Short Stories on Comparison Literature

Muhammad Arief Budiman
Elementary School Teacher Education Program
Universitas PGRI Semarang
Semarang, Indonesia
ariebudiman@upgris.ac.id

Mei Fita Asri Untari
Elementary School Teacher Education Program
Universitas PGRI Semarang
Semarang, Indonesia
meifitaasri@upgris.ac.id

Abstract- Each short story has its own story line different from each other. The purpose of this research is to know the plots of the stories portrayed in the short stories published in monthly magazine “Nurul Hayat” and online sources. This research is qualitative descriptive. The subject of research is 10 short stories; seven short stories from monthly magazine “Nurul Hayat” and three short stories from websites. Data collection tools use documentation. Data analysis techniques are using Miles and Huberman techniques. The results indicate that the short stories published in “Nurul Hayat” magazines and in the website deliver positive and constructing ideas. These stories have a positive effect on the readers. This is because in these stories there are various plots that bring positive value. These positive values poured by the author in his story through the characters in the story. This leads to the fact that the stories presented by the authors create a positive aura that will also transmit positive things to the readers.

Keywords: short story, Greimas, comparison literature

I. INTRODUCTION

Literary works are writings of authors who carry hidden messages. Sometimes the message is difficult to understand because readers only enjoy the course of the story which makes them drifted in the fabric of the problems of the actors in the story and for a moment the readers can forget their own problems in the real world.

Various kinds of stories in the community contain various kinds of messages that the author wants to convey. Usually the author brings a message about everyday life that is not far from the background of the author. For example, a young writer who lives today will bring up the latest problems, such as bullying in cyber world.

There are two kinds of messages contained in a story; there are implied and explicit messages. Explicit messages will be easily found by the reader because the author clearly lists what he/she wants to convey through the words in the story. While the implied message is difficult to understand because the author does not directly embody what he wants to convey through words written directly in a story.

To understand the implicit message, an attempt is needed to analyze the story in question, as Budiman did in his writings [1]. Budiman analyzed 15 short stories, 12 from nurul hayat magazines, 3 from the web. The results of Budiman’S analysis show that these stories carry a positive message in the form of an invitation not to give up easily.

In addition to the article, he also has other articles about story analysis [2]. In this article he had analyzed eleven stories where the results show that all the stories also bring positive value to the readers where the readers are taught to be helpful, caring, and humble people.

In addition to the above two articles, Budiman also analyzed a number of Islamic-themed stories. In the analysis Budiman used comparative literary theory. By using this theory, Budiman found that some of the Islamic stories analyzed have the same message, namely the invitation of writers to always uphold the truth [3].

From some of the articles above it can be concluded that the stories written by the author not only serve to entertain the readers but they also have a function to convey messages from the author to the reader where the message that the author wishes to convey is usually a positive invitation.

Here the researchers want to offer new things in the form of research objects, ten new stories, seven stories from nurul hayat magazine, and three stories from the web. The ten stories will be analyzed using comparative literary theory. The results of this analysis will later confirm the existence of the message that the author wants to convey to the reader.

II. METHOD

Data analysis techniques are using Miles and Huberman techniques. Miles and Huberman state that there are three types of qualitative data analysis activities, namely: data reduction, data display, verification of conclusions [4].

Data Reduction: The data obtained in the field is quite a lot; therefore it needs to be recorded carefully and in detail. Reducing data means: identifying the important things, looking for themes and patterns, and removing unnecessary things. Reduced data will
provide a clear picture and make it easier for researchers to carry out further data collection, and look for it if needed. Data reduction can be assisted by electronic devices such as: computers, by providing codes on certain aspects. With reduction, the researcher summarizes, takes important data, and makes categorizations, based on uppercase, lowercase letters and numbers. Unimportant data is discarded.

