

# Analysis of Conversational Implicature in the Hobbit Movies Subtitle

Inayatun Na'mah\*, Sugirin Sugirin

Post Graduate Student of Applied Linguistics

Yogyakarta State University

Yogyakarta, Indonesia

\*inayatun.namah2015@student.uny.ac.id, sugirin@ uny.ac.id

**Abstract**—This study aimed to analyze the translations of conversational implicatures in *The Hobbit* movies subtitle. In addition, this study tried to describe the pragmatic shifts between the source text (movies script) and the target text (movie subtitle). Furthermore, this study tried to identify the translations techniques applied by the subtitler in translating conversational implicatures in *The Hobbit* movies. This was a descriptive qualitative study. The data of this study was the subtitle of *The Hobbit* movies in forms of words, phrases, clauses, and sentences which contained implicature. The results showed that there were 10 translation techniques applied by the subtitler to transfer the implicit meanings of conversational implicatures in *The Hobbit* Movies. Those were literal, reduction, modulation, linguistic amplification, borrowing, transposition, adaptation, compensation, substitution, and linguistic compression. Those techniques were applied in various frequencies. Moreover, the result of pragmatic shifts showed that there were 94 conversational implicatures found in *The Hobbit* movies. Most of those were well translated. This could be seen from the percentage of pragmatic shifts that was 25 % data of implicatures showed pragmatic shifts.

**Keywords**—conversational implicature; pragmatic shift; subtitle; *The Hobbit*; translation technique

## I. INTRODUCTION

Language is a mean of communication used by human beings in their social interaction that covers different purposes. Sometimes, the researches about language based only on the structural level of a language not the deep surface of language, this causes in-maximum results of study. Meanwhile, language use is often out of structural level, but it must be linked to other aspects such as situational context which is called as implicature. One of language study that is able to accommodate those aspects is pragmatics. Pragmatics is one of language studies that describes the meaning of communication. Yule explains that pragmatics examines the invisible meaning or how the readers or listeners understand what is meant even when it is not actually written or said [1]. Pragmatics study covers many aspects one of those is conversational implicature.

This paper tried to identify the translation techniques applied to translate the conversational implicatures in *The Hobbit* movies: *An Unexpected Journey* (2012), *The Desolation of Smaug* (2013), and *The Battle of Five Armies* (2014); the number of conversational implicature found in those movies.

Moreover, this study would describe the pragmatics shifts occurred in the conversational implicatures.

The research about translation of conversational implicatures had been conducted by Karini entitled *The Translation Quality of Conversational Implicatures in Five on a Treasure Island* [2]. Karini mentioned that to achieve good quality of conversational implicature, the right or suitable techniques were needed to be applied in the process of translating conversational implicatures [2]. Moreover, the study about movie or subtitle conducted by Putranti in her thesis entitled *A Translation Study of Expressive Illocution in American Beauty Movie Subtitle* described that the subtitle was mostly acceptable [3]. This was not only determined by the equivalent meaning between source and target language but also determined by visual presentation of the movie.

Translation usually involved two languages which are known as Source Language (SL) and target Language (TL). It was conducted to solve language problems due to the diversity of languages. As it was stated by Hatim and Manson the difference language often caused barriers to people in understanding the message and meaning of a text, in which translation as a form of communication had a role as a bridge of different languages and culture [4]. Here the role of translation is to produce the equivalent text in form of target language as stated by Kuswarini [5]. Translation is an activity of reproducing equivalent signs in terms of language, culture, and messages. The explanations above mentioned that in translation equivalence is needed to maintain the meaning of the source text or language.

In this modern era, translation is not only occurred in written text such as scientific writing, literary works (short story, novel, poetry, etc.), news text, but also it was applied in movie world. The rapid development of film and technology make film or movie can be easily accessed and distributed to many countries with various language and culture background. This condition makes translation as an important aspect in solving the problem of difference language in different countries. Therefore, a study about translation needs to be conducted.

A well-known translation form in movie world is subtitle that makes movie lovers easy in understanding the dialogue spoken by the characters of movie. Luyken in Georgekopolou

mentioned that subtitle was written translation of movie dialogues that was presented in text lines and placed at the bottom of screen [6]. From that statement, subtitle could be stated as a text of verbal language delivered by the characters of film. Subtitle was not replaced the source language used in the movie, yet it visually appeared together with characters' voice as the source language.

