have to possess a healthy ethnic identity, and strong commitment does not necessarily mean a strong ethnic identity and having particular ethnic behavior does not indicate having that particular ethnic identity. Supportiveness from within the ethnic group and parental socialization also strongly influence one's ethnic identity development, and the duration of the stay of an immigrant in the host country determines strongly one's adaptation outcome. Ethnic identity and national identity can be related, but they each and together affect an immigrant's mental health and success of their adaptation. Racial identity refers to the effect of racism and internalized racism, trusting relationship, and social grouping patterns. Ethnic identity deals with issues of belonging, heritage culture and language.

Gendered identity shall be viewed through cultural and social lenses. Its significance co-plays with other factors of identity developments as nationality and occupation. A complex view of gendered identity is preferable to a dichotomized one, and gendered identity tends to be multi-dimensional, complicated, and dynamic.

Speech circumstance influences and determines identity recognition, shift, and conflict. Silence can be a way of soundless protest for not being identified or an indicator of having less English proficiency. Adaptation of native
speakers’ voice involves identity shift for value is expressed through language and value of an immigrant’s ethnic culture and the English culture can vary significantly. Thus, English learning should be theorized in a situated and multiple-faceted way rather than a dichotomized one of learners as either motivated or unmotivated.

Asian languages are relatively distant linguistically from English compared with those languages spoken in former British colonies, thus Asian immigrants are less likely to speak English or French. The more chance of meeting Asian-language-speaking people for an Asian male individual, the less likely he may acquire higher English proficiency; experiencing identity conflict because of different ideas about masculinity creates psychological pressure and cause mental problems on Asian male immigrants.

Asian Immigrant women experience obstacles in the process of learning English, including identity conflict between their previous social status and their after-immigration status and identity constraints as mothers and wives, and the low expectations from others as well (their ESL teachers and low expectations suggested by educational policies on immigrant women). Treating English-learning as an investment for a promising future motivates immigrant women to acquire a better proficiency despite the fact that their age of arrival in the host nations does play a role in their English-learning and adaptation outcomes.

Ethnic identity may be affected by an immigrant’s attitudes towards one’s own ethnic group, the pluralism of the hosting country, the level of supportiveness within the ethnic community, the density of the ethnic group population, parental socialization with other group members, and the age of arrival. The experience of racism, social network pattern in the host country, and racial stratification, trust relation between immigrants and the hosting society are elements contributing to the formation of an immigrant’s racial identity. Gendered identity may be affected by one’s occupational identity, discourse one listens to, and interaction within a community. Therefore, an immigrant’s immediate living environment plays a major role in their identity formation and development.

IX. Conclusion

The English learning experience of Asian Americans is very much affected by their experience of identity conflict/shift, and power relations. A situated perspective would bring a clearer picture of how they learn English and why they do not reach certain level of proficiency. Identity and community are related to immigrant’s English learning. Linguistic distance, adaptation strategy, ethnic identity strength, and racial discrimination are factors contribute either positively or negatively to the English learning outcomes of Asian immigrants. Conclusively, the issue of Asian immigrants’ second language learning experiences and outcomes is a complicated one that shall be studied in a complex way.

REFERENCES