Data Model (Data Display): After the data is reduced, the next step is to display the data. Data display in qualitative research can be done in the form of: short descriptions, charts, relationships between categories, flowcharts and so on. Miles and Huberman state: "the most frequent form of displaying data for qualitative research data in the past has been narrative text" means: most often used to present data in qualitative research with narrative text [4]. In addition to narrative forms, data display can also be in the form of graphs, matrices, networks. Social phenomena are complex and dynamic so that what is found when entering the field and after taking a long time in the field will experience data development. The researcher must always test what has been found when entering the field which is still hypothetical or not. If after entering the field for a long time, the formulated hypothesis is always supported by the data when it is collected in the field, then the hypothesis is proven and will develop into a standard pattern. The patterns found have been supported by data during the study, then the pattern becomes a standard pattern that no longer changes. This pattern is then displayed in the final research report.

Conclusion Withdrawal / Verification: The third step is drawing conclusions and verification. The initial conclusions raised are still temporary, and will change if there is no strong evidence that supports the next data collection stage. But if the conclusion is indeed supported by valid and consistent evidence when the researcher returns to the field to collect data, then the conclusions put forward are credible (reliable) conclusions. Conclusions in qualitative research may be able to answer the formulation of the problem formulated from the beginning, but may not, because the problem and formulation of the problem in qualitative research are still temporary and will develop after the research is in the field. The conclusion in the qualitative research that is expected is a new finding that never existed before. Findings can be in the form of a description of an object that was previously unclear, so that after being examined it became clear.

III. GREIMAS’ STRUCTURALISM

Algirdas Julien Greimas is a French structuralist researcher [5]. He succeeded in developing the theory of structuralism into narrative structuralism based on structural analogies in linguistics derived from Ferdinand de Saussure. Greimas introduced the concept of the smallest narrative unit in the text called actan. He is more concerned with action than the actors. Subjects in the narrative are false humans formed by actions called actans and acteurs. Both actans and acteurs can be in the form of an action, but do not always have to be human, but also non-human. Regarding the differences between actans and acteurs, the explanations are as follows.

Unlike the limited actans in the narrative structure, which is divided into three binary oppositions, acteurs are general categories. In the sentence 'John and Paul give apples to Mary', John and Paul are two acteurs, but one actan. John and Paul are also senders, Mary is the recipient. In the sentence ‘John bought himself a dress’, John is an acteur who functions as two actants, both as senders and as recipients.

Thus, an actan in a structure can occupy another actan function or an actan can have double function. It could be that an actan has a subject and recipient function or a subject and sender function. Aktan is something abstract, like love, freedom, or a group of characters. The definition of an actan is associated with a narrative syntactic unit, which is a syntactic element that has certain functions, namely the basic unit of the story which explains the meaningful actions that make up the narrative. The subject and predicate in a sentence can be a function category in the story.

Actants occupy six functions, namely subject, object, sender, receiver, helper, opposant. The six functions form three oppositions, namely sender-recipient, subject-object, and helper-opposant. If arranged in a scheme, the opposition can be described as follows.

Figure 1 Actan scheme

The sender is someone or something that encourages or raises the desire of the subject to get or reach an object. Therefore, the sender functions as
a motivator of the story. Whereas the receiver is someone or something that receives or gets objects that are hunted by the subject. The subject is someone or something assigned by the sender to get the object. Meanwhile, the object is someone or something that is desired, sought after, or hunted by the subject. Helper is something or someone who helps or makes it easier for the subject to get the object; while the Opponent (opposant) is someone or something that hinders the efforts of the subject to get the object.

The arrows in the scheme are an important element that connects the syntactic functions of each actan. The arrow from the sender to the object shows the sender's function as the subject's drive to get the object. The arrow from the object to the recipient shows the recipient's function as the party that gets the object hunted by the subject. The arrow from subject to object shows the subject function as the party assigned by the sender to get or hunt objects. The arrow from the helper to the subject shows a helper function in helping the subject who is trying to get the object. The arrow from the opponent to the subject shows the opposing function in inhibiting the subject's attempt to get the object. Between the recipient and the sender there is a communication, between the sender and the object there is a goal, between the subject and the object there is a business, between the helper and the opponent there is help or challenge.