In the translation of movie dialogue or subtitle, it was found some problems to study. One of those was the translation of conversational implicature. Implicature can be defined as readers' perspective (written language variations) towards the meaning of a text which is different from the conventional meaning of the text. Supriyadi stated that implicature explicitly explained how the process of conveying meaning by means of language [7]. Furthermore, Thomas says that implicatures are the property of utterances, not of sentences and therefore the same words carry different implicatures on different occasions. From the definitions of implicatures above, it can be concluded that implicatures are the hidden meaning of a statement or utterance that is different from its language structure [8]. Thus, this can be a challenge for a translator to transfer the meaning or message of a text, therefore it needs to be further analyzed about how the statements that contain implicatures translated. The choice of translation technique determines the result of translation.

## II. METHOD

This study applied descriptive qualitative method. The data was collected from the conversational implicatures of *The Hobbit* movies entitled *The Hobbit movies: An Unexpected Journey* (2012), *The Desolation of Smaug* (2013), and *The Battle of Five Armies* (2014) and the subtitle of DVD version in *Bahasa*. The data was collected through watching the movies and noting the sentences or statements that contained implicatures. Furthermore, the writer identified the techniques of translation implemented by translator or subtitler in transferring the meaning of conversational implicatures.

## III. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Based on the analysis, the results showed that there were 10 techniques applied in translating the conversational implicatures in *The Hobbit* movies: *An Unexpected Journey* (2012), *The Desolation of Smaug* (2013), and *The Battle of Five Armies* (2014). Those techniques were applied in various frequencies. Moreover, the number of conversational implicatures showed 94 data from those movies. Most of the data above was well translated as there were only 26 data (25%) showed the pragmatic shifts. The pragmatic shifts occurred due to the inappropriate choice of translation technique, the incorrect dictions replaced the SL, and translator's misunderstanding in conveying the meaning of conversational implicatures. Furthermore, the descriptions of those techniques' application and the effects of those techniques towards the pragmatics shifts were mentioned in the explanation below.

### A. Literal

This technique can be defined as a word-for-word translation that can be used in some languages and not others dependent on the sentence structure. This technique is usually used in translating simple sentences.

There were 62 data of conversational implicatures applied the literal technique to transfer the message of conversational implicatures in SL. The results showed that most of the TL successfully conveyed the messages. This could be seen from the number of pragmatic shifts which was 15 data showed different meaning of conversational implicatures between SL and TL.

This technique is mostly applied by the translator to transfer the implicit meanings due to its simplicity and easiness to be used in the process of translation. Though the definition of literal translation is translating word by word, in this study the researcher found that the translator did some adjustments to achieve the good quality of translation and to maintain the implicit message of conversational implicatures such as omitting the plural mark in TL and article "a, an, or the" which do not play important role in *Bahasa*.

The sample of implicature data is described as follow.

**BSu Bard: All of you! Listen to me! You must listen!** Have you forgotten what happen to Dale?

**Bsa Bard: *Kalian semua! Dengarkan aku! Kalian harus dengar! Apa kalian lupa apa yang terjadi pada Dale?***

The message of conversation above is to convince Lake Town people preventing the dwarfs not to come their hometown Lonely Mountain. The implicit meaning of implicature above is well conveyed through the subtitle.

From 62 data that applied literal technique, 15 data showed pragmatic shifts which meant the implicit meanings or messages of TL were different from the SL. These caused the messages of conversational implicatures from those 15 data were not equally transferred in the subtitle.

### B. Reduction

Reduction technique can be identified by the characteristic of deleting some linguistic elements in the SL. The deletion occurs in phrasal and word level.

14 data of conversational implicatures used the reduction technique. This technique could be identified by the occurrence of deletion in some linguistic elements from the SL to TL. From those 14 data, there were 3 data indicated the pragmatic shifts. Here is the application of reduction technique.