IV. COMPARATIVE LITERATURE

The basic principles that must be adhered to in comparative literary studies are related to two things, namely: (1) the condition of literary work that is never sterile from other literary influences, (2) comparison as an attempt to clarify originality and the aesthetic weight of literature [6]. It must be understood, literature and comparative literature are indeed two things that require a high level of scrutiny. If literature is imaginative, comparative literature is non-imaginative. Understanding the world of literature and comparative literature is not always identical. Comparative literature can be defined as the composition of world literature, which includes a number of literary, historical and critical appearances, from the literary phenomena considered in its entirety. That is why; estuary of comparative literature is indeed towards world literature. Even though the notion of world literature is still tendentious, comparative literature still has a share that counts.

Comparative literary expression is a critical source of conclusions, because it has been supported by authentic data. This often happens to claim that literature and comparative literature have a more specific critical comparison method. Literary theory has a creative, critical and proportional method in its creation. As for comparative literature, it is clear that literature studies utilize theoretical creativity as well. The procedure of the research is basically the same, i.e the subject of the research can be in the form of a single literature or several literary works. Comparative literature must be referred to as comprehensive literary understanding. Such a principle needs to be adhered to when we want to give birth to a comparable weighted literary product.

According to Jost until now we have produced general principles and comparative literature that are widely accepted throughout the scientific world. At least in terms of comparative literary theory is a literary philosopher thought in the new humanism repertoire. The basic principle of comparative literature consists of trust in the integrity of the literary phenomenon. In the negation of the power of national literature in the fields of economics and culture, it results in the need for new axiology. National literature cannot be understood as merely a field study, because its perspective is limited by arbitrariness, international contextism in literary history and criticism that has become law. Comparative literature represents more than one academic discipline.

Such general principles have now begun to develop and sometimes differ from the original comparative literary concept. Most importantly, the main principle of comparative literature needs carefulness, so that there will be no lawsuit from writers being compared. Claims can also be present from critics, if comparative literature is deemed not to fulfill the correct principles. The principle that needs to be maintained, namely the presence of critical thinking, observance, and being able to show parallelism of two or more works.

Comparative literary studies cannot be done if you just play games. Comparative literature requires mature work, full consideration, equipped with authentic data. Interpretation is still needed as far as possible to place the issue of variant literary works. Comparison between literary works can be done by an expert in literature. As for the comparison between literary works and other fields, it can cooperate with other field experts. Preferred in comparative literature is a critical meeting based on clear thinking and not biased and free from certain intentions.

V. GREIMAS’ ANALYSIS

A. Story 1: Saya Cantik Nggak Sih?: [7]

Vani does not like herself because according to her, she has a bad physique, big nose and brown skin; whereas in her social circle all of Vani's friends
were infected with the Korean virus. So she also forced herself to like all things Korean, including all the drama series that took time. This she did because she did not want to be isolated when she gathered with her friends and they all discussed all things Korean. In addition to many drama series, Vani is also infected with the Korean version of the beauty standard. So she does everything to look like a Korean girl. She does Korean body care, Korean make up, and even buys clothes with Korean style. Vani has spent a lot of money on all of that. But she still felt dissatisfied with the results. She ventured to her sister Dinda.

Figure 2 Actan scheme of Saya Cantik Nggak Sih?

Dinda advised that the purpose of Vani to do all that was wrong. She must change her mindset; that the main goal of caring for yourself is not physical beauty, but cleanliness and beauty in general. Beauty is not seen from the physical, but from the heart. Beauty is obtained from faith and piety and charity to God Almighty. The most important thing is always grateful because God has created each individual in the best form according to their respective versions.