**BSu Bilbo: Balin, if – if Thorin had the Arkenstone ...if it was found, would it help?**

**Balin:** That stone crowns all. It is the summit of this great wealth.

**Bsa** **Bilbo:** *Balin, jika Thorin memiliki Arkenstone.... Jika saja batu itu ditemukan.... apakah itu akan membantu?*

**Balin:** *Batu itu lebih dari segalanya. Batu itu merupakan puncak dari segala harta di sini.*

The application of reduction is reflected through the omission of “if” repetition which actually shows speaker’s uncertainty towards his decision. Yet the translator prefers to remove that word, thus the implicit meaning of implicature above is not well transferred. Thus the core meaning of implicature above changes in TL.

### C. Modulation

12 data were found applying the modulation technique. Most of the translation texts showed good criteria. The pragmatic shifts occurred in 4 data from 12 data. This technique could be seen from the change of view point between SL and TL. Below is the example of modulation application in translating conversational implicature.

**BSu** **Bilbo:** Good morning.

**Gandalf:** **To think that I should have lived to be good morninged by Belladonna Took’s son, as if I were selling buttons at the door.**

**Bsa** **Bilbo:** *Selamat pagi.*

**Gandalf:** *Kau pikir aku harus hidup hanya untuk diucapkan ‘selamat pagi’ oleh putera Belladonna Took seperti jika aku menjual knob pintu?*

This technique can be characterized by the change of point of view between SL and TL. From the data above it can be seen from the phrase “Kau pikir....” which reflects view point change. Due to this application of technique makes readers are easier in understanding the conversation above and its meaning. The subtitle of data above successfully conveys the meaning of implicature in SL.

### D. Linguistic Amplification

Generally, this technique achieved the meaning transfer from SL to TL. This could be seen from no data experiences pragmatic shifts from 8 data of conversational implicatures. The application of this technique is depicted as follow.

**BSu** **Bilbo:** If any of you ever passing Bag End, tea is at four, there’s plenty of it. You are welcome anytime. Eh, don’t bother knocking.

**Bsa** **Bilbo:** *Jika kalian melewati Bag End, teh jam 4 sore. Jumlahnya sangat banyak. Kalian disambut kapanpun. Uuhh, dan kalian tak perlu mengetuk pintu.*

The dialogue above shows implicit meaning of inviting speaker’s friends to come to his house. The speaker is rigorously willing his friends visit him by describing his routine. In TL also depicts the speaker big intention to invite

his friends visiting his home. Thus it could be said that the application of linguistic amplification technique is effective in transferring the message of conversational implicatures in the research data.

### E. Borrowing

The results showed that there were 7 data implemented the technique of borrowing. This technique used some words from SL and put those words to TL or subtitle. From 7 data that implemented borrowing technique, it showed that there was no data of pragmatic shift occurred due to its application. One of this technique application is described in the following statements.

**BSu** **Beorn:** I don’t like dwarves. They’re greedy and blind, blind to the lives of those they deem lesser than their own. **But Orcs, I hate more.** What do you need?

**Bsa** **Beorn:** *Aku tak suka dwarf. Mereka tamak dan buta. Buta pada hidup yang mereka anggap kurang penting daripada hidup mereka. Tapi aku lebih membenci Orc. Apa yang kalian perlukan?*

The application of borrowing technique is mostly at word level (the words that are very identical to the movie) in order to maintain the naturality of TL.

### F. Transposition

Transposition technique was used in 3 data of conversational implicature. From those 3 data, 1 data showed the pragmatic shifts. From the analysis result, it was found that the translator made a mistake by choosing the right words for the subtitle. In SL “*You could not wish for a finer blade*” indicated that the speaker forced his friend to take the blade. In TL, the statement was translated to be “*Kau tidak bisa dapatkan pedang yang lebih baik ini*”. To maintain the message of SL, it could be translated as “*Kau takkan dapatkan pedang yang lebih baik dari ini*”.

### G. Adaptation

This technique was applied in 1 data, number 07. It did not cause the pragmatic shift. All the data of conversational implicatures were well translated and the messages of those were well transferred.