B. Story 2 Puasa Adiba. [8]

Adiba was promised by her father to go to Bandung if she could fast full during Ramadan because she was in third grade of elementary school already. Adiba is very excited. But in the midst of fasting, she was attacked by thirst and extreme hunger.

Figure 3 Actan scheme of Puasa Adiba

After returning from Aunt Lita's house, she was encouraged to stop buying fried chicken and milkshakes, but she managed to hold back her intentions. Arriving home, Adiba was weak. Mother approached her. Mother advised that fasting was the way God taught Adiba to have a sense of empathy for the poor. Adiba just feels hungry during the month of Ramadan, while the poor are experiencing thirst and hunger almost every day. Hearing this, Adiba’s heart moved. She changed the intention of her fast, which was originally intended to go to Bandung, now the intention of fasting for worship to Allah SWT. She also told her mother to cancel the trip to Bandung and use the money to share iftar for the pedicab drivers and the children at crossroads. She was also willing to add fifty thousand rupiahs from auntie Lita. This makes mother very proud.

C. Story 3 Jelata dan Jelita.[9]

Lola is Editas's friend. Editas has perfect physical, beautiful face, slim body, and white skin. This makes her have many fans. Initially Lola is jealous of Edita. But now it's not. Lola knows who Edita is.

Figure 4 Actan scheme of Jelata dan Jelita

Edita is a simple girl who doesn't do strange treatments (eyebrow embroidery, lip embroidery, botox, facials, peeling). Lola knows Editas beauty just because of ablution. One day Lola was stunned. Edita ventured to her that she wanted to be like Lola, being an ordinary girl without having many fans. According to Edita, being herself makes her suffering. Her beauty made many nosy men bother her.

D. Story 4 Salman vs Ervan. [10]

Mother was worried about Salman, her child. For several days Salman often spent time at home. It's not like Salman always plays outside the house with Ervan. Mother repeatedly tried to interrogate Salman but was unsuccessful. One time mother told Salman to deliver Kolak to Ervan's house but Salman refused. Mother forces Salman. Finally Salman acknowledged what really happened. Salman admitted that he and Ervan were fighting because when playing Ervan cheated.
And now they don't greet each other. Salman had tried to apologize to Ervan but Ervan refused his apology. Mother feels empathy for Salman's situation. Mother loves Salman very much. Because of that, mother looked for ideas to reconcile Salman and Ervan. Mother invited Salman to Ervan's house. Because before Ervan forbade Salman entering the house. But this time the mother believed that Ervan did not dare to refuse the arrival of herself and Salman.

E. Story 5 Artis Instagram. [11]

Adinda wants to be celebrity on Instagram after reading various stories of successful Instagram artists after receiving a lot of endorses. She also wants to raise a lot of money that way. For this purpose, Adinda was much focused. She neglects her obligations; study, pray, social activities with friends. She did this because she imagined that she would succeed after becoming an Instagram artist and receiving many endorsement products so that she would receive a lot of income. Adinda felt her dream was in sight, just a step further to grasp it. Mother admonished Adinda for neglecting worship. Adinda realized she was wrong. She fixes herself. She thinks that being an Instagram artist doesn't matter anymore; it's not the main goal anymore. She wants to improve herself so that she can be a good person in the eyes of God.

F. Story 6 Nayla tidak Jadi ke Jogja. [12]

Nayla won the writing competition at her school. She showed her achievements to mother. Mother offers book prizes. Nayla refused. Nayla wants a holiday gift to Jogja. Mother promised to discuss this with father. Father agreed.

G. Story 7 Dear Diary. [13]

Prita is sad and worried about facing the coming of Eid. She anticipates meeting her relatives. During this time they gave scathing criticism because Prita was not married. They accuse Prita of being more concerned with work than getting married. On the one hand Prita is saddened by all these accusations. But on the other hand, Prita understands that the real reason they raised this discussion is because they are actually love Prita. Prita never showed anger to her relatives who accused their critics of their presence. She prefers to pour her anger and sadness into the diary. Prita is sure of herself, and is sure of God. Prita believes that God has a plan for her, God has prepared a mate for her, and that match will come at the right time.
H. Story 8 the shower of gold[14]

There is a little maiden who is an orphan. She is very poor. She has nothing, not even a room to live in and a bed to lie on. She has only the clothes she wore and bread. On a very cold day she wanders around. Then she met a poor old man who is very hungry.

Figure 9 Actan scheme of the shower of gold

Then the little maiden gives him her bread. When she continues to walk, she meets a little child who is crying because his head is cold. The little maiden gives him her hood. After that she starts to walk again and meets another child who is freezing. The little maiden gives her her cloak. Finally the little maiden enters the forest. There she finds another poor little child who is dying with cold. The little maiden takes off her clothes and covers the child with them. She did all this because she is pious and always believes in God. With nothing left she enters the forest deeper to find leaves to cover her body. Instead she meets an angel who pities her and showers her with gold that makes her rich for the rest of her life.

I. Story 9 the story of the new year[15]

The New Year comes and the weather is very cold. All people look happy despite all the snow. They wear warm clothes and play in the snow. The sparrows do not understand all of these sceneries as they can hardly bear the cold because in this kind of weather they are having difficulty in finding food. One of the sparrows, the old one, tells the other that they should migrate to the country as there will be nicer weather for them.

Figure 10 Actan scheme of the story of the new year

All the younger ones agree and follow the old one as he takes the lead to migrate to the country. To their surprise, the weather in the country is colder than in the city where they lived. The youngest sparrow is very shocked to meet such situation. Then he sees a strange creature, an old man wears clothes made of icicles. The raven explains that he is the personification of the cold winter. He sits at the tree top as he waits for the prince of spring to come. So the sparrows do the same and wait patiently for the spring to come. At length two storks come and on each back sit a lovely child. These two children are the personification of the spring. All sparrows are happy as spring is the New Year for them.

J. Story 10 little sister and brother[16]

A poor gnome is lost because he lost his cap and without it he cannot find his way home. The weather is harsh as there is sleet and the wind blows wildly. The lost gnome tries to look for help. He knocks on doors of rich people but they reject him as he asks for shelter and supper as the poor gnome is very cold and extremely hungry.

Figure 11 Actan scheme of little sister and brother

After some rejections, he feels he lost his hope and want to give up. But he sees a little house afar. He is in doubt as the house looks poor so he thinks that people who live in it will not have anything to share. Despite all that, he still comes to the little house as he cannot bear the cold and hunger. After peeping through the window, he sees that inside there are only a little boy and a little girl, and they have two of everything. He knocks on the door. A little boy opens the door and lets him come in. They share their supper (porridge) with the poor gnome. As they only have two of everything, they let the poor gnome use the plate and the spoon as the little girl uses the iron pot and the cooking spoon. After supper, they share stories. They let the gnome use one of the chairs as little brother can sit on the floor. After sharing their stories, they want to go to bed. As they have only two beds, they ask the poor gnome to sleep in one of them. But the gnome insists that he will sleep on the rug near the fire as he wants to dry his clothes. They agree. Before going to bed, the poor gnome will grant three wishes for the little boy and little girl. They ask for a house on top of the hill, a
tree and a bench under it, and they want to die together. After that they fell asleep. The gnome goes out into the night and calls his troops. They build a house for little boy and little girl, and also a tree and a bench under it. After that all the gnomes disappear. In the morning the little boy and little girl are very happy when they find a house and a tree with a bench under it as they wish for them. They live happily ever after. When they are old, the angel of death comes to visit them and kiss them at the same time and takes them to heaven.

VI. ANALYSIS OF COMPARISON

In accordance with comparative literary theory above, one can compare a literary work with another literary work, or with anything outside of a literary work. In this paper, the researchers compare ten short stories that have similarities in one aspect. The intended aspect is the message the author wants to convey to the reader. Of the ten short stories selected, the authors find that they carry positive and constructive messages.