**BSu** **Bilbo:** Well, I have some skill at Conkers, if you must know, but I fail to see why that’s relevant.

**Thorin:** **Thought as much. He looks like a grocer than a burglar.**

**Bsa** **Bilbo:** *Aku cukup lihai bermain conkers, jika kau ingin tahu. Tapi aku tidak melihat apakah ada hubungannya.*

**Thorin:** *Sesuai dugaanku. Dia lebih tampak seperti penjaga toko kelontong dari pada seorang penyusup.*

Adaptation is a technique which uses the word that closes to TL. The implementation of this technique is reflected from the phrase “*toko kelontong*”. This technique makes the subtitle more natural and easier to listen.

#### H. Compensation

Compensation was used once in data number 13. This technique succeeded in transferring the message of conversational implicature in *The Hobbit: An Unexpected Journey* (2012).

**BSu Bilbo:** Wait! Wait! **I signed it! Here!**

Balin: Everything appears to be in order. Welcome, Master baggins, to the company of Thorin Oakenshield.

**Bsa Bilbo:** *Tunggu! Tunggu! Aku telah menandatanganiya. Ini!*

Balin: *Semuanya tampak sesuai urutan. Selamat datang, Tn. Baggins di rombongan Thorin Oakenshield.*

This technique is applied to maintain stylistic effect from SL. This can be seen from “*Aku telah menandatanganiya*” which means that the speaker has agreed to join the adventure. It can have said that the application of this technique helps the readers to understand the implicit meaning of data no 13 above.

#### I. Substitution

The technique of substitution was implemented in 1 data of conversational implicature. This technique caused the pragmatic shift in data number 15 as the translator replaced the subtitle with the note “*tanpa subtitel*”. This resulted the pragmatic shift.

#### J. Linguistic Compression

It's found that a data translated through this technique of translation. The application of Linguistic Compression technique did not cause the pragmatic shift in the data of conversational implicature.

**BSu Kili:** **The people of Laketown have nothing. They came to us in need. They have lost everything.**

Thorin: Do not tell me what they have lost.

**Bsa Kili:** *Warga kota Danau tidak memiliki apapun. Mereka membutuhkan bantuan kita, mereka telah kehilangan*

*segalanya.*

**Thorin:** *Jangan memceramahiku tentang arti kata kehilangan.*

Linguistic compression is technique of translation that simplifies SL in TL. This can be seen from the clause “*Mereka membutuhkan bantuan kita*” which is written as “**They came to us in need**” in SL. By applying this technique, translator makes reader easy in comprehending the message in the SL. Therefore, the pragmatic shift does not occur in this data.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

The conversational implicature is messages that are not explained in the structure of sentence. This is implied by the speaker and the listener or reader should be able to conclude the message by understanding the contextual situation when the statement or sentence spoken by the speaker. In order to achieve good quality of translation, the translator needs to choose the proper technique in the process of translation.

From the analysis, it could be concluded that there were 10 techniques of translation applied in transferring the message of conversational implicatures found in *The Hobbit* movies. The techniques that did not cause the pragmatic shifts were borrowing and adaptation. Moreover, the number of conversational implicatures showed 94 data and 26 data indicated the pragmatic shifts due to the inappropriate technique, translator's error in understanding and conveying the message of the conversational implicatures found in *The Hobbit* movies.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] G. Yule, *Pragmatics* (Penerjemah: Indah Fajar Wahyuni). Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 1996.
- [2] Z. Karini, *The translation quality of conversational implicatures in Five on a Treasure Island*. Seminar Nasional Prasasti II. Surakarta: Universitas Sebelas Maret, 2015.
- [3] A. Putranti, *Kajian terjemahan tindak ilokusi ekspresif dalam film American Beauty*. Tesis. Surakarta: UNS, 2007.
- [4] B. Hatim, and I. Mason, *The translator as communicator*. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- [5] P. Kuswarini, “A shift of ideology in the translation of Karl May's work *Und Friede auf Erden!* into Indonesian language,” *International Journal of Comparative Literature Translation Studies*, vol 2, no. 3, 2014.
- [6] P. Georgakopoulou, *Subtitling for the DVD industry*. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
- [7] S. Supriyadi, “Karikatur karya G.M Sudarta di Surat Kabar Kompas, Kajian Pragmatik” dalam *Humaniora*, vol. 23, no. 1, pp. 87 –97, 2011.
- [8] J. Thomas, *Meaning in interaction: an introduction to Pragmatics*. London/New York: Longman, 1995.