Analysis of this message was found after the researchers discussed the ten short stories using the theory of Greimas’ structuralism. Using this theory, the researchers compile ten actan schemes for each short story. The ten schemes of this actan have been explained above. We can see that by using this actan scheme, we can easily follow the course of the story. This is helped because the whole story has been divided into six elements for each post: subject, object, helper, opposant, sender, and receiver. From each post, we can see the relationship between the characters depicted in the story. After knowing this, we will easily draw conclusions about what message the author wants to convey to the reader.

Message analysis for each of the ten short stories is illustrated in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Title of the story</th>
<th>Message</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1  | Saya Cantik Nggak Sih? | To love our selves first before we love others  
(Dinda has empathy towards Vina who wants to improve herself but she has the wrong intention. Hence Dinda corrects her) |
| 2  | Puasa | To have empathy and try to put our foot in others’ shoes  
(Adiba has empathy for the poor after she gets advice from mother. Hence she changes her intention for her fast) |
| 3  | Jelata dan Jelita | To love our selves first before we love others  
(Lola has empathy towards Edita because Edita wants to be like her who is an ordinary girl and does not have a lot of fans who bother her) |
| 4  | Salman vs Ervan | To have a big heart and forgive other’s mistakes  
(Mother has empathy for Salman who fights with Ervan. Hence she tries to find a solution so that both of them are getting along well) |
| 5  | Artis Instagram | To have the right priority  
(Mother has empathy for Adinda who wants to be an Instagram celebrity. but she does not want Adinda to take the wrong path. Hence mother asks Adinda to rearrange her priority) |
| 6  | Nayla tidak Jadi ke Jogja | To always put others’ need first rather than one self  
(Nayla has empathy for father because grandpa is sick) |
7. **Dear Diary.**

To have empathy and try to put our foot in others’ shoes.

Prita has empathy for her relatives who always ask about when she will marry. This is done by her relatives because they all love Prita dearly.

---

8. **The shower of gold.**

To always put others’ need first rather than one self.

(the little maiden has the empathy of others in need as she gives her bread to the hungry poor old man, her hood to the crying child, her cloak to the freezing child, her skirt to the dying child)

---

9. **The story of the new year.**

To always be patient as there will always be the sun after the storm.

(The sparrows have empathy to all the creatures in the village who also wait for the spring to come patiently)

---

10. **Little sister and brother.**

To always put others’ need first rather than one self.

(the little sister and brother have empathy for the poor gnome who is hungry and cold and need supper and shelter)

The red thread is empathy. Everyone must have empathy for others. Sometimes we easily judge someone without knowing the person’s background. We can’t do this. We must first find out the background and the reason why the people we judge do something that we consider to be out of the ordinary. In this way, we can minimize negative thoughts towards others. By not having negative thoughts, and having only positive thoughts, the energy that comes out of our personal will also be positive so that many people will like our existence.

With this kind of situation, it is appropriate that the stories chosen as the object of this writing research are categorized as good stories. This is because the message they bring is also good for the benefit of the public. And this also implies that the stories can have a contribution in the world of education where the instructor can use various stories in this paper as a teaching medium to teach good character to students.

**VII. CONCLUSION**

The purpose of this research is to find out the plot of each story that is used as the object of research. This goal is achieved by analyzing the stories using two theories: Greimas structuralism theory and comparative literary theory. With the Greimas structuralism theory we can easily understand the storyline presented by the authors. After we know the storyline of each story, we will find the hidden message that the authors want to convey from the ten stories selected as the object of research. After finding ten messages, the researchers conducted a comparative analysis with comparative literary theory. The researchers find the common thread for all the messages from the ten selected stories, namely about the teachings to always have empathy for others and not easily judge what others do without knowing the person’s background.

**References